

**No. MCI-5(3)/2016-Med.Misc./**

**MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA**  
**NEW DELHI**

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2016 at 11:00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

**Present:**

|                           |                                                                                                                                      |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Dr. Jayshree Mehta        | <b>President</b><br>Medical Council of India,<br>Former Professor of Surgery,<br>Govt. Medical College,<br><b>Vadodara, Gujarat.</b> |
| Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham    | Vice-President,<br>Medical Council of India,<br>Former Vice-Chancellor of Dr. M.G.R.<br>Health University,<br><b>Tamil Nadu</b>      |
| Dr. Anil Mahajan          | Professor & HOD, General Medicine,<br>Government Medical College,<br><b>Jammu, J&amp;K.</b>                                          |
| Dr. G.B. Gupta            | Vice-Chancellor,<br>Ayush & Health Sciences University,<br>Raipur, <b>Chhattisgarh</b>                                               |
| Dr. K K Gupta             | Principal,<br>LLRM Medical College Campus, Garh<br>Road,<br><b>Meerut (UP)</b>                                                       |
| Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy | Professor and Head, Department of<br>Community Medicine,<br>MKCG Medical College,<br><b>Berhampur.</b>                               |

Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c

Apologies for absence were received from Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh, Dr. B.S. Aulakh and Dr. Ravindra H.N.

**1. Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2016 – Confirmation of.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2016 has been sent to Ministry of Health, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi. However, the Committee confirmed the minutes of the Executive Committee meetings held on 15.06.2016 and 30.06.2016.

**2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the action has not been taken on the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 23.08.2016 since the minutes have been sent to the Ministry of Health, Nirman

Bhavan, New Delhi on 15.09.2016 and approval of the said minutes is still awaited.

**3. Pending Items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

**4. Approval of the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.

**5. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2016, 4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 & 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August 2016 – reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2016, 4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 & 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2016, 4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 & 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August 2016. and observed as under:-

**A: Meeting dt. 11-12/07/2016**

|    |                                                                                                                      |                                                |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | Investigation of case - RC-0072010A0012, Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical and Health Sciences, Dehradun – reg. | 11 <sup>th</sup> & 12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2016 |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of ethics committee with modification that the period of debarment would commence from date of communication of present order as the operation of original order has been stayed by Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court till the matter is being relooked into.

It was also decided that to avoid such instances in future, Ethics Committee is directed that such cases should not be placed before E.C. in piecemeal fashion and the matter be submitted only after the matter has been finally decided in respect of all parties. In 3 separate decisions total 27 faculty have been considered; Ethics Committee is directed to complete proceedings in respect of the 28<sup>th</sup> faculty – viz., Dr. P.K. Arya.

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 2. | To consider the matter with regard to faculty members of New Medical College at Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh by GyanjeetSewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh – forwarded by Undergraduate Section – reg. | 11 <sup>th</sup> & 12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2016 |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council did not approve the recommendation of ethics committee. The decision of the Executive Committee on the matter for grant of permission was pursuant to statements of the Residents themselves made during assessment & not on the basis of some complaint. There is no bar from Hon'ble High Court to proceed with matter by Ethics Committee. Matter of grant of permission by Central Government and consideration of cases of misconduct are two separate independent matters and there is no bar of jurisdiction on Council to proceed with cases of misconduct.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to refer back the matter to Ethics Committee to relook into the matter and take appropriate decision on merit.

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 3. | To consider the matter with regard to faculty members of Shridevi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Hospital, Tumkur, Karnataka – forwarded by Undergraduate Section – reg. | 11 <sup>th</sup> & 12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2016 |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council did not approve the recommendation of ethics committee.

The Ethics Committee has missed the point that the issue is not proof of allotment of quarters / rooms but that of providing false/misleading/incomplete information with regard to occupancy of hostel rooms. The matter of signatures not matching in cases of 2 Residents has not been examined at all by Ethics Committee.

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to refer back the matter to Ethics Committee directing it to relook at the matter & to take appropriate decision.

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 4. | To consider the matter with regard to faculty members of New Medical College at Banthra, Shahjahanpur, Uttar Pradesh by Varunarjun Trust, Uttar Pradesh – forwarded by Undergraduate Section – reg. | 11 <sup>th</sup> & 12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2016 |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation in respect of Dr. Ravi Kumar and did not approve in respect of others.

The Ethics Committee has missed the point. With regard to Dr. Anup Agrawal, it needs to be examined whether any transfer order & joining report from Medicine to Surgery were attached with his D.F. In respect of Dr. Sarvendra & Dr. Rajneesh, before Ethics Committee they have admitted that they are localites & not staying in the hostel on weekends. Hence admittedly they are not staying in campus throughout. Hence the issue is of providing misleading information to Council in D.F. which needs to be examined.

In view of above, the Executive Committee referred back the matter to Ethics Committee to consider the matter afresh & take appropriate decision on merits.

|    |                                                                                                                                                                |                                                |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 5. | To consider the matter with regard to faculty members of Pacific Institute of Medical Sciences, Udaipur, Rajasthan – forwarded by Undergraduate Section – reg. | 11 <sup>th</sup> & 12 <sup>th</sup> July, 2016 |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council did not approve the recommendation of ethics committee.

The Ethics Committee has completely missed the point. The issue is not whether the faculty are required to stay in quarters or not but the issue is of providing misleading information to Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee directed the Ethics Committee to consider the matter afresh and take appropriate decision on merit.

B; MEETING DT. 19-20/08/2016

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 6. | Report of the Sub-Committee regarding fake faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2015-16 in respect of Dr. Keerti Munday, Sr. Resident / Assistant Professor of Ophthalmology appeared in more than one medical college | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of ethics committee in respect of Dr. Keerti Munday.

The Executive Committee did not approve the above recommendation in respect of Dr. Mahendra Nagar, Dean of Tricentenary Medical College as it has been recorded in the Minutes of Ethics Committee itself that the fact of earlier appointment was not disclosed in D.F. of 2<sup>nd</sup> college. Hence the question of taking any action against Principal of 2<sup>nd</sup> college does not arise.

|    |                                                                                                                      |                                                |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 7. | Appeal dated 05.01.2014 filed by Dr. ArunKapur, Delhi against Order dated 03.12.2013 passed by Delhi Medical Council | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 8. | Report of the Sub-Committee regarding fake faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2015-16 in respect of Dr. VadderaSameeraj, Sr. Resident / Assistant Professor of General Medicine appeared in more than one medical college | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of ethics committee of the Ethics Committee.

The Committee further directed the Undergraduate Section to revise the D.F. for faculty to streamline it so as to include employment as Resident also in its ambit.

|    |                                                                                                                              |                                                |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 9. | Appeal dated 20.06.2016 filed by Sh. Rajender Mishra against order dated 02.06.2016 passed by Madhya Pradesh Medical Council | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                                |                                                |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 10. | Appeal dated 30.06.2016 filed by Sh. Ajay Kumar Thakur against order dated 02.06.2016 passed by Madhya Pradesh Medical Council | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                         |                                                |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
| 11. | Appeal dated 24.06.2016 filed by Sh. Sanjeev Kumar Arora against order dated 23.05.2016 passed by Delhi Medical Council | 4 <sup>th</sup> & 5 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                  |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 12. | Report of the Sub-Committee regarding fake faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2014-15 in respect of Dr. Manish Kumar Singh, Asstt. Professor of General Surgery appeared in more than one medical college | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that Dr. Manish Kumar Singh has categorically stated that he never appeared for assessment at Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences. He has also stated that D.F. submitted by Mayo Institute is fake. He has also stated that he did not sign that D.F. & no salary was received by him from Mayo Institute. These aspects are not considered by Ethics Committee.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to refer the matter back to Ethics Committee to examine this matter considering all aspects (including both D.F.) and take appropriate decision.

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                  |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 13. | Report of the Sub-Committee regarding fake faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2014-15 in respect of Dr. Dharam Singh, Professor of Anatomy appeared in more than one medical college | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation of ethics committee to the extent of removing the name of the then Dean of Maheshwar Medical College from IMR for a period of 3 years.

With regard to action to be taken against institute, the Executive Committee decided to obtain the opinion of Law Officer for invoking Section 8(3)(1)(d).

With regard to action to be taken against assessor, the D.F. of Dr. Dharam Singh submitted by him at Maheshwar Medical College be verified with regard to submission of documents like PAN, residence proof, Degree & Registration Certificates, etc. by UG section & a comprehensive report be placed before Ethics Committee.

The Executive Committee also directed the Ethics Committee that in future whenever any punitive action is recommended, it should be in the name of individual doctor / Dean & not in broad terms like "then Dean of Medical College."

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                  |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 14. | Report of the Sub-Committee regarding fake faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2014-15 in respect of Dr. Arvind Kumar Pankaj, Asstt. Professor of Anatomy appeared in more than one medical college | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation of ethics committee to the extent of removing the name of Dr. Kailash C. Manchanda, the then Dean of Maheshwar Medical College from IMR for a period of 3 years.

With regard to action to be taken against institute, the Executive Committee decided to obtain the opinion of Law Officer for invoking Section 8(3)(1)(d).

With regard to action to be taken against assessor, the D.F. of Dr. Arvind K. Pankaj submitted by him at Chintpurni Medical College be verified with regard to submission of documents like PAN, residence proof, Degree & Registration Certificates, etc. by UG section & a comprehensive report be placed before Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                        |                                                  |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 15. | Appeal dated 07.08.2015 filed by Sh. S. DhanashKoti against order dated 04.07.2015 passed by Karnataka Medical Council | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August, 2016 |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee noted that all are very serious issues of criminal importance requiring consideration by Ethics Committee and also involve criminal liability which cannot be left to the mutual settlement between rival parties.

The Executive Committee directed the Ethics Committee to reopen the case, examine on merit and take appropriate decision accordingly.

|     |                                                                                                                                |                                                 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| 16. | Appeal dated 08.07.2016 filed by Sh. Ravindra Kumar Kewalia against order dated 07.12.2015 passed by Rajasthan Medical Council | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2016 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the of ethics committee recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                             |                                                 |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| 17. | Appeal dated NIL filed by Dr. RamalingappaGanagi against order dated 23.04.2016 passed by Karnataka Pradesh Medical Council | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2016 |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                                |                                                 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| 18. | Appeal dated 13.07.2016 filed by Sh. Ravindra Kumar Kewalia against order dated 07.12.2015 passed by Rajasthan Medical Council | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2016 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

|     |                                                                                                                              |                                                 |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| 19. | Appeal dated 19.06.2016 filed by Sh. Nitin Sood against order dated 14.01.2016 passed by Maharashtra Pradesh Medical Council | 19 <sup>th</sup> & 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2016 |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Ethics Committee.

**6. Minutes of meeting of the TEQ Sub-Committee at its meeting held on 30.06.2016 and 05.08.2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to minutes of meeting of the TEQ Sub-Committee at its meeting held on 30.06.2016 and 05.08.2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the TEQ Sub-Committee meeting held on 30.06.2016 with regard to item Nos. 5,6 & 7. For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under:-

**3. Request for confirmation of eligibility for the post of Assistant Professor in the department of Biochemistry in respect of Dr. Bindu Sharma in a medical college.**

This is a referred back matter.

It was observed by the members of Executive Committee that presently no such orders from the institute showing Dr. Bindu Sharma as Tutor and proper joining report as Tutor have been submitted. In absence of such documents, her request of valid teaching experience for 3 years cannot be considered as the appointment as Asst. Prof. without any experience as Tutor itself is contrary to Regulations.

**4. Confirmation of eligibility for the post of Associate Professor in the department of Anaesthesiology in respect of Dr. Jaideep Singh in a medical college.**

It is not clear from the Minutes of TEQ Sub-Committee whether Dr. Jaideep Singh has 2 research publications eligible in terms of MCI circular to his credit or not. If the promotion is after 21/07/2014, then the incumbent teacher has to meet both the criteria of teaching as well as research publications. This aspect may be reexamined and the matter be resubmitted with appropriate decision thereafter.

Also, the decision of TEQ is based upon letter of MCI issued on 29/02/2012. This letter be examined whether it is as per Regulations or not.

Further, the Committee approved the minutes of the TEQ Sub-Committee meeting held on 05.08.2016 with regard to item Nos. 3,4,5,6,8,10,11,12,13 & 14. For the remaining items, the Executive Committee observed as under:-

**7. Request for confirmation of eligibility for the post of Assistant Professor in department of Orthopaedics in respect of Dr. Vishal Sidhu in Medical College.**

The Executive Committee noted that from the facts narrated in minutes, it is not clear whether Govt. Multi-Specialty Hospital, Sector 16, Chandigarh is a teaching hospital or not. The matter be resubmitted after considering this aspect.

**9. Request for confirmation of eligibility for the post of Professor in the department of Nephrology in respect of Dr. Manjunath S. Shetty in a medical college.**

The item has been deferred by Sub-Committee.

In compliance to Order dated 3.12.2015 W.P.No. 335 of 2012-Swati SinkuKujarVs. State of Chhattisgarh & Ors in the matter of appointment for the post of Asstt.Prof. in the department of Ophthalmology by the Chhattisgarh Public Service Commission, Raipur (C.G.), the following candidates appeared before the TEQ Sub-Committee at its meeting held on 5.8.2016:-

- 1 Sh. Sunil Kumar Kujar on behalf of his wife Dr. Swati Sinku Kujar
- 2 Dr. Chhaya Markam
- 3 Dr. Vijaya Sahu

**ADDITIONAL ITEM**

The Executive Committee of the Council did not approve. MCI Regulations do not prescribe any requirement as Senior Resident for appointment as Assistant Professor. Dr. Swati S. Kujar has obtained M.S. (Ophthalmology). It be verified whether she has worked as Resident during the period of her PG. If so, she is eligible to be appointed as Assistant Professor. Ever since TEQ Regulations have been notified in 1998, period as Resident during PG course has always been considered as valid teaching experience and candidates having recognized M.D./M.S. degrees have been considered to be eligible for appointment as Assistant Professor straightaway.

The Executive Committee decided to refer back to TEQ Sub-Committee with above observation and to resubmit the matter. As this is a Court matter, President be authorized to take a decision as per Regulations.

**Office Note:** It is observed by members of the Executive Committee that in respect of several items, Minutes are submitted for approval even while the matter is pending and the Sub-committee has asked for clarification/documents. The Sub-committee is directed that henceforth in future only those items which have been decided be placed before Executive Committee for approval. When the decision of the sub-committee is to ask for clarification/document, such an item need not be placed before Executive Committee for approval and appropriate action be taken by the Sub-Committee and the TEQ Section accordingly.

**7. Narayana Medical College, Nellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Narayana Medical College, Nellore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (30/31.08.2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 in respect of Narayana Medical College, Nellore under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**8. Rajashree Chhatrapati Shahu Maharaj Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Rajashree Chhatrapati Shahu Maharaj Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 14.39 % on day of assessment.
2. Shortage of Residents is 16.66 % as detailed in the report.
3. Some of Tutors are appointed for a period of 120 days only.
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment is 975 on day of assessment against 1,200 required.
5. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department      | Beds     |           |         |
|---|-----------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                 | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | Tb & Chest      | 15       | NIL       | 15      |
| 2 | Skin & VD       | 15       | NIL       | 15      |
| 3 | General Surgery | 150      | 120       | 30      |
| 4 | Orthopaedics    | 90       | 60        | 30      |
|   | TOTAL           |          |           | 90      |

6. Tb & Chest (15 beds required) and Skin & VD ward (15 beds required) are not available.
7. CT Scan is not available.
8. Nurses' Hostel is not available.
9. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 Lecture Theaters of 180 capacity each are available against requirement of 4 of 180 each. Capacity of Hospital lecture Theater is only 150 against requirement of 200. It is not of Gallery type. Audiovisual aids are not available.
10. Central Library: Available area is 1,600 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Students' Reading room (Outside) is not available.
11. OPD: Registration counters are not computerized. Waiting area is inadequate. Examination rooms are inadequate. Teaching areas are inadequate.
12. Casualty: Ventilator is not available. It is not directly accessible to ambulance.
13. O.T.: Only 8 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 9. Central N<sub>2</sub>O is not available. Resuscitation equipment are not available.
14. RHTC: It is not under full control of Dean. Interns are not staying in hostel.
15. UHC: It is owned by Municipal Corporation & it is not under full control of Dean.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 at Rajashree Chhatrapati Shahu Maharaj Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nasiku/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**9. Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (19/20.08.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Examination Halls: Capacity of 3<sup>rd</sup> Examination Hall is only 200 against 250 required.
2. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is 200 against requirement of 300.
3. Students' Hostels: Study room is not air-conditioned. There is no computer.
4. OPD attendance was 1,123 on day of assessment.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 at Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad under Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences University (Deemed University), Karad u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**10. KAP Viswanathan Government Medical College, Trichy – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to KAP Viswanathan Government Medical College, Trichy – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (30/31.08.2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of KAP Viswanathan Government Medical College, Trichy under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**11. Guntur Medical College, Guntur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Guntur Medical College, Guntur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 24.77 % as detailed in the report.
2. Speech Therapy is not available.
3. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned.
4. Residential Quarters for the faculty & non-teaching staff are not available in the campus.

5. OPD: Size of Teaching areas & Examination rooms is small. There is no separate Injection room. There is a common room for ARV injections which is also used as Injection room for males & females both. ECG room is not available. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are non-functional.
6. Wards: Demonstration rooms are smaller than required. Examination cum Treatment room is not available in some wards.
7. Casualty: Separate Casualty for OG is not available.
8. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
9. Central research laboratory is not available.
10. Anatomy department: MRI & CT films are not available in Museum.
11. Biochemistry department: Capacity of 2 Demonstration rooms out of 3 available is 50 each against requirement of 75.
12. Pathology department: Capacity of 2 Demonstration rooms out of 3 available is 50 & 40 respectively against requirement of 75 each.
13. Microbiology department: Capacity of 1 Demonstration rooms out of 3 available is 50 against requirement of 75.
14. Forensic Medicine department: One Demonstration does not have chairs.
15. Community Medicine department: Only 2 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 3.
16. RHTC: It is under dual control of Director of Health Services & Dean. Cold chain equipment is not available. Residential blocks are not available.
17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 at Guntur Medical College, Guntur under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**12. S.V. Medical College, Tirupati – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.V. Medical College, Tirupati – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) alongwith a representation/letter dated 09.09.2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 14.63 % as detailed in the report.
2. MRD: It is not computerized. ICD X classification of diseases is followed partially.
3. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of all 4 Lecture Theaters available is 200 each against requirement of 240 each. Facility for E class is not available.
4. Wards: Demonstration rooms of capacity 30 are not available in most of the wards. There is no labelling of beds.
5. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned. Capacity of Residents' reading room is 50 against requirement of 100.
6. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 570 against requirement of 750. They are partially furnished. Hygiene is not upto mark. Water supply is not adequate.
7. Residents' Hostel: Available accommodation is 114 against requirement of 400. It is partially furnished. Hygiene is not upto mark. Water supply is not adequate.

8. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 50 against requirement of 92. It is partially furnished. Hygiene is not upto mark. Water supply is not adequate.
9. Residential Quarters: Total 38 quarters are available for teaching & non-teaching staff against requirement of 34 for faculty & 37 for non-teaching staff.
10. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized. Vehicle is not available. Family Welfare services are not provided.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 at S.V. Medical College, Tirupati under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**13. Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29/30.08.2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**14. S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29/30.08.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Dr. Pratap K. Rath, Medical Superintendent has only 08 years of administrative experience before appointment as Medical Superintendent; hence not qualified to hold the post.
2. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5.
3. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in most of the wards. Many wards do not have Examination cum treatment room or Pantry.
4. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
5. Examination Hall: Only 1 Examination Hall of capacity 250 is available against requirement of 3 of capacity 250 each.
6. Lecture Theater: Capacity of 4<sup>th</sup> Lecture Theater is 200 against requirement of 300. Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is 200 against requirement of 300.
7. Central Library: Available area is 950 sq.m. against requirement of 4,000 sq.m. Students' reading room (Outside) is not available. Capacity of Staff Reading room is 20 against 50 required. Only 12 Internet Nodes are available against requirement of 50.

8. Interns' Hostel: Available accommodation is for 174 against requirement of 250.
9. OPD: Waiting area is inadequate. Teaching area is not available in all departments. Sterility clinic is not available in O.G. OPD.
10. MRD: ICD X classification is not used for indexing of diseases.
11. Casualty: CMOs are not available. Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Crash Cart is not available. Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not functional.
12. Demonstration rooms in Anatomy & Microbiology departments are smaller in size than required.
13. Students' laboratories in Anatomy & Biochemistry are smaller in size than required.
14. Website: Information provided is sketchy.
15. RHTC: Interns are not staying in the hostel.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 at S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack under Utkal University, Bhubaneswar, Orissa u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**15. Govt. Medical College, Patiala – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Govt. Medical College, Patiala – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 16.4 % as detailed in the report.
2. Senior Residents are not staying in Residents' hostels.
3. Bed occupancy is 71 % on day of assessment.
4. Nursing staff: 412 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 464.
5. 5 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
6. Examination Halls: Two Examination Halls of capacity 100 each are available against requirement of 3 of 250 capacity each.
7. Lecture Theaters: 2 Lecture Theaters of 160 capacity each & 2 Lecture Theaters of 170 capacity each are available against requirement of 4 of capacity 240 each.
8. Central Library: Available area is 2,400 sq.m. against requirement of 3,200 sq.m. Capacity of Students' reading room (Outside) & Students' reading room (Inside) is 90 & 40 respectively against requirement of 200 each. Capacity of staff reading room is 10 against requirement of 40. Available Journals are 85 against requirement of 100. Only 07 Internet Nodes are available.
9. Intercom is not yet operational.
10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 at Govt. Medical College, Patiala under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**16. Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**17. Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> and 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of Faculty is 20.28 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 43.50 % as detailed in the report.
3. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department               | Beds     |           |         |
|---|--------------------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                          | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | Paediatrics              | 90       | 60        | 30      |
| 2 | Skin & VD                | 15       | 10        | 05      |
| 3 | Orthopaedics             | 90       | 70        | 20      |
| 4 | Obstetrics & Gynaecology | 90       | 72        | 18      |
|   | TOTAL                    |          |           | 73      |

4. Nursing Staff: Only 220 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 372.
5. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 4 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6. Only 4 Static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 5.
6. Residential Quarters: NIL quarters are available in the campus for faculty as well as non-teaching staff.
7. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 458 against requirement of 565.
8. Wards: In Female Medicine ward 2, male patients are also accommodated which is not as per norms. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in the entire hospital. Demonstration rooms are not available in most of the wards. Ancillary facilities are inadequate in most of the wards.
9. Examination Halls: Capacity of 2<sup>nd</sup> Examination Hall is only 70 against requirement of 250.
10. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is only 150 against requirement of 200.
11. Central Library: Reading room for Residents/PGs are not available. Only 10 Internet Nodes are available against requirement of 40. Furniture is inadequate.

12. OPD: Registration counters are partly computerized.
13. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
14. Casualty: Number of CMOs posted is deficient.
15. ICUs: PICU has only 4 beds against requirement of 5.
16. Pharmacology department: Audiovisual aids are not available in Demonstration Room.
17. RHTC: Separate blocks for males/females are under construction. Survey/MCH/Immunization/FP registers are not maintained.
18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 at Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences University, Chhattisgarh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**18. Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 in respect of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry under Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth (Deemed University), Puducherry u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**19. North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (31<sup>st</sup> August & 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 12.57 % as detailed in the report.
2. Nursing staff: Available Nursing staff are 361 against requirement of 372.
3. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Available Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are 174 against requirement of 182.
4. Examination halls: Capacity of 2 Examination Halls is 180 & 150 respectively against requirement of 250 each.
5. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is yet to be furnished. Audiovisual aids are not available.
6. Central Photography Section is not available.
7. Intercom is not available.
8. Wards: Demonstration rooms are smaller than required.
9. MRD: It is partially computerized.

10. Labour Room: Condition is unhygienic.
11. CT Scan is under PPP mode. Details of PPP mode are not provided.
12. Hospital premises, Indoor wards are very dirty & need proper cleaning.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 at North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**20. Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (31<sup>st</sup> August & 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. CT Scan was non functional on day of assessment.
2. Nursing staff: 436 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 464.
3. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: 152 Paramedical & non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 185.
4. MRD: It is partly computerized. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
5. CSSD is not functional.
6. Residential Quarters: Available quarters for faculty are 20 against requirement of 34. NIL quarters are available for non-teaching staff.
7. Examination Halls: Available halls are 2 of 200 capacity each against requirement of 3 of 250 each.
8. Lecture Theaters: Capacity of 1 Lecture Theater is 180 against requirement of 240. One lecture Theater is partial gallery type. Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is 280 against requirement of 300.
9. Central Library: Dimensions of available area is not provided. Staff reading room has capacity of only 08 against requirement of 40. Available Journals are 87 against requirement of 100.
10. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 636 against requirement of 750.
11. Interns' Hostel: Available accommodation is 110 against requirement of 200.
12. Nurses' Hostel: Available accommodation is 60 against requirement of 92.
13. Community Medicine department: 2 Demonstration rooms of capacity 60 & 150 respectively are available against requirement of 3 of capacity 75 each.
14. RHTC: Residential accommodation is under construction.
15. UHC: It is under control of an NGO and not under Dean. Specialists' visits are not organized.
16. Website: Information provided is sketchy. Citizens' charter is not available.
17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 at Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**21. Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Nalgoda – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Nalgoda – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> September & 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Nalgoda under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**22. Vijayanagara Institute of Medical Sciences, Bellary– Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Vijayanagara Institute of Medical Sciences, Bellary– Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Vijayanagara Institute of Medical Sciences, Bellary under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**23. Dr. S.N. Medical College & Associated Group of Hospital, Jodhpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Dr. S.N. Medical College & Associated Group of Hospital, Jodhpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 18.91 % as detailed in the report. Explanation of Dean that in departments of General Medicine & General Surgery, total 16 faculty only are required in each department is not tenable as it is requirement for UG course @ 2 faculty/Unit. As this institute is running PG courses in both these departments, each Unit has to have 3 faculty; hence total 24 faculty in 8 Units are required in both these departments & not 16 as contended by Dean.

2. Dr. P.C. Vyas, Medical Superintendent of M.G. & K.N. Hospital has only 9 y of administrative experience against 10 y required; hence not qualified to hold the post.
3. Administrative experience of Dr. Sunil Garg, Medical Superintendent of M.D.M. Hospital & of Dr. Ranjana Sharma, Medical Superintendent of Ummaid Hospital is not provided; hence it is not possible to verify whether their appointment is as per Regulations or not.
4. OPD: Injection room is common for males & females.
5. MRD: It is computerized but not linked with server room.
6. MRI is under PPP mode.
7. Examination Halls: Only 1 Examination hall of capacity 250 is available against requirement of 3 of capacity 250 each.
8. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned. Staff reading room is not available.
9. Anatomy department: 3 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4. Out of available rooms, 2 have capacity of 65 & 1 has capacity of 35 against requirement of 75 each. Band Saw is not in working order.
10. Physiology department: 3 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4. Audio visual aids are not available.
11. 2 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4 each in Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine departments.
12. Community Medicine department: 3 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4.
13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 at Dr. S.N. Medical College & Associated Group of Hospital, Jodhpur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**24. Madras Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Madras Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165-250 in respect of Madras Medical College, Chennai under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**25. Stanley Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Stanley Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt.

to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 in respect of Stanley Medical College, Chennai under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**26. S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Dr. Man Prakash Sharma, Medical Superintendent has only 4 year of administrative experience against 10 y required; hence not qualified to hold the post.
2. CT Scan & MRI are under PPP mode.
3. Examination Halls: 1 Examination Hall of capacity 330 is available against requirement of 3 of 250 each.
4. Lecture Theaters: Gallery type Lecture Theater is not available in the hospital.
5. Central Library: Capacity of Students' reading room (Outside) & Students' reading room (Inside) is 150 & 200 respectively against requirement of 250 each.
6. Physiology departments: 2 out of 4 Demonstration rooms are smaller in size.
7. 3 Demonstration rooms each are available against requirement of 4 each in Microbiology, Pharmacology departments.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 at S.M.S. Medical College, Jaipur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**27. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at GSL Medical College, Rajamundry.**

Read: the matter with regard to compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at GSL Medical College, Rajahmundry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (02.09.2016) along with previous assessment report (26.04.2016 & 13<sup>th</sup> & 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

**28. Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner– Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner– Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 24.89 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 11.11 % as detailed in the report.
3. Teaching beds are inadequate as under: (P. 25)

| # | Department    | Beds     |           |         |
|---|---------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |               | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | Tb & Chest    | 50       | 40        | 10      |
| 2 | Ophthalmology | 60       | 52        | 08      |
|   | TOTAL         |          |           | 18      |

4. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are in a common room which is not as per norms.
5. 5 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
6. Central Library: Capacity of Students' Reading room (Outside) is 110 against 250 required.
7. Interns' Hostel: Accommodation available is for 150 against requirement of 250.
8. OPD: Injection room is common for males & females. Dressing room is common for males & females.
9. Anatomy department: Capacity of 4<sup>th</sup> Demonstration room is 50 against requirement of 75.
10. Pathology department: Only 2 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4.
11. Pharmacology department: Only 2 Demonstration rooms are available against requirement of 4.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 at Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**29. Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 in respect of Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**30. Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 for the academic session 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 for the academic session 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 12.9 % as detailed in the report.
2. Dr. Aruna Ramaiah, Dean has only 9 y 8 m experience as Professor & Asso. Prof. before appointment as Dean against combined experience of 10 y; hence not qualified to hold the post.
3. Residential quarters for faculty & non-teaching staff are not available within campus.
4. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 at Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**31. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 15.97 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 27.94 % as detailed in the report.
3. Dr. Sowmya Sampath, Medical Superintendent possesses only 8 years' administrative experience against requirement of 10 years; hence not qualified to hold the post.
4. Bed occupancy is 67.51 % on day of assessment.
5. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department       | Beds     |           |         |
|---|------------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                  | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | General Medicine | 120      | 97        | 23      |
| 2 | Paediatrics      | 60       | 43        | 17      |
| 3 | Skin & VD        | 10       | 08        | 02      |
| 4 | Psychiatry       | 10       | 06        | 04      |
| 5 | General Surgery  | 120      | 100       | 20      |
| 6 | Orthopaedics     | 60       | 50        | 10      |
| 7 | ENT              | 10       | 07        | 03      |
|   | TOTAL            |          |           | 79      |

6. ICUs: There is NIL patient in MICU on day of assessment.
7. Casualty: Only 09 beds are available against requirement of 20.
8. Nursing staff: Only 171 Nurses are available against requirement of 246.
9. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 Mobile X-ray machine are available against requirement of 4. Only 2 Static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 5.

10. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
11. Examination Hall: It is under construction.
12. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 Lecture Theaters of capacity 120 each are available against requirement of 4 of 120 capacity each. Hospital Lecture Theater has capacity of 100 against requirement of 150 & is not of gallery type.
13. Central Library: it is partially air-conditioned. It is under construction & approach is difficult. There was water leaking from the roof. Available books are 4,534 against requirement of 5,000. Internet Nodes are not available.
14. Central Photography Section is not available.
15. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is for 272 students against requirement of 375. Hygiene is poor. Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet and Recreation Room are not available. Furnishing is inadequate.
16. Residents' Hostel: It is under construction.
17. Nurses' Hostel: Separate Nurses' Hostel is not available.
18. OPD: Separate Registration Counters for Males/Females are not available. Capacity of teaching areas is inadequate. Injection room is combined for Males/Females. Dressing Room is common for Males/Females. Dark room is not available in Ophthalmology OPD. Child Welfare clinic & Child Rehabilitation clinic are not available in Paediatrics OPD.
19. Speech Therapy is not available.
20. Wards: Distance between two beds is < 1.5 m as required in some wards.
21. Separate O.T. for Orthopaedics is not available.
22. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are not adequate.
23. Anatomy department: There is no seating arrangement in Museum.
24. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available. Specialists' visits are not organized.
25. UHC: It is not under control of Dean. It is located in one room of another 600 bedded hospital. No public health related activities are carried out.
26. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 100 MBBS students at ESIC Medical College, Chennai, Tamilnadu under the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**32. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 22.83 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 22.38 % as detailed in the report.
3. Audiologist post is vacant.
4. Bed occupancy is 68.30 % on the basis of number of beds required at this stage.

5. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department       | Beds     |           |         |
|---|------------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                  | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | General Medicine | 120      | 100       | 20      |
| 2 | Paediatrics      | 60       | 30        | 30      |
| 3 | General Surgery  | 120      | 92        | 28      |
| 4 | Orthopaedics     | 60       | 40        | 20      |
|   | TOTAL            |          |           | 98      |

6. O.T.: Only 6 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 7. General Surgery O.T. is shared with O.G.
7. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is only 232 against requirement of 375.
8. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in SICU on day of assessment.
9. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4.
10. C.T. Scan is outsourced.
11. Nursing staff: Only 175 Nurses are available against 247 required.
12. Central Library: Available books are 4,703 against requirement of 5,000. Available Journals re 40 against requirement of 60.
13. RHTC: It is under control of Health & Family Welfare department of Govt. of W.B. & not under Dean. Residential accommodation is not available.
14. UHC: It is not affiliated to institute. It is not under control of Dean. Paramedical staff is inadequate as detailed in the report.
15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 100 MBBS students at ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**33. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of A.C. Subba Reddy Government Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of A.C. Subba Reddy Government Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> & 31<sup>st</sup> August, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of Teaching faculty is 36.75 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 45.07 % as detailed in report.
3. Dr. Y. Nirmala Devi, Medical Superintendent has only 6 y of administrative experience against requirement of 10 y; hence not qualified to hold the post.
4. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department       | Beds     |           |         |
|---|------------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                  | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | General Medicine | 100      | 68        | 32      |
| 2 | Tb & Chest       | 15       | 10        | 05      |
| 3 | Psychiatry       | 08       | NIL       | 08      |
| 4 | Skin & VD        | 07       | NIL       | 07      |

|   |                 |     |    |    |
|---|-----------------|-----|----|----|
| 5 | General Surgery | 105 | 68 | 37 |
| 6 | Orthopaedics    | 40  | 30 | 10 |
|   | TOTAL           |     |    | 99 |

5. Nursing Staff: Only 112 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 223.
6. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Only 21 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 162.
7. OPD: Waiting area for patients is not adequate. Teaching areas are not available.
8. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
9. In Microbiology laboratory, Culture & Sensitivity tests are not done.
10. Histopathology laboratory has not yet started.
11. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are not available.
12. Wards: Ophthalmology ward is in 5 small rooms which cannot be categorized as wards. Separately designated wards for Psychiatry & Skin & VD are not available.
13. ICUs: ICCU, SICU, NICU are not available.
14. Examination Halls: Both the Examination Halls are not properly furnished. One on I floor is non-functional. In the hall on 4<sup>th</sup> floor, there are only tables but no chairs.
15. MEU: NIL orientation programme has been conducted in 2016.
16. CME: NIL CME programme has been held during the year.
17. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Students' Reading Room (Outside) is not functional. Room for Residents is not available. In the staff reading room, only 6 chairs were kept without any other furniture. Internet is not available. Only 2,594 books are available against 5,000 required.
18. Central Photography Section: Neither Staff nor Equipment are available.
19. Students' Hostels: Study room on ground floor is used as Store room. Visitors' room in Boys' hostel is used as Store room for Building materials.
20. Residents' Hostel: Only 31 rooms are available against requirement of 115. It is poorly furnished. Ancillary facilities like Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not provided.
21. Nurses' Hostel: It is not available inside the campus.
22. MRD: ICD X classification of Diseases is not followed for indexing.
23. Casualty: Ventilator is not available.
24. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 Mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 2. Only 1 Static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 3. CT Scan is single slice against requirement of minimum 16 slice.
25. CSSD is not available.
26. Canteen is not available.
27. Anatomy department: Capacity of Students' Laboratory is only 50. In Museum, MRI & CT films are not available. There is no Catalogue in the museum.
28. Physiology department: In Clinical physiology laboratory, there is NIL Examination Couch. Stools for students are inadequate.
29. Catalogues are not available in Museums of Pathology, Pharmacology & Microbiology department.
30. RHTC: Residential accommodation is under construction.
31. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
32. Information provided on website is sketchy & not updated. Citizens' charter is not available.
33. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at A.C. Subba Reddy Government Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**34. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Shaheed Hasan Khan Mewati Government Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana under Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Shaheed Hasan Khan Mewati Government Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana under Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> & 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2016) along with representation dated 30.08.2016 from Dr. Vikas Yadav, Sr. Resident, Dept. of General Surgery, Shaheed Hasan Khan Mewati Government Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana and letter dated 24.08.2016 from the Director of the College and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 17.94 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 11.94 % as detailed in the report.
3. Bed Occupancy was 43.19 % on day of assessment.
4. Nursing staff: 229 Nursing staff is available against 247 required.
5. ICUs: ABG Analyzer is not available. NIL patient was on Ventilator in ICCU or any ICU on day of assessment.
6. Only 2 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4.
7. Students' Hostels: Study room is not air-conditioned.
8. Residents' Hostel: Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet & Recreation room are not available.
9. OPD: Injection room is common for males & females. Plaster room & Plaster Cutting room are common. X-ray view box is not available in some Examination rooms.
10. UHC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 100 MBBS students at Shaheed Hasan Khan Mewati Government Medical College, Nalhar, Mewat, Haryana under Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**35. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 14.28 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 17.91 % as detailed in the report.
3. OPD attendance on day of assessment is only 205 which is grossly inadequate. OPD Registration Counters are not computerized.
4. Bed Occupancy is only 14.7 % on day of assessment which is grossly inadequate.
5. There were only 2 Major & 4 Minor Operations on day of assessment.
6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
7. Radiodiagnosis department is not functional. There is no equipment. Radiological investigation workload is NIL.
8. Laboratory investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
9. Wards: Ancillary facilities like Examination cum Treatment room, Pantry, Store Room, Duty room, Demonstration room are inadequate. Only space is provided & they are not fully furnished.
10. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases for indexing is followed partially.
11. Casualty: CMO is not available. Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Crash Cart, Disaster Trolley, Ventilator are not available.
12. O.T.s: Only 1 out of 7 O.T.s is functional. Rest are not functional.
13. ICUs: Equipment are inadequate. Air-conditioning is not functional. There was only 1 patient in PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
14. Labour Room: Equipment are inadequate.
15. Blood Bank: it is not available.
16. CSSD: It is not available.
17. Intercom: It is not available.
18. Central Laundry is not available.
19. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are inadequate.
20. Central Library: Air-conditioning is not functional. Students' reading room (inside) is not furnished.
21. Nursing & Paramedical staff are inadequate.
22. Website: Toll free number to report ragging is not available.
23. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 100 MBBS students at ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**36. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of Late Shri Lakhiram Agarwal Memorial Government Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of Late Shri Lakhiram Agarwal Memorial Government Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>&8<sup>th</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 25 % as detailed on report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 29.6 % as detailed in the report.
3. Nursing Staff: 202 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 262.
4. There were only 5 Major & 7 Minor Operations for the whole hospital on the day of assessment.
5. Only 2 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4.
6. Available CT Scan is only 1 slice against requirement of 16 slice.
7. Examination Hall: Capacity of Examination Hall is 100 against requirement of 250.
8. Lecture Theaters: Hospital Lecture Theater is not furnished. Audiovisual aids are not available.
9. Residents' Hostel: It is not furnished & not functional.
10. Nurses' Hostel: It is not functional.
11. RHTC: Hostel is not available.
12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 50 MBBS students at Late Shri Lakhiram Agarwal Memorial Government Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**37. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Nizamabad, Telangana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Nizamabad, Telangana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> & 23<sup>rd</sup> September, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 20.95 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 20.89 % as detailed in the report.
3. Majority of departments did not submit signed attendance sheets before 2 p.m. despite repeated requests and instructions. Many faculty reported after staff verification was over.
4. Teaching Beds are inadequate as under:

| # | Department      | Beds     |           |         |
|---|-----------------|----------|-----------|---------|
|   |                 | Required | Available | Deficit |
| 1 | Paediatrics     | 60       | 30        | 30      |
| 2 | General Surgery | 120      | 60        | 60      |
|   | TOTAL           |          |           | 90      |

5. OPD attendance is 739 on day of assessment against requirement of 800.
6. Bed Occupancy is only 57 % on day of assessment.
7. OPD: Paediatrics&Orthopaedics departments do not have 4 examination rooms as required. Injection rooms for male/female are not available in General Medicine OPD. Dressing rooms for male/female are not available in General Surgery OPD. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are not available in Orthopaedics OPD. Dark room & Dressing room are not available in Ophthalmology OPD. Child

Welfare clinic & Child Rehabilitation clinic are not available in Paediatrics OPD. Sterility clinic & Family Welfare clinic are not available in O.G. OPD. Teaching areas are not available in some OPDs.

8. Audiometry room is not sound proof. Speech Therapy is not available.
9. Wards: There are no patients in Psychiatry or Skin & VD ward. Demonstration room is common for Psychiatry & Skin & VD departments.
10. Examination Hall: It is under construction.
11. Lecture Theaters: Only 2 Lecture Theaters are available against requirement of 4. Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is 120 against requirement of 150. It is not of Gallery type.
12. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned. Available books are only 4,023 against requirement of 5,000. 21 Journals are available against requirement of 60. Available Internet Nodes are 17 against requirement of 25.
13. Central Photography Section is not available.
14. Students' Hostels: Waiting room, T.V. cum Recreation room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet are not available.
15. Nurses' Hostel: It is not available.
16. Residential Quarters: Quarters for Non-teaching staff are not available in the campus.
17. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
18. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Ventilator & Defibrillator are not available.
19. Central Clinical Laboratory: Microbiology section is not available.
20. ICUs: ICCU & SICU are not available. ABG Analyzer is not available.
21. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 Mobile X-ray is available against requirement of 4. 4 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. 2 USG machines are available against requirement of 3.
22. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
23. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are inadequate.
24. Nursing staff: Only 104 Nursing staff are available against requirement of 247.
25. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: 139 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 179.
26. Medical Education Unit: NIL programmes & workshops have been conducted during the year.
27. College Council: NIL meeting has been held during the year.
28. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 100 MBBS students at Govt. Medical College, Nizamabad, Telangana under Kaloji Narayana Rao University of Health Sciences Telangana, Warangal/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-2018.

**38. Approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 22.08.2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 22.08.2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 22.08.2016 and observed as under:-

**Deferred Items of Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 30.06.2016.**

3. **Admission to MBBS at Maharishi Markandeshwar Medical College & Hospital, Kumarhati, Solan (HP) – regarding.**

Noted

35. **Admission of MBBS Student at Azeezia Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Kollam for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved recommendation of the Monitoring Sub-Committee.

1. **Admission of MBBS Student Murshidabad Medical College & Hospital, Murshidabad for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved recommendation of the Monitoring Sub-Committee.

2. **Admission of MBBS Student Calcutta National Medical College, Kolkata for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that this is a Govt. college so no separate order from Govt. is required. As other admissions are found to be in order, no further action is required.

3. **Admission of MBBS Student KPC Medical College, Jadavpur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation of the Monitoring Sub-Committee.

4. **Admission of MBBS student at Dr. P S I Medical College, Chinoutpalli for the Academic Year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

5. **Admission of MBBS student at P E S Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Kuppam for the Academic Year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to

Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

6. **Admission of MBBS student at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram for the Academic Year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

7. **Admission of MBBS Student at Narayana Medical College, Nellore for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

8. **Admission of MBBS Student at Maharajah Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

9. **Admission of MBBS Student at Katuri Medical College & Hospital, Guntur for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to

Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

10. **Admission of MBBS Student at Mediciti Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

11. **Admission of MBBS Student Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that the submission by the college that 25% management quota seats are in Category C wherein there is no requirement of an entrance test is untenable. The entrance test requirement is waived off only for NRI students i.e. 15% seats. The admission of this/these candidate/s is/are not as per the MCI regulations and an explanation be sought as to why they should not be discharged.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the above students. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

12. **Admission of MBBS Student at Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management, Vishakhapatnam for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has reiterated its earlier decision that the college has not followed the GMER of the MCI by admitting students who have secured less than 50% marks in the entrance test. The explanation given by the college that they have considered both the percentage of marks in the qualifying examination and the entrance/competitive examination is not acceptable.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the students who have secured < 50 % marks in the entrance examination. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.,; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

13. **Admission of MBBS Student Guntur Medical College, Guntur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation and decided that no further action is required.

14. **Admissions of MBBS Student at Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar for the Academic Year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendation and decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of the students

who have secured < 50 % marks in the entrance examination. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of A.P. on MCI.

15. **Admissions of MBBS Student at Kamineni Academy of Medical Sciences & Research Center, Hyderabad for the Academic Year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

16. **Admission of MBBS Student at Pt. B D Sharma Postgraduate Institute of Medical Sciences, Rohtak for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

17. **Admission of MBBS Student Shaheed Hasan Khan Mewati Government Medical College, Nalhar, Haryana for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

18. **Admission of MBBS Student Maharaja Agrasen Medical College, Agroha for Academic year 2015-16 - Regarding**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

19. **Admission of MBBS Student BPS Government Medical College for Women, Sonapat for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

20. **Admission of MBBS Student Government Medical College, Chandigarh for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that Total NRI seats are well under 15 %. and therefore that no further action is required.

21. **Admission of MBBS student at GMERS Medical College, Nanakwada, Valsad, Gujarat for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that discharge notice be issued. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Gujarat; DME, Gujarat; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of Gujarat on MCI.

22. **Admission of MBBS student at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad for the Academic Year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

23. **Admission of MBBS student at GMERS Medical College, Sola, Ahmedabad for the Academic Year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

24. **Admission of MBBS Student at CU Shah Medical College, Surendra Nagar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

25. **Admission of MBBS Student at Medical College, Rajkot for Academic year 2015-16 –Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

26. **Admission of MBBS Student at MP Shah Medical College, Jamnagar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding;**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

27. **Admission of MBBS Student at Medical College, Baroda for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

28. **Admission of MBBS Student at RUHS College of Medical Sciences, Jaipur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

29. **Admission of MBBS Student at Sardar Patel Medical College, Bikaner for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

30. **Admissions of MBBS Student at SMS Medical College, Jaipur for the Academic Year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the recommendations.

31. **Admission of MBBS Student Government Medical College, Kota for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

32. **Admission of MBBS Student National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that since it is a Deemed University, the college can admit students through their own entrance examination. No further action is required.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred the matter back to Monitoring Committee as it is not a Deemed University but a University established by State Legislature. Hence the admissions be scrutinized to see whether they are as per provisions of University Act or not. Matter be resubmitted thereafter.

33. **Admission of MBBS Student GSVM Medical College, Kanpur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

34. **Admission of MBBS Student at King George Medical University, Lucknow for Academic year 2015-16 - Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

35. **Admission of MBBS Student at LLRM Medical College, Meerut for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

36. **Admission of MBBS Student at B J Government Medical College, Pune for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

37. **Admission of MBBS Student at Armed Forces Medical College, Pune for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

38. **Admission of MBBS Student at Padmashree Dr. D Y Patil Medical College, Pimpri, Pune for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

39. **Admission of MBBS Student Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Amritsar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

40. **Admission of MBBS Student at Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences, Jalandhar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that discharge notice be issued. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Punjab; DME, Punjab; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of Punjab on MCI.

41. **Admission of MBBS Student at at Adesh Institute of Medical Science & Research, Bhatinda for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

42. **Admission of MBBS Student at Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

43. **Admission of MBBS Student at SCB Medical College, Cuttack for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

44. **Admission of MBBS Student Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Bhubaneswar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

45. **Admission of MBBS students at Darbhanga Medical College, Lehriasarai, Bihar for the Academic Year 2014-15 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the recommendations.

46. **Admission of MBBS Student at Katihar Medical College, Katihar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee noted that no evidence of Shri Vikash Gaurav being NRI or fulfilling criteria of NRI has been provided by institute till date and decided that discharge notice be issued. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Bihar; DME, Bihar; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of Bihar on MCI.

47. **Admission of MBBS Student at M G M Medical College, Jamshedpur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

48. **Admission of MBBS Student at Chandulal Chandrakar Memorial Medical College, Durg for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that copy of the communication be also sent to Secretary (ME), Chhattisgarh; DME, Chhattisgarh; affiliating University & representative of Chhattisgarh on MCI.

49. **Admission of MBBS student at Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur, Chhattisgarh for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Req.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that enough opportunities have been given to institute and decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of these 2 candidates. College be directed to submit compliance in 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Chhattisgarh; DME, Chhattisgarh; affiliating University; State Medical Council and representative of Chhattisgarh on MCI.

50. **Admissions for MBBS course by Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry in blatant violation of orders of the Supreme Court of India – regarding.**

Item has been deferred by Monitoring Committee.

51. **Admission of MBBS Student Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Pondicherry for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*Item has been deferred by Monitoring Committee.*

52. **Admission of MBBS Student at Agartala Government Medical College, Agartala for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

53. **Admission of MBBS Student Tripura Medical College & Dr. B R A M Teaching Hospital, Agartala for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*Monitoring Committee has recommended that a letter may be written to the DME to clarify the method of admission is whether through the test conducted by the college itself or by the Govt. of Tripura and whether the college has been authorize to conduct its own test as it is not a deemed university. Also, whether there is any consensual agreement for seat sharing with the Govt. or not.*

*The Executive Committee noted the above recommendations and decided that the matter be resubmitted after obtaining above clarification.*

54. **Admission of MBBS Student Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

55. **Admission of MBBS Student Mahatma Gandhi Missions Medical College, Navi Mumbai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

56. **Admission of MBBS Student Mahatma Gandhi Missions Medical College, Aurangabad for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

57. **Admission of MBBS Student Rural Medical College, Loni for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

58. **Admission of MBBS Student Dr. D Y Patil Medical College, Kolhapur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.*

59. **Admission of MBBS Student Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Sawangi, Wardha for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.*

60. **Admission of MBBS Student Maharashtra Institute of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon, Pune for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

61. **Admission of MBBS Student Ashwini Rural Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Solapur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

62. **Admission of MBBS Student M S Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

63. **Admission of MBBS Student Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

64. **Admission of MBBS Student at Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

65. **Admission of MBBS Student Kilpauk Medical College, Chennai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

66. **Admission of MBBS Student Christian Medical College, Ludhiana for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

67. **Admission of MBBS Student Surat Municipal Institute of Medical Education & Research, Surat for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

68. **Admission of MBBS Student Shree Guru Gobind Singh Tricentenary Medical College, Gurgaon for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

69. **Admission of MBBS Student at Heritage Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

70. **Admission of MBBS Student Rangaraya Medical College, Kakinada for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that there are 2 candidates who are admitted under Physically handicapped quota & Ex-army quota; it is not clear who is admitted under which quota and decided that clarification be obtained from the Dean. There is no relaxation of marks for Ex-army quota. As marks of both these candidates are less than required marks, Discharge notice be issued in respect of candidate admitted under Ex-army quota. As regards candidate admitted under PH quota, Discharge notice be issued if upon clarification it is observed that he has less than required marks. College be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council & representative of A.P. on MCI.

71. **Admission of MBBS Student Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

72. **Admission of MBBS Student Geetanjali Medical College & Hospital, Udaipur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

73. **Admission of MBBS Student at Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical & Health Sciences, Dehradun, Uttarakhand for the Academic Year 2014-15 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that "It is astonishing that the DMER, Uttarakhand in one breathe saying that they are searching for MoU at Health Department as well as the Medical Education Section, Govt. of Uttarakhand and in the same breathe they have said they have not found. In the same breathe they are saying that there were no MoU signed between State Government and the college authorities. The Executive Committee of the Council has already viewed it very seriously and the Council is not satisfied with the reply that they are in the process of making the new MoU on the priority basis. It is therefore, recommended that the admissions be made in the following ratio State Government quota 50%; Management Quota 35% and NRI seats 15% till the MoU is signed."

The Executive Committee of the Council decided the entire matter be brought to the attention of Government of Uttarkhand through Secretary (Health & Medical Education).

74. **Excess Admission of 1<sup>st</sup> Year MBBS students at Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly for the Academic Year 2013-14 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that "Despite repeated letters by the MCI, the Principal, Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly has not submitted the required information. Therefore, a letter be written to the Affiliating University and Director General Medical Education, Govt. of U.P. that this college should not be allowed to admit students to the MBBS Course in 2016-17 till it furnishes the desired information."

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that the opinion of Law Officer be obtained in the matter.

75. **Admission of MBBS Student at T. D. Medical College, Allappuzha, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that "The Monitoring Sub Committee is of the opinion that a letter be written to the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India regarding the criteria followed for nominating Central Pool candidates to various medical colleges for deciding upon the instant case." No other details are furnished in the minutes.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred the matter back to resubmit with full details.

76. **Admission of MBBS Student at Dr. Panjabrao Alias Bhausaheb Deshmukh Memorial Medical college, Amravati, Maharashtra for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations.

77. **Admission of 1st year MBBS students from the academic year 2007-08, 2008-09, 2013-14 and 2014-15 at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Jaipur.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that there is a gross discrepancy between the questions asked by the MCI and the reply provided by the college authorities. They repeatedly are not informing that the details of the students who have studied at NIMS according to the Income Tax department. They have stated that the college has approached the Court but have not provided any details of the Court case. Therefore, in the light of the observations of the Monitoring Committee as well as the Executive Committee following the unsatisfactory reply of the show cause notice, the MCI should initiate process of withdrawal of recognition.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and directed that admissions of students who have not yet appeared at III M.B;B.S. examination be declared null & discharge notices issued. College be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Rajasthan; DME, Rajasthan; affiliating University; State Medical Council, representative of Rajasthan on MCI & Council Advocate at Jaipur.

78. **Admission of 1st year MBBS students at Tirunelveli Medical College, Tirunelveli for the Academic Year 2015-16 - regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations and decided that no further action is required.

79. **Admission of 1st year MBBS students at Fathima Instt. Of Medical Sciences, Kadapa (A.P.) for the Academic Year 2015-16 - regarding.**

Monitoring Committee has observed that 50 candidates have 0% marks in common entrance examination. Despite repeated letters by the MCI, the college authorities have not submitted the required information. Therefore, a letter be written to the Affiliating University and Director General Medical Education, Govt. of A.P. that this college should not be allowed to admit students to the MBBS Course in 2016-17 till it furnishes the desired information.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of 50 candidates whose marks at entrance examination are not shown. College be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), A.P.; DME, A.P.; affiliating University; State Medical Council & representative of A.P. on MCI.

80. **Passing on information in respect of M/s DevarajUrs Educational Trust for Backward Classes - regarding.**

*Monitoring Committee has found that illegality has been committed in the process of admissions and they should be declared null and void. Furthermore, the Medical Council of India should initiate the process of de-recognition of the college in view of the fact that the college has charged capitation fees from the students admitted which is not legally permissible and is in violation of the MCI Act.*

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and decided that discharge notice be issued in respect of those candidates who are found to have committed irregularities. College be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Karnataka; DME, Karnataka; affiliating University; State Medical Council & representative of Karnataka on MCI.*

81. **Passing on information in respect of M/s Moogambigai Educational and Charitable Trust (MCET) - regarding.**

*Monitoring Committee has found that illegality has been committed in the process of admissions and they should be declared null and void. Furthermore, the Medical Council of India should initiate the process of de-recognition of the college in view of the fact that the college has charged capitation fees from the students admitted which is not legally permissible and is in violation of the MCI Act.*

*The Executive Committee of the Council approved the above recommendations and decided that Discharge notice be issued in respect of those candidates who are found to have committed irregularities. College be asked to submit compliance within 2 weeks. Copy of Discharge notice be also sent to Secretary (ME), Karnataka; DME, Karnataka; affiliating University; State Medical Council & representative of Karnataka on MCI.*

39. **Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University in respect of students being trained at Academy of Medical Sciences, Kannur.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University in respect of students being trained at Academy of Medical Sciences, Kannur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the inspection report (27<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. 3 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5.
2. Wards: Nursing station is in corridor.
3. MRD: It is manual.
4. Lecture Theaters: Except 1, all are non-gallery type. Hospital lecture theater is not available.
5. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Capacity of Students' sitting room (Outside) & Students' seating room (Inside) is 40 & 96 respectively against requirement of 100 each.
6. Students' & Interns' Hostels: Study room is not A.C. Ancillary facilities are partial.
7. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: NIL meeting has been held till date.
8. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are inadequate.
9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University in respect of students being trained at Academy of Medical Sciences, Kannur and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance of rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month.

**40. Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Jawaharlal Nehru Institute of Medical Sciences, Porompet, Imphal, Manipur under Manipur University u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Jawaharlal Nehru Institute of Medical Sciences, Porompet, Imphal, Manipur under Manipur University u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Assessment report (31<sup>st</sup> August, 2016 & 1<sup>st</sup> Sept., 2016) and decided that the Council should process the applications for starting of postgraduate courses and take further necessary action.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**41. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (26<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) along with the previous assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> & 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and decided to revoke the decision of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 taken at its meeting held on 13.05.2016.

The Executive Committee further recommended that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred Fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

**42. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut in respect of students being trained at Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.**

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut in respect of students being trained at Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following opinion of Law Officer:

*"The file of UG Section of Santosh Medical College has been referred for my opinion as regards change of affiliation of the University from Ch. Charan Singh Medical University, Meerut to Santosh University in respect of MBBS students being training at Santosh Medical College & Hospital, Ghaziabad. This matter was considered by the Board of Governors in the meeting held on 24.05.2011 and from the decision that is recorded on pre-page note, it appears that approval of the Board of Governors had been conveyed to the Central Government of the Board of Governors had been conveyed to the Central Govt. of recognition against the increased intake from 100 to 150 MBBS seats annually and for PG courses.*

*The request now that has been made is for continuance of recognition, the degree may be considered under Santosh University not under the Ch. Charan Singh University. Since, the change of affiliation of the University is made on the request of the college and such change of University has already been effected in respect of PG courses and MBBS against the increased intake, therefore, the request of the college that the degree for COR may be considered under Santosh University, Ghaziabad and not Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut appears to me, to be appropriate. Necessary corrections in the records would ensure that the students who pass out are able to get their degree obtained from Santosh University registered with the concerned State Medical Council."*

**43. Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka for the academic year 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Assessment report (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> September, 2016) of Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 55.22 % as detailed in report.
2. Workload of USG is NIL on day of assessment.
3. Workload of Histopathology is only 06 & that of Cytology is only 04 on day of assessment.
4. MRD: It is partially computerized.

5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant one month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**44. Joint Surprise Check by Central Bureau of Investigation, Bangaluru.**

Read: the matter with regard to Joint Surprise Check by Central Bureau of Investigation, Bangaluru.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the report of JSC received from Head of Branch, CBI, ACB, Bangalore and observed that no specific details are given in the report. Hence the Committee decided to await further outcome from CBI.

**45. Amendment of Clause 11.1(a) of Postgraduate Medical Education, 2000 with regard Postgraduate teacher in broad specialty and super specialty.**

Read: the matter with regard to amendment of Clause 11.1(a) of Postgraduate Medical Education, 2000 with regard Postgraduate teacher in broad specialty and super specialty.

The Executive Committee of the Council deliberated the matter and it was decided to reiterate the decision of Executive Committee dt. 28/04/2016 which reads as under:

*"The members of the Executive Committee decided that Clause 11.1 (a) of PG Medical Education Regulations with regard to PG teacher in Broad & Super specialties be amended as under:-*

*Professor / Associate Professor / Assistant Professor with 5 years of experience as Asst. Prof. shall be considered as PG teacher."*

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

**46. Extension of engagement of Sh. A.S. Dagar as Consultant (Admn.).**

Read: the matter with regard to extension of engagement of Sh. A.S. Dagar as Consultant (Admn.).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Sh. A.S. Dagar as Consultant (Admn.) for a further period of one year. He may be given additional charge of Monitoring Section.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**47. Extension of engagement of Dr. Chandana Das as Consultant.**

Read: the matter with regard to extension of engagement of Dr. Chandana Das as Consultant.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. Chandana Das as Consultant for a further period of one year.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**48. Engagement of personnel/assistants by Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee(OC).**

Read: the matter with regard to engagement of personnel/assistants by Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee(OC).

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that Sh. P. Seshkumar, Secretary to OC, vide e-mail dated 30.09.2016, has stated as under:-

*"I am directed to convey the approval of OC to the engagement of the following personnel to assist the office of OC:-*

1. *Shri Rohit Kumar Rathore, S/o, Mr. Dinesh Rathore, House No.77, Sector,6 R.K. Puram, New Delhi 110022 (to work as EDP Assistant to Secretary) with effect from 06 September, 2016 at a Gross Monthly Remuneration of Rs.25,000/- per month to be paid by MCI, for a period of 6 months or further orders whichever is earlier, as decided by OC.*
2. *Shri Lokesh Bisht, S/o Mr. Pratap Singh Bisht, E-2, A-49, N.I.H.F.W. Campus, Munirka, New Delhi 110067 (to work as Office Assistant) with effect from 27 September, 2016 at a Gross Monthly Remuneration of Rs.25,000/- per month to be paid by MCI, for a period of 6 months or further orders whichever is earlier, as decided by OC.*
3. *Shri Haivender Kumar, S/o Mr. Bhudev Prasad Verma, POP Colony, Tilpat Faridabad, 121003 (to work as Office Assistant cum Receptionist) with effect from 29 September, 2016 at a Gross Monthly Remuneration of Rs.25,000/- per month to be paid by MCI, for a period of 6 months or further orders whichever is earlier, as decided by OC."*

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain details of Bio data, RR of posts, copy of advertisement, details of total no. of applicants, date of interview, composition of Selection Committee and selection proceedings from Secretary, Oversight Committee. Upon receipt of the same, the matter be placed before Executive Committee for consideration.

**49. Closure of Probation period of Sh. Shikhar Ranjan, Law Officer.**

Read: the matter with regard to closure of probation period of Shri Shikhar Ranjan, Law Officer.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to confirm the probation period of Shri Shikhar Ranjan, Law Officer.

*The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.*

**50. Registration of criminal case against i) Dr. Avinash Kumar Gupta ii) Dr. Prashant Mishra and iii) Dr. Ashish Verma for impersonation and using illegal means in FMG Screening Examination conducted by National Board of Examination, New Delhi on 29.09.2013 for practicing as doctor in India.**

Read: the matter with regard to Registration of criminal case against i) Dr. Avinash Kumar Gupta ii) Dr. Prashant Mishra and iii) Dr. Ashish Verma for

impersonation and using illegal means in FMG Screening Examination conducted by National Board of Examination, New Delhi on 29.09.2013 for practicing as doctor in India.

The Executive Committee of the Council after detailed deliberations on the issue decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee of the Council.

**Dr. Reena Nayyar recused herself from the meeting.**

**51. Review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s.) by Review Committee held on 29.09.2016 at 10.30 a.m.**

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s.) by Review Committee held on 29.09.2016 at 10.30 a.m.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 29.09.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 10/10/2016.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**Dr. Reena Nayyar rejoined the meeting**

**52. International Association of Medical Regulatory Authorities (IAMRA)-Conference on “Medical Regulation – Making a Difference” from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.**

Read: the report of the participation at International Association of Medical Regulatory Authorities (IAMRA)-Conference on “Medical Regulation – Making a Difference” from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the report of the participation at International Association of Medical Regulatory Authorities (IAMRA) -Conference on “Medical Regulation – Making a Difference” from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

**53. Guidelines for assessment/inspection of medical colleges to be conducted (i) after 30<sup>th</sup> Sept.2016 in terms of conditional approval accorded by Oversight Committee for 2016-17 UG/SS courses and (ii) for assessments for 2017-18 for all courses.**

Read: letter dated 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2016 received from the Secretary, Oversight Committee with regard to Guidelines for assessment/inspection of medical colleges to be conducted (i) after 30<sup>th</sup> Sept.2016 in terms of conditional approval accorded by Oversight Committee for 2016-17 UG/SS courses and (ii) for assessments for 2017-18 for all courses.

The Executive Committee noted that vide letter dated 04.10.2016 & 07.10.2016 following communications were made to the Oversight Committee:

**A. Communication dated 04.10.2016**

*“Ref: Your Communication dated 23.09.2016 received by the Council on 24.09.2016.*

- 1). *I am directed to state that the Council is in receipt of the abovementioned communication dated 23.09.2016, whereby, the Oversight Committee has laid down the manner in which the assessment is to be carried out by the assessors and certain guidelines for selecting assessors for the purposes of conducting physical inspection of the medical college.*
- 2). *The Oversight Committee in its communication dated 23.09.2016 (in paragraph 2 at page 2) have referred to several letters addressed by the Oversight Committee to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare conveying their approval / disapproval of the schemes submitted by various medical colleges throughout the Country for the academic year 2016-17. It is pertinent to mention that the aforesaid communications have not been forwarded to the Council hence, the Council is not aware as to which medical colleges have been approved / disapproved by the Oversight Committee for the academic year 2016-17 alongwith the basis and material for approving/ disapproving the schemes of the medical colleges. In absence of there being any clarity on the said issue, it would be very difficult for the Council to objectively assess the medical colleges and place before the Executive Committee of the Council as also the Oversight Committee the true and correct picture of the actual teaching, infrastructure, clinical and other physical facilities available in the medical colleges.*
- 3). *It is important to place before the Oversight Committee certain relevant facts relating to the MCI assessment which would demonstrate that there is complete transparency and fairness in the system of selection of the assessors by the Council, actual physical assessment conducted by the MCI assessors, preparation of assessment reports and the recommendations forwarded by the Council to the Central Government.*

**I. Brief History and the objective behind carrying out physical assessment**

- 4). *Under the IMC Act, 1956 the Council is entrusted with the responsibility of prescribing, regulating and improving the standards of medical education throughout the Country. The Union Government, keeping in mind the afore-said objective, brought in an amendment to the Indian Medical Council Act in the year 1992 by inserting Sections 10A, 10B and 10C and also inserting corresponding provisions under Section 33 of the same Act with regard to framing of regulations. The said amendment became necessary as it was felt that colleges were being established indiscriminately in the States without any check and as such the Medical Council of India was being consulted only at the stage of grant of recognition, that is, after the college had completed five years of its courses and the first year student appeared in the final MBBS examination conducted by the concerned University where the college had been affiliated.*
- 5). *It is relevant to note that prior to 1992 the Council had no say in the matter of establishment of the medical college or even with regard to the facilities that a medical college was required to provide before the start of the college and for the augmentation of facilities required over the period of five years after the establishment of the medical college. Consequently, a large number of sub-standard colleges with no proper teaching, clinical, infrastructure and other physical facilities had come up in the Country and an urgent need was felt to empower the Council with sufficient statutory power to regulate the establishment of medical colleges in the Country and to ensure that such colleges right from the inception had the requisite infrastructures and other facilities to ensure that the student passing out of such colleges were properly trained. Pursuant to the above-mentioned amendments made in the Indian Medical Council Act, the Council came out with a large number of Regulations with regard to grant of permission / recognition to medical colleges in the country and it became mandatory from the said year for every college to apply for permission from the MCI /*

Central Government before the establishment or before the increase of seats or before starting any higher course of study and training.

- 6). It is relevant to point out that the intake of medicine course is dependent directly upon the physical facilities available, particularly in respect of teaching faculty, clinical material and other infrastructural and other facilities available in the department, besides the existence of these facilities in commensurate with the annual intake capacity of the medical college for MBBS course.
- 7). It is important to place before the Oversight Committee that it has been the experience of the Council over the past years that the private medical colleges have resorted to unfair practices by making false / incorrect claims in relation to the teaching, clinical, infrastructure and other physical facilities available in the respective medical colleges. The Council has noticed during the inspection carried out by the assessors that private medical colleges have made false / incorrect claim as also declaration with respect to the teaching, clinical, infrastructure and other physical facilities in order to procure permission / renewal of permission. Further, it has been observed by the Council that the private medical colleges have gone to the extent of deliberately employing fake patients, fake faculty etc. only for the purposes of MCI assessment. This has been done with a view to deceive the assessors into believing that the medical colleges possess the prescribed teaching, clinical, infrastructure and other physical facilities, whereas, the same is not the case in reality.
- 8). To curb the mischief played by the private medical college the Council has been making continuous efforts by amending Regulations from time to time as also introducing new systems in place. Accordingly, the Council has been evolving procedures which would ensure that the deficient medical colleges are not granted permission / renewal of permission in the interest of students undergoing medicine courses. For instance in order to curb the menace of fake faculty and submission of fake Declaration Forms the Council has introduced a system, whereby, every Declaration Forms submitted by the faculty of the medical college contains an undertaking from the Principal / Director of the College or Institution to the effect that the Principal / Director has personally verified the relevant certificates of the medical teacher employed by them as also the medical teacher is actually working with that college/institution.
- 9). In order to deter the medical colleges from flouting the norms prescribed by the Council, the Council has also introduced provisions such as debarring / derecognizing the colleges which fail to provide the prescribed teaching, clinical and other physical facilities. For instance Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 deals with the situation where a medical college had tried to play fraud with the Council by submitting fake / forged documents in relation to teaching faculty. The conduct of a medical college plays a vital role while evaluating the application of the medical college for grant of permission. The above mentioned Regulation categorically provides that, if during an inspection, a medical college is found to have employed teaching faculty with fake documents or had forged the documents or had submitted forged declaration forms, the Council takes a serious view of the conduct of the medical college and the said college is debarred for next two academic years.
- 10). It has also been noticed by the Council that some medical college which initially fulfilled the minimum teaching, clinical, infrastructure and other physical facilities for grant of permission / renewal of permission, however, subsequently failed to maintain the said facilities in their respective medical colleges. It was also noticed that several medical colleges used to create a façade by employing fake patients and fake faculty to deceive the assessors during the inspection. In order to ensure that the medical colleges fulfill the minimum requirement of teaching and other physical facilities prescribed under the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations framed thereunder it became necessary for the Council to carry out surprise

inspections to ascertain the true and correct status of the facilities available in the medical college / institution and to eliminate the chances of any medical college employing fake faculty / patients merely for the purposes of MCI assessment. The Hon'ble Delhi High Court vide its judgment dated 20.12.2013 in the case of W.P. (C) No. 6261 / 2013 - Raipur Institute of Medical Sciences and Ors. vs. Union of India and Anr. had directed the Council to conduct all its inspections as surprise inspections and that the surprise inspections should be videographed. The Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of Royal Medical Trust (Regd.) Vs Union of India & Ors. (2015) 10 SCC 19, has affirmed and approved the surprise inspections conducted by the assessors of the MCI.

- 11). Every applicant medical college which genuinely and truthfully fulfills the minimum requirement of teaching, clinical and other facilities prescribed under the Act and the Regulations framed thereunder as also the norms prescribed by the Council will never shy away from any inspection by any assessor at any time in the year, notwithstanding the fact that it has not been given any prior intimation for inspection by the Council. If a hospital is a running hospital and patients are well attended by the medical faculty, there is no reason for any such medical college/institution to make an untrue and false declaration.

## **II. Selection of Assessors**

- 12). MCI was superseded by the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. on 15.05.2010, by Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Act 2010. The then Board of Governors (which also included Prof. (Dr.) Shiv Sareen) had constituted an Assessment Cell of the Council. The panel of assessors comprises of eminent Doctors / Professors / Associate Professors (who are having minimum six years of teaching experience as Associate Professor) from the Government Medical Colleges. The list is computerized and the selection of assessors is made through a computer software in random order. After the computer software randomly selects the proposed assessors, the Assessment Cell which was constituted during the regime of the Board of Governors appointed by the Central Govt., contacts the assessors and inquires about their availability for the purposes of carrying out inspection. It is only after the assessors accept and agree to conduct the assessment that the Assessment Cell constituted during the regime of the Board of Governors appointed by the Central Govt., proceeds to include his name in the team of assessors. The mechanism which was introduced by the then Board of Governors has been continued by the Council after the reconstitution of the MCI. It is also relevant to mention here that even the officials who were appointed by the then Board of Governors nominated by the Central Government are still continuing in the Assessment Cell of the Council and there is no change after the reconstitution of Council.
- 13). In order to ensure complete transparency during the physical assessment of the medical college the Assessment Cell of the Council selects assessors from the approved list of eminent medical professors from reputed Govt. institutions only including AIIMS, PGI-Chandigarh, Maulana Azad Medical College, Safdarjung College, Medical College, Kolkata, Madras Medical College, Chennai, Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad, Grant Medical College, Mumbai, G.S. Medical College, Mumbai, Bangalore Medical College, Bangalore etc. The assessors randomly selected through Computer Software are independent assessors who are obligated to report the correct and true picture of the clinical, teaching, infrastructure and other physical facilities available in the medical colleges as per the Assessors Guide. To ensure that there is surprise element in the inspection and the information regarding the inspection is not leaked the Council by way of abundant caution informs the assessors at the last moment about the assessment of the medical colleges.

- 14). *It is important to point out that the Council does not play any role in the preparation of assessment report and the same is prepared by the independent assessors as per the assessors guide and MSR pointing out the actual status of the teaching, clinical and other physical facilities available in the medical college and the same is also counter-signed by the Dean of the concerned colleges also.*
- 15). *The assessments are carried out by the MCI assessors on the basis of Standard Assessment Form and the Declaration Forms of the faculty member / Residents submitted by the medical college claiming to have the entire infrastructure for grant of permission/ renewal of permission as well as recognition in the month of September before the initiation of the process of inspection. The assessment report is thereafter submitted by the assessors to the Council and is placed before the Executive Committee of the Council, whereafter, the deficiencies pointed out by the assessors are considered in light of the MCI Regulations and norms to arrive at the conclusion as to whether the applicant medical college possess the prescribed clinical, teaching, infrastructure and other physical facilities available in the medical colleges for grant of permission/ renewal*
- 16). *The abovementioned procedure for selection of assessors put in place by the then Board of Governors ensures that only eminent Professors/ Doctors from reputed Government Medical Colleges carry out the assessment of the colleges and submit their assessment report to the Council. It is relevant to point out that the assessors randomly selected by the Assessment Cell are not employees of the Council. Further, the assessors being expert in the field of medical education, while preparing the assessment reports, are obliged to report the exact status of the clinical, teaching, infrastructure, other physical facilities etc.. During physical assessment of the medical college if the assessors find that there are certain deficiencies which have a direct impact on the quality of the medical education then the assessors are obliged to make observation regarding the same in the assessment reports. In absence of there being any personal bias, the wisdom and expertise of the MCI assessors cannot be doubted. The Assessors also submit a no conflict of interest certificate. It is relevant to state that there are no allegations challenging the competency and conduct of the assessors, however, some colleges dissatisfied by unfavourable findings recorded in the assessment reports have filed complaints to the Oversight Committee. The said Complaints have not been provided to the Council nor any explanation has been sought by the Oversight Committee on the allegations made in the Complaints till date.*
- 17). *The Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of Manohar Lal Sharma Vs. Medical Council of India- (2013) 10 SCC 60, has held that the assessors of the Council are experts in the field of medicine with unquestionable integrity and reputation and thus their findings in the assessment report could not be disputed in absence of any allegation of personal bias or malafides. The relevant portion of the judgement in the case of Manohar Lal Sharma v. Medical Council of India-(2013) 10 SCC 60 is reproduced as under:-*  
*".....27. We are also of the view that such an order is not vitiated by violation of principles of natural justice, especially, when no allegation of bias or mala fide has been attributed against the two doctors who constituted the inspection team, which conducted the surprise inspection on 6-7-2013. When the inspection team consists of two doctors of unquestionable integrity and reputation, who are experts in the field, there is no reason to discard the report of such inspection. In such circumstances, we are of the view that MCI has rightly passed the order rejecting the approval for renewal of permission for the third batch of 150 MBBS students granted for the academic year 2013-2014...."*

- 18). *The Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment dated 06.05.2016, passed in Civil Appeal No. 4914 of 2016 - Medical Council of India Vs. Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, was pleased to reaffirm and reiterate that the assessment report are prepared by the assessors who are reputed doctors and Professors and, therefore the findings given by them cannot be disputed. The relevant portion of the judgment is reproduced hereinbelow:-*

*"8. Our attention was also drawn to the decision of this Court in Manohar Lal Sharma v. Medical Council of India<sup>1</sup> wherein it was held that since the inspection is taken by "doctors of unquestionable integrity and reputation, who are experts in the field, there is no reason to discard the report of such an inspection." In the present appeal, there is no allegation made by KIMS of any mala fides of the Inspection Team or any perversity in the inspection report and hence there is no question of challenging the conclusions of a neutral, randomly selected Inspection Team in its assessment.*

.....

*23. A perusal of the decision of the High Court clearly indicates that it considered the latest report of the Inspection Team as if it was hearing an appeal against the report. In doing so, the High Court went into great details on issues relating to the number of teaching beds in the hospital, the limitations in the OPD Department, the number of units available in the subjects of General Medicine, Pediatrics etc., bed occupancy, number of Caesarean sections, discrepancy in data of major and minor operations, computerization in the institution, number of patients in the ICU, number of static X-ray machines, deficiency of examination halls, lecture theatres, library, students hostel, interns hostel, playground etc. etc. Surely, this was not within the domain of the High Court in exercise of its jurisdiction under Article 226 of the Constitution...*

.....

*24. The High Court did not appreciate that the inspection was carried out by eminent Professors from reputed medical institutions who were experts in the field and the best persons to give an unbiased report on the facilities in KIMS. The High Court under Article 226 of the Constitution was certainly not tasked to minutely examine the contents of the inspection report and weigh them against the objections of KIMS in respect of each of its 18 items. In our opinion, the High Court plainly exceeded its jurisdiction in this regard in venturing into seriously disputed factual issues...*

....."

- 19). *The whole procedure of assessment / inspection carried out by the assessors from appointment of assessors to submission of assessment report is completely transparent and the inspection is also video-graphed and photographed.*
- 20). *Further the directive issued by the Oversight Committee vide email dated 13.06.2016 regarding the procedure to be observed by the assessors during the assessments was placed on the website of the MCI and all assessment now are carried out in accordance with the assessors guide as well as the recommendations given by the Oversight Committee.*
- 21). *The Council with the objective of bringing more transparency in the system has prepared the road map and action plan for implementation of electronic governance at MCI including online monitoring of faculty across all medical colleges in the Country. In this regard the MCI has entered into a Memorandum of Understanding dated 13.04.2015 with the National Institute for Smart Government, to provide consultancy services titled 'MCI Digital Mission Mode Project (MCI-DMMP)'. National Institute for Smart*

Government, Hyderabad is a nonprofit company with Department of Electronics & IT, Department of Administrative Reforms & Public Grievance, Government of India, Government of Andhra Pradesh and NASSCOM being its initial promoters. National Institute for Smart Government has executed several projects for Central Government Ministries as well as State Government Departments.

- 22). The Council had issued Notice Inviting Tender in various national dailies of the country on 13.05.2016. The National Institute for Smart Government had prepared the 'Request for Proposal' and assisted the MCI in opening the bids and selecting the 'Final System Integrator'. The Technical bids and submitted by the companies were opened on 08.07.2016 and the Commercial bids, were opened on 15.07.2016, whereafter on the basis of the technical marks and evaluated bid price marks obtained by the bidders, M/s. Bodhtree Consulting Ltd., Hyderabad scored the maximum marks and was found to be L-1 bidder for the selection of Final System Integrator. The 'Final System Integrator' shall apart from implementation of electronic governance at MCI, also help in the implementation of online monitoring of faculty in various medical colleges in the country. The MCI in this regard had informed the various medical colleges in the country that the faculty members appointed must apply for Aadhar Cards.
- 23). After the implementation of the project of electronic governance at MCI, the real time Faculty attendance details will be stored in centralized servers at MCI Data Centre through the Biometric / IRIS based attendance machines to be installed at all the Medical Colleges. The central application of MCI will also have connectivity with AADHAR platform of Unique Identification Authority of India for verification. The attendance machines installed at the medical colleges across the country shall comply with Unique Identification Authority of India standards and will be supplied by MCI. Each college will have multiple machines spread across the campus to facilitate easy access to the faculty members.

### **III. Approval of Oversight Committee for selection of assessors**

- 24). The Oversight Committee in paragraph 3.1.5 of the communication dated 23.09.2016 have listed out various guidelines for selecting the assessors such as the assessors should be selected on the basis of national ranking, assessors should not have done more than 3 assessments in one year etc. At this juncture, it is relevant to draw the attention of the Oversight Committee to the fact that every year on an average 4,500 inspections are required to be carried out by the MCI assessors for the undergraduate, postgraduate and super specialty courses. It becomes very difficult for the Council to select assessors considering the fact that all assessors are reputed Professor /Doctors who have a very busy schedule in their respective medical colleges and have to especially take out time to make themselves available for MCI inspections.
- 25). In fact, it has been the experience of the Council that the assessors selected by the Assessment Cell of the Council have informed the Council at the last moment about their inability to go for the assessment due to their professional / teaching commitments. The Council very much appreciates and welcome the guidelines laid down by the Oversight Committee, however, it is the duty of the Council to apprise the Oversight Committee that the selection of Convenor after taking approval from the Oversight Committee and the selection of the team of assessors as suggested by the Oversight Committee would depend upon the availability of the assessor and the acceptance by the assessor to carry out the assessment. It is also to be kept in mind that it is very difficult to take a prior approval of the assessors due to unforeseen circumstances that may develop in relation to patient care and other professional duties. Further, the large number of assessment which have to be carried out throughout the year in a time bound manner and the same can be effectively carried

out only if the assessors fulfilling the guidelines laid down by the Oversight Committee are available.

- 26). At present the assessment cell has a data-base of about 4350 Assessors from whom the assessment team is selected by the MCI assessment cell with great difficulty. As requested by the Oversight Committee demarcating 18 colleges to choose the assessors from, the same will impact the number of assessors available to the Council when the number of assessments to be conducted is more than 4500. The Oversight Committee has also stated that no assessor would conduct more than 3 assessments in a year, such a request is not feasible because of the large number of assessment to be carried out each year in a time bound manner and subject to availability of assessors.

#### **IV. Logistics**

- 27). It is relevant to point out that the Council takes all possible steps to ensure that complete secrecy is maintained as regards the details of assessors and the date on which the assessment / inspection is to be conducted by the assessors. It is relevant to point out that it has always been an endeavor of the Council to ensure that the details of the assessors and the college where the assessment is carried out is not leaked to third parties and it is the assessment cell only which is aware about the same. In fact, the Council informs the team of assessors at the last moment about the details of the college where the assessment is to be carried out by them. This is done to ensure that the information is not leaked to medical colleges as well as to maintain the surprise element in the inspections. It is relevant to mention here that it has always been the endeavor of the Council to ensure that the name and details of the assessors is not disclosed to any person outside the Assessment Cell of the Council.
- 28). Accordingly, the Council has at present has only one travel agency that make arrangement for the travel, boarding and lodging of the assessors. It is the apprehension of the Council that if more travel agencies are engaged by the Council for making travel and other arrangements for the assessors of the Council there are ample chances that the details of the assessors and the college where the assessment is to be carried out by the Council may be leaked. In case of more travel agents it will be impossible to find as to who has leaked the information and details of the assessors and the inspections. It is therefore important that the travel information / details of the assessors are restricted to one travel agent and who can be held responsible in case any information regarding inspection is leaked.

#### **V. Assessment of colleges which have been granted conditional approval for academic year 2016-17**

- 29). The Oversight Committee in their email dated 13.06.2016 have stated that they had been informed by the Secretary, Government of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare that out of 150 application received under Section 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Under Graduate Course and 118 proposal for Super- Specialty courses for academic year 2016-17 many colleges would not have been granted an opportunity to submit their compliance to the deficiencies pointed out by the MCI assessors. The entire premise of the above-mentioned letter dated 13.06.2016 from the OC that such colleges might not have been granted any opportunity by the MCI for removal of deficiencies and, therefore, MCI may carry out fresh inspections – was factually incorrect and non-existent. It is a matter of record that all such applicant medical colleges, who were entitled to be granted an opportunity for furnishing compliance as per the judgment of this Hon'ble Court in Royal Medical Trust (Regd.), had already been granted an opportunity to submit their compliance and the same had also been verified by the MCI by way of compliance verification assessment. The assessment report(s) as well as compliance verification assessment(s) had been considered by the Executive Committee of the Council. Since the compliance verification inspection reports had once

again established continuing existence of gross deficiencies, at all such medical colleges, the MCI could not make any positive recommendation, to the Central Government, for any such college.

- 30). However, on the basis of the above-mentioned factually incorrect statement in the letter dated 13.06.2016 to the effect that such medical colleges might not have been inspected by the MCI for verification of removal of deficiencies, that the Oversight Committee [ without verifying the actual facts, vide email dated 13.06.2016 had permitted only those medical colleges which had not been afforded an opportunity ] permitted medical colleges to submit their compliance afresh to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare by 22.06.2016.
- 31). The Oversight Committee further required the MCI to conduct compliance verification inspection of such medical colleges which were not given an opportunity of compliance and submit the inspection report to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare by 20.07.2016. It was further stipulated that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare shall place their proposed decision in respect of the applications of such medical colleges to the Oversight Committee by 25.07.2016 for their consideration.
- 32). It is submitted that since the entire basis for the OC to require the MCI to carry out inspections of such colleges [ on the erroneous assumption that such colleges had not got any opportunity for verification of removal of deficiencies ] was non-existent, vide letter dated 21.06.2016, the Council had requested the Oversight Committee to review / recall the communication dated 13.06.2016 by, inter alia, stating as under:-
  - a. those colleges which were entitled to submit their compliance as per the directions passed by this Hon'ble Court in Royal Medical Trust (Regd.) were already granted an opportunity to submit their compliance and the same was considered by the Council for the current academic session.
  - b. Further, the compliance submitted by the medical colleges was verified by the Council by carrying out a compliance verification assessment of all such medical colleges. Where-after, the Council had forwarded its recommendation to the Central Government for final decisions.
  - c. The Central Govt. after considering the application of all such medical colleges and after considering the recommendation of the Council as well as after granting an opportunity of hearing to all such medical colleges, by 10.06.2016 had communicated its final decision to all such applicant - medical colleges.
  - d. Under the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 and the Regulations framed thereunder as well as the various binding judicial precedents it is permissible to grant, also within the permissible time limit, an applicant medical college a second opportunity to submit a compliance and a third inspection to verify as to whether the applicant-college has rectified the deficiencies pointed out by the MCI assessors.
  - e. The time schedule for processing of application for establishment of new medical college, renewal of permission, increase of seats as well as recognition has also to be strictly adhered to and the Hon'ble Supreme Court alone has the power to relax the time schedule .
- 33). Vide communications dated 11.08.2016, 12.08.2016 and 13.08.2016 the Oversight Committee had granted approval for:
  - (i) Establishment of new medical college for Under Graduate Course from academic year 2016-17;
  - (ii) Grant of renewal of permission for Under Graduate Course from academic year 2016-17;
  - (iii) Grant of recognition for MBBS courses;

- (iv) *Grant of permission for super-specialty courses from the academic year 2016-17;*
  - (v) *Grant of permission for increase in intake under section 10-A of the Act and renewal of Recognition under section 11 (2) of the Act.*
- 34). *The applications of those medical colleges which have been approved by the Oversight Committee shall have to submit within 15 days from the date of notification of the approval by the Central Government the following documents:*
- a. *An undertaking on affidavit from the Dean / Principal and the Chairman of the Trust affirming that the deficiencies pointed out by the assessors of the Council in the compliance verification assessment stands rectified;*
  - b. *A Bank Guarantee for a sum of Rs. 2 crores in favour of the Council which shall be valid for a period of one year or till such time the first renewal inspection takes place, whichever is later.*
- 35). *Vide the abovementioned communications dated 11.08.2016, 12.08.2016 and 13.08.2016 the Oversight Committee further decided that the inspection of the medical colleges which have been approved by the Oversight Committee shall be conducted after 30.09.2016 and any college, which is found to have not rectified / removed all deficiencies as per their undertaking shall be debarred from admitting any students for a period of 2 years.*
- 36). *Further, the Oversight Committee has also granted approvals to some medical colleges for conducting Courses vide letters referred in paragraph 2 of the communication dated 23.09.2016. Copies of such communication are not available in Council records.*
- 37). *The Council Office is in receipt of Letter of Permission that have been granted by the Central Government on the directives of the Oversight Committee regarding establishment of new Medical Colleges, renewal of permission of existing Medical Colleges, increase of seats in MBBS course in Medical Colleges, recognition of MBBS courses and approvals for super-specialty courses. However, the communication that has been made between the Oversight Committee and the Central Government in this regard is not known to the Council.*
- 38). *The entire Scheme of prior permission, which was brought into the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 by amendment by incorporating Section 10-A therein, and thereafter by framing various statutory regulations in this behalf – is that every applicant college must fulfill all minimum requirements as per the statutory regulations of the MCI in relation to infrastructural, teaching and other facilities to be provided by it for imparting medical education to the students. There is no permissibility whatsoever for granting any conditional permission to any medical college, i.e. before the minimum requirements are met with by the college. The grant of conditional permission means that the college is enabled to make admission of gullible / innocent students in medical courses and then putting their entire career / life at risk, in the event any such medical college fails to remove the deficiencies.*
- 39). *As regards the conditional approval granted by the Oversight Committee to the medical colleges for UG / Super-specialty course for academic year 2016-17, the Oversight Committee has directed the Council to carry out the inspection from 15.10.2016 and submit the recommendation of the Executive Committee / Post Graduate Committee of the Council to Ministry of health and Family Welfare by 25.11.2016. The attention of the Oversight Committee is drawn to the guidelines laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of Royal Medical Trust (regd.) Vs. Union of*

India (2015) 10 SCC 19., wherein, the Hon'ble Supreme Court has emphasized that the assessment conducted by the MCI should have a surprise element. The relevant portion of the judgment is reproduced hereunder:

“... ”

**(B) Inspection should then be conducted by the Inspectors of the MCI. By very nature such inspection must have an element of surprise. Therefore sufficient time of about three to four months ought to be given to the MCI to cause inspection at any time and such inspection should normally be undertaken latest by January. Surprise Inspection would ensure that the required facilities and infrastructure are always in place and not borrowed or put in temporarily.....”**

- 40). The Oversight Committee has only granted a window of 30 days to the Council to conduct assessment / inspection of medical colleges, evaluating the inspection report and send its recommendations to MHFW. With all due respect to the Oversight Committee, the abovementioned decision of the Oversight Committee will completely take away the imperative surprise element of the assessment / inspection as by now all the colleges will be aware of the said requirements stipulated by the OC. Further, the medical colleges which have been granted conditional approval would be ready with cosmetic infrastructure artificially as the dates within which the inspection / assessment will be carried out by the assessors is already known to the medical colleges and there is every likelihood of their making temporary false / fake arrangements by camouflage for the inspection by the MCI.
- 41). The Oversight Committee in paragraph 3.4 (v) of the communication dated 23.09.2016 have instructed the Council to keep in mind the National / State holidays and not to conduct any assessment on such holidays. It is relevant to state that as per the Council's Regulations the Council is obliged not to carry out any assessment / inspection 2 days before or after any Holiday / Festival.
- 42). In the month of October / November festivals like Dhanteras, Diwali, Bhai Dooj, Chhat Pooja, Guru Nanak Jayanti etc. are observed in the Country. Further, in the month of November, the major festival of Diwali is celebrated throughout the Country and in fact most of the colleges are closed for almost a week or 10 days during the Diwali vacations. Thus, it would not be possible to conduct inspection when medical colleges are closed during Diwali vacation. If the holidays / festivals falling in the month of October/ November are taken into consideration the Council is left with very little time and there will be no element of surprise left in the inspection / assessment conducted by the Council.
- 43). It is relevant to mention here that there are certain medical colleges which have been found to be grossly deficient in teaching, clinical and other physical infrastructure facilities and there have appeared in the print and electronic media – a number of reports / sting operations, in relation to various medical colleges. Such media reports, both in print and in electronic media, tend to confirm continuing gross deficiencies in all such medical colleges. The media persons, appear to have physically visited the medical colleges and have reported gross deficiencies in all such medical colleges. In some of such colleges, the reports appearing in the electronic and print media found that the ICU, Operation Theatre, casualty, Blood Bank, Wards, are locked and there is not even a single patient in their hospitals. Everyday media persons are approaching Council for its comments especially in view of the interest of the students aspiring to become doctors without there being fulfillment of minimum standards for imparting medical education to them.

- 44). *In this regard, the kind attention of the Oversight Committee is invited to various newspaper reports including the significant newspaper report dated 28.09.2016 published in the Hindustan Times, which reported that on visiting some of these medical colleges it was noticed by the reporters that there were neither any patients, medical teachers nor proper clinical material, infrastructure etc. in the medical college. It has been further reported that despite there being serious deficiencies persisting in the medical colleges the said colleges have been granted permission to admit students. A copy of the News Paper report published in the Hindustan Times is enclosed along with this letter.*
- 45). *Similarly, a leading national TV news channel has been carrying out a news report on their channel wherein the reporters of the said news channel have stated that they had physically visited the private medical colleges situated in different parts of the Country and found that the hospitals attached to those medical colleges are devoid of patients, teacher, doctors etc. It is relevant to state that the bare sight of the medical college in the video shows the deplorable condition of the medical colleges. In fact, some of the colleges are so grossly deficient that even a lay man can make out that the medical college does not have the prescribed teaching, infrastructure and other physical facilities in the medical college. In one of the college, even the medical student studying in the medical college has confirmed about the gross deficiencies in the colleges.*
- 46). *The Council requests the Oversight Committee to consider the interest of the students aspiring to become doctors. It is relevant to state that the gullible students would come to know of the infrastructure available in the medical college where they are seeking admissions only when they begin to attend the classes. Thus, it is impossible to ascertain the infrastructure while taking admissions in any medical college, which will gravely impact the career of such students.*
- 47). *It is humbly stated that in view of the circumstances and critical aspects set out hereinabove, there would not be any further necessity or justification for carrying out any further inspection of such grossly deficient medical colleges much less by any advance intimation and/or other stipulations, which the Oversight Committee has desired to be followed by the Council.*
- 48). *Thus, while respectfully reiterating a complete absence of any justification or, much less, any requirement for conducting any further inspection of such medical colleges, it is the humble submission of the Council that when it is always committed to discharge its statutory obligations in the letter and spirit of the Indian Medical Council Act and the Regulations made thereunder, the MCI would always be ready and willing to carry out necessary inspection of any medical college with complete surprise and in such a manner which ensures that the objective of such an inspection can be achieved.*
- 49). *For the academic year 2017-18, the Council has already started processing the applications for the establishment of new medical colleges, grant of renewals, increase of intake capacity as well as case of recognition and the applications for postgraduate course / super-specialty courses. In a number of cases the Council after considering the applications of the colleges in view of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made thereunder as well as the recommendations of the Oversight Committee, has already carried out assessment of such colleges. There are a large number of decisions which as per the request of the Oversight Committee were forwarded to the Central Govt. and are now pending approval of the Oversight Committee since July 2016. The Council had to consider the applications strictly in accordance with the Statutory Time Schedule of the MCI as well as the judgements passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in this regard. The procedure now suggested by the Oversight Committee will further not only delay the processing of*

*the aforesaid applications but will be impossible to complete the process which are required to be considered in a time bound manner.*

- 50). *The Oversight Committee has after considering the entire system of assessments including the compliance verification assessment through the Assessment Cell as being followed by the Council since the time of the Board of Governors, has now requested the Council to carry out the verification assessments of the medical colleges which have been granted permission by the Oversight Committee for the academic year 2016-17. Thus it is requested that the Council be permitted to carry out such assessments as per the existing procedure of the Council and in accordance of the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the aforementioned judgments.*
- 51). *Accordingly, it is humbly requested that the Oversight Committee may take into consideration the above-mentioned facts, critical relevant aspects being an imperative for any objective and meaningful compliance verification inspection and reconsider the guidelines and directions given by the Oversight Committee on the points mentioned above. The Council has always considered the case of the medical colleges in the perspective of the students who will undergo medicine course in the respective medical colleges, the interest of the college is considered secondary for the maintenance of highest standard of medical education in the Country and to ensure that the students undergoing medicine course get best of teaching and training in their medical colleges and society at large."*

**B. Communication dated 07.10.2016**

"In continuation to our communication No. MCI-34(41)(Gen.)/Med./2016/134213-14 dated the 4<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016 and in reference to your communication dated 4<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016. I am directed to inform you that the Council is in receipt of a list of 237 Assessor from AIIMS, New Delhi, LHMC, New Delhi, MAMC, New Delhi, GB Pant, New Delhi, UCMS, Delhi, King George Medical College, Lucknow, Sanjay Gandhi Institute of Postgraduate, Lucknow, PGI Chandigarh, IPGMER, Kolkata, AFMC, Pune, Seth G.S. Medical College, Mumbai, vide your letter dated 4.10.2016.

The Assessment Cell had called 88 Assessors on 5<sup>th</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016 from above Institutes to confirm their availability and only 18 Assessors confirmed that they are available w.e.f. 17<sup>th</sup> Oct., to 2<sup>nd</sup> Week of November, 2016 with certain conditions like direct connectivity by Air and convenient dates as per their other engagements.

The details of the Assessors contacted by the Council with the remarks are enclosed for kind reference please.

Large number of Assessors from these Institutes are not available because of various reasons:-

1. Assessors are not willing to undertake UG Assessment.
2. Conferences are being organized during the month of October/November, 2016, hence non availability of Assessors.
3. In some institutions UG/ Post Graduate Exam are being scheduled in October, 2016.
4. Some of the Assessors have reservations about the place and dates.
5. Assessors are not willing to undertake long road Journey because of health problems.
6. As per practice for any UG assessment, three assessors are always 1 from Pre, 1 from Para and 1 from clinical subjects, since only limited number of Assessors are available from these Institutes it is difficult to arrange a team comprising of the Professors from Pre, Para and Clinical departments.

7. Some of the Assessors need letter of appointment prior to the departure for the assessment, so that they can apply for leave/station leaving permission.
8. Since, the whole process of assessment is to be kept confidential till the start of the Assessment process as per the directive of Oversight Committee, it will not be possible to send any communication to the Assessors.

There are only 16 working days for assessments from 17<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016 to 15<sup>th</sup> Nov., 2016. The details of Holiday List & Working days for the Month of October to November, 2016 is enclosed. The Council does not carry out Assessment at least 2 days before and 2 days after important religious and festival holidays declared by the Central/State Govt.

In view of above, it is neither possible nor feasible to conduct assessment during the stipulated period as per the guidelines prescribed in your letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016."

*The members of the Executive Committee considered the entire matter and observed that the decision of appointing inspectors / assessors from Govt. Medical Colleges was taken by Ad-hoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court, at its meeting dt. 08/01/2003. The Ad-hoc Committee was appointed by Hon'ble Supreme Court vide its order dt. 20/11/2002. in CA No. 599-600/2002 - Dr. P.C. KesavanKuttyNayar&Ors. V/s. Union of India &Ors. Since then, the MCI has been scrupulously following the criteria laid down by the Ad hoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court for selection of Assessors. Till date the Council has not received any complaint against any such assessors.*

*At present there are 237 Govt. / Corporation Medical Colleges from which Assessors are appointed. It is not clear as to how and on what criteria/yardstick the Oversight Committee has restricted its choice to only 12 medical colleges out of the aforesaid number of medical colleges for selection of assessors for conducting inspections by the MCI.*

*Even amongst these 12 medical colleges, only 237 doctors have been chosen from amongst more than a thousand of the eligible assessors collectively available and working in such institutions / colleges, for assessments/inspections by the MCI. For the Council, to adopt such pick and choose policy would neither be justified nor desirable / permissible to adopt such a policy by selecting few colleges for selecting few assessors and ignoring other thousands of eligible Professors from those Government institutions for being appointed as assessors for conducting inspections for the MCI.*

*The Council is firmly of opinion that if complaints against a particular assessor is received with tangible proof/evidence, then certainly such an assessor should be removed from the list of assessors and should not be appointed for such a sensitive task; but to ignore such a large number of assessors from the 237 Govt. Medical Colleges would certainly be counterproductive and would not be conducive for the fulfilment of the objective to be achieved and also for the healthy growth of medical education in the Country.*

*In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council after detailed deliberations decided that the position conveyed in the aforesaid letters by the Council is not only in accordance with the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956, Regulations framed thereunder and the consistent practice regarding assessment followed by the Council, but also truthfully depicts the practical ground realities in securing the services of eminent professors from Government Medical Colleges / Institutions for undertaking / performing the sensitive task of conducting inspections of medical colleges.*

*In view of above, it is neither possible nor feasible to conduct assessment during the period, as sought to be stipulated by the OC and indicated in the guidelines prescribed in your letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> Oct., 2016. Hence, having regard to the ground realities, practicalities observed over a period of time for securing the services of eminent professors from Government Medical Colleges / Institutions for undertaking / performing the sensitive task of conducting inspections of medical colleges - as stated above, the Executive Committee of the Council has been constrained to state that the issues raised in the aforementioned letters of the OC Committee would not permit any different outcome even when the earlier view of the Executive Committee is taken up for re-consideration.*

*While coming to the conclusion that the realistic practical nuances and the impossibilities, highlighted by the MCI – as also reiterated above, rendering its earlier communications to be final in the circumstances, it is further stated that the Executive Committee of the Council, however, also decided that the Council shall carry out assessments for renewal of permission for these colleges for the next Academic Year and the decision of the Executive Committee alongwith the assessment report(s) would be placed in accordance with the time schedule, through the Central Govt., before the Oversight Committee.*

*Reassuring all possible actions and complete cooperation.*

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

**(Dr. Reena Nayyar)  
Secretary I/c.**

**Place: New Delhi  
Dated :10.10.2016**

**APPROVED**

(Dr. Jayshree Mehta)  
President

