No. MCI-5(3)/2015-Med.Misc./

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA NEW DELHI

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 2nd March, 2015 at 11.00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

Present:

	President	
Dr. Jayshree Mehta	Medical Council of India,	
	Former Professor of Surgery,	
	Govt. Medical College,	
	Vadodara, Gujarat.	
	Vice-President,	
	Medical Council of India,	
Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham	Former Vice-Chancellor of Dr. M.G.R.	
	Health University,	
	Tamil Nadu	
	Professor and Head, Department of	
D D M T	Community Medicine,	
Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy	MKCG Medical College,	
	Berhampur.	
Dr. Anil Mahajan	Professor & HOD, General Medicine,	
	Government Medical College,	
	Jammu, J&K.	
	Dean, Goa Medical College,	
Dr. V.N. Jindal	Bombolim-403202,	
Dir vii vi onidai	Goa	
	Professor of Urology and	
	Transplant Surgery,	
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Head Transplant Unit,	
74	Dayanand Medical College,	
	Ludhiana	
	Director General, Medical Education,	
Dr. K.K. Gupta	10, Gulistan Colony,	
Dr. K.K. Gupta	Lucknow	
	Vice-Chancellor,	
Dr. G.B. Gupta		
	Ayush & Health Sciences University,	
	Raipur, Chhattisgarh.	
Dr. Viiov Brokech Cinah	Professor & Head, Department Of	
Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	Gastroenterology, Patna Medical College,	
	Patna, Bihar	

A.K. Harit, Deputy Secretary (Admn.)

Apology for absence was received from Dr. Ravindra H.N.

1. <u>Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 10th Feb, 2015 – Confirmation of.</u>

The Executive Committee of the Council confirmed the minutes of the meeting held on 10^{th} Feb, 2015.

2. <u>Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action</u> taken thereon.

The Executive Committee of the Council while noting the action taken on the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 10th Feb, 2015 observed that the college name in item no. 12 should be read as "Guru Govind Singh Medical College, Faridkot" in place of "Guru Gobind Singh Memorial Medical College, Faridkot".

3. <u>Pending Items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.</u>

The Executive Committee of the Council while noting the pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee decided to send strong reminder for items at SI. Nos. 1 & 3.

4. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (50 seats) of Late Shri Lakhi Ram Agrawal Memorial Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (50 seats) of Late Shri Lakhi Ram Agrawal Memorial Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (03rd & 04th February 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 34.14 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 51.72 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

#	Department	Beds	3/1	
	1/2 8	Required	Available	Shortage
1	General Medicine	72	40	32
2	Tb & Chest	8	NIL	8
3	Psychiatry	8	NIL	8
4	Skin & VD	8	NIL	8
5	General Surgery	90	52	38
6	Orthopaedics	30	20	10
7	ENT	10	NIL	10
	TOTAL			114

- 4. Bed occupancy was only 15 % which is grossly inadequate.
- 5. There was only 1 Major & NIL Minor operation for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 6. Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload is grossly inadequate. Registers are not maintained properly. Doctors are not posted in the laboratories regularly.
- 7. Histopathology & Cytology workload is NIL.
- 8. Casualty: Only 4 beds are available against requirement of 10 as per Regulations. There is no Central Suction. Crash Cart, Defibrillator, Ventilator are not available. Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 9. O.T.: Only 3 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations. Central oxygen & Suction, Infusion Pumps are not available.

- Separate septic O.T. is not available. Preanaesthetic & Post operative rooms are not available.
- 10. ICUs: ICCU, MICU, NICU/PICU are not available.
- 11. Labour Room: Baby resuscitation kit is not well equipped.
- 12. Only 1 static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations. AERB approval is not available. Only 1 USG is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations. No Radiologist was available during assessment.
- 13. OPD: Separate registration counters for OPD/IPD are not available. 4 Examination rooms required for each department are not available. Capacity of teaching area is inadequate. Injection room for males/females is not available. ECG room is not available. Dressing room for male/female is not available. Minor O.T. is not available. Plaster room / Plaster cutting room are not available. In Ophthalmology, Dark room and Dressing room are not available. Facilities are inadequate in Paediatrics OPD.
- 14. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are not available.
- 15. Wards: Examination/Treatment room, Pantry are not available in several wards. Doctors'/Students' Duty room, Demonstration room are not available in any ward. There is no Unit distribution in major departments.
- 16. MRD is not available. It is only a small room for preservation of tickets.
- 17. CSSD is not available.
- 18. Out of 2 lecture theaters available, 1 is not of gallery type which is not as per Regulations.
- 19. Central Library: Available area is only 100 sq.m. against requirement of 800 sq.m. Internet nodes are not available.
- 20. Residents' Hostel: It is under construction.
- 21. Nurses' Hostel: It is not available.
- 22. Dean's office is not available in the affiliated teaching hospital.
- 23. Intercom is not available.
- 24. Nursing staff: Only 105 Nurses are available against requirement of 175 as per Regulations.
- 25. Anatomy department: Only 23 specimens are available. Cooling chambers are not available. Capacity of Demonstration rooms is less.
- 26. Physiology department: Instruments & Furniture are not available in Amphibian & Mammalian laboratories.
- 27. Pathology department: Service laboratories are under renovation. Instruments & Furniture are not installed. Only 41 specimens are available.
- 28. Microbiology department: Service laboratories are under renovation. Instruments & Furniture are not installed.
- 29. Pharmacology department: Laboratories are under renovation. Instruments & Furniture are not installed.
- 30. Forensic Medicine department: Prototype firearms, slides are not available in museum. Cold storage is not installed.
- 31. RHTC: It is under control of DM & HO and not under Dean as required under Regulations.
- 32. UHC: It is under control of DM & HO and not under Dean as required under Regulations.
- 33. Faculty offices are inadequate in major departments.
- 34. Website is not available.
- 35. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (50 seats) of Late Shri Lakhi Ram Agrawal Memorial Medical College, Raigarh, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

5. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of F.H Medical College, Firozabad, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar University, Agra, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of F.H Medical College, Firozabad, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar University, Agra, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter.

6. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna, Bihar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna, Bihar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29th & 30th January 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 46.36 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 71.71 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Dr. A.K. Chaudhary, Medical Superintendent, possesses only 8 years of administrative experience against requirement of 10 years and hence not qualified to hold the post.
- 4. Teaching Beds: Only 1 Unit is available in paediatrics against requirement of 2 as per Regulations.
- 5. OPD attendance was 542 on day of assessment against requirement of 600 as per Regulations.
- 6. There were only 2 Major & 3 Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 7. Histopathology & Cytology workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 8. O.T.: Only 3 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 4 & 1 Minor O.T. is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations. Central oxygen/Suction are not available. Monitoring equipment is inadequate. Infusion Pumps are not available.
- 9. ICUs: Non-functional.
- 10. Labour Room: Facilities are inadequate in Eclampsia room. Dark room is not available.
- 11. No mobile X-ray machine is available. Only 1 USG is available against requirement of 2 as per Regulations.
- 12. CSSD is not available.
- 13. Nursing staff: Only 25 Nurses are available against requirement of 175 as per Regulations.
- 14. Speech therapy is not available.
- 15. Central Library: Area available is only 80 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. It is not air-conditioned. Capacity of Students' reading room (outside) & Students' reading room (outside) is 50 each against requirement of 100 each as per Regulations. Staff reading room is not available. Foreign journals are not available. Internet nodes are not available. Staff is inadequate.

- 16. Central photography section is not available.
- 17. Students' Hostel: Accommodation is available for 173 students only against requirement of 225 as per Regulations. Visitors' room, A.C. study room with computer & Internet are not available.
- 18. Residents' Hostel: Accommodation available is for 10 against requirement of 82 as per Regulations. Ancillary facilities are inadequate.
- 19. Nurses' Hostel: Accommodation is available for 20 Nurses against requirement of 35 as per Regulations.
- 20. Residential Quarters: Total 30 quarters are available against requirement of 23 for teaching faculty & 36 non-teaching staff.
- 21. Recreational facilities are not available.
- 22. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing of diseases. Medical Records Officer/Statistician are not available.
- 23. Central Clinical Laboratory: Separate sections are not available.
- 24. Paramedical staff: 94 are available against requirement of 101.
- 25. Anatomy department: Embalming room & Museum are not available. Students' Lockers are not available. Audiovisual aids are not available in Demonstration Room. Dissection tables available are less. Cold storage facility is inadequate.
- 26. Audiovisual aids are not available in any Demonstration Room.
- 27. Departments of Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology & Forensic Medicine are not fully functional. Laboratories & Museum are yet to be set up.
- 28. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna, Bihar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

7. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4th batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4th batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (06th & 07th February 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 32.3 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Ratio of non-medical teachers in Anatomy department is 54 % against maximum permissible 33.33 % as per Regulations.
- 3. Shortage of Residents is 79.7 % as per Regulations.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 46.9 % on day of assessment. Many patients were found to be cold cases in General Medicine, Ophthalmology & Tb & Chest departments where admission in hospital was questionable.
- 5. There was only 1 Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment. It was of Orthopaedics department and no other patient was waiting.
- 6. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in SICU. It is not air-conditioned.
- 7. There were very few patients in registration/OPD area at 11:00 a.m. There was only 1 patient in ENT OPD at 11:05 a.m. Not a single patient was there in Ophthalmology at 11:45 a.m. However, registration entries of in OPD registers of Casualty, Orthopaedics, Ophthalmology& ENT between 11:00 a.m. 11: 45 a.m. were 13,13,20 & 8 respectively.

- 8. Audiometry room is neither air-conditioned nor sound-proof.
- 9. RHTC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 and further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(b) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which reads as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(b) Colleges in the stage from III renewal (i.e. Admission of fourth batch) till recognition of the institute for award of MBBS degree.

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 20% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that the Institute has admitted students for 2014-2015 pursuant to order of Hon'ble Supreme Court after filing undertaking dated 27/09/2014 by the college authorities which states as under:

"With reference to above mentioned subject and as per the directions given by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in the Judgment of Writ Petition(civil) 469 dated 18 September, 2014. I hereby undertake that in case of any defects as pointed out in the last MCI inspection report found in the institution then the Bank Guarantee submitted by us may be forfeited."

In view of the deficiencies listed above, it is amply evident that the institute has failed to rectify previous deficiencies which are still persisting.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the order of Hon'ble Apex Court dt. 18/09/2014 & 25/092014, the operative part of which reads as under:

"The relevant portion of the order dated 18.09.2014 passed in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014 by the Hon'ble Supreme Court is reproduced hereunder:-

" Heard the learned senior counsel appearing for both the sides.

Looking at the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case and, especially, when several seats for medical admission are likely to remain vacant for the academic year 2014-15, we are of the view that these matters require urgent consideration and we are giving these interim directions under the provisions of Article 142 of the Constitution of India

There is one more reason for passing this interim order. We are conscious of the fact that number of physicians in our country is much less than what is required and because of non-renewal of recognition of several medical colleges, our citizens would be deprived of a good number of physicians and therefore, we are constrained to pass this order, whereby at least there would be some increase in the number of physicians after five years. We are running against time because the last date for giving admissions to MBBS Course for the academic year 2014-15 is 30th September, 2014.

We also desire to reconsider the directions given by this Court in the judgment of Priya Gupta v. State of Chhattisgarh [(2012) 7 SCC 433], but at this juncture, as we do not have sufficient time to decide all these petitions finally, we are passing this interim order

and the matter with regard to reconsideration of the aforestated judgment would be considered while finally disposing of this group of petitions.

It has been submitted on behalf of the learned senior counsel appearing for all the petitioners/ respondents, who are managing medical colleges, that the defects which had been recorded at the time of the last inspection by the representatives of the Medical Council of India have been duly rectified and at present, the defects pointed out in the reports do not exist. The said fact can be ascertained only by having a fresh Compliance Verification/Inspection. However, the stand taken by the Central Government and the Medical Council of India is to the effect that no such inspection can be undertaken in the present academic session because of paucity of time and it would violate the time schedule laid down by this Court in the case of Priya Gupta (supra).

The learned senior counsel appearing for the Medical Council of India has also submitted that the petitioners do not have any legal right for getting renewal of the recognition, especially in view of the fact that the Verification/Inspection Reports are not available for the period in question. The learned senior counsel has relied upon some of the Judgments to substantiate his case and according to him, it would not be just and proper to permit the said medical colleges to take fresh batch of students.

Looking at the peculiar facts of the case and the circumstances stated hereinabove, we direct the petitioners to file undertakings by President/Chairman and Secretary of the petitioners' institutions running medical colleges within 10 days from today, to the effect that there is no defect in the medical colleges run by them and they would also state that their deposit with the MCI, which is around Rs.10 Crores, be forfeited by way of penalty if the statement made in the undertaking is found to be incorrect at the time of the next inspection. A draft undertaking has been given to this Court. A copy of the undertaking, which might be filed by the institutions, shall be served upon the office of the Medical Council of India as well as to the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Govt. of India, New Delhi.

We also record the fact that in the recent past, the Medical Council of India has renewed recognition of Government Medical Colleges on the basis of undertakings and therefore, we see no reason not to permit the private colleges to admit students on the basis of undertakings given by their office bearer as a special case.

Notwithstanding any direction given in the case of Priya Gupta (supra), if undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by the institutions managing medical colleges for the academic year 2014-15, admissions shall be given to the students from the merit list prepared by the States and they shall be charged fees prescribed by the Government Medical Colleges of their respective States. The State Authorities, i.e., the Directorate of Medical Education & Research, of the respective States shall send students, in order of their merit, to the medical colleges run by the petitioners, which are situated within their States, within one week from the date of receipt of a copy of this order and the said students shall be admitted to the MBBS Course in accordance with the rules and regulations of the MCI and also regulations dated 16.04.2010 framed by the Medical Council of India, provided undertakings as mentioned above are filed on behalf of the concerned institutions.

It is also clarified that there would be no further counseling in respect of the students who are to be given admission, even if it might result into some heartburning among other students, but in the peculiar facts of the case, we give this direction.

In no case, the admission shall be given after 30thSeptember, 2014. This order shall also apply to all the institutions which had filed their petitions earlier for renewal of their recognition for the academic year2014-15, but their petitions were rejected or withdrawn for whatever reason, provided undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by President/Chairman and the Secretary of those institutions. All those petitions shall be deemed to have been revived and this order shall be deemed to have been passed in those cases also. This order shall only be in respect of renewal of recognition and not for creation of additional seats or for new colleges.

We also record that the Union of India has supported the petitioners in the interest of students. We also direct the Union of India to give wide publicity to this order in print as well as electronic media in the interest of the concerned students.

It is directed that the list of students getting admission I pursuance of this order shall be placed on record of this Court by 1st October, 2014 by the concerned institutions and a copy thereof shall also be sent to the MCI.

These matters shall be treated as part-heard and shall be notified for further hearing in the month of December, 2014."

The Hon'ble Supreme Court thereafter vide its order dated 25.09.2014 issued certain clarification in respect to the order dated 18.09.2014 in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014, which are reproduced hereunder:-

"After hearing the learned counsel for the parties we deem it appropriate to issue following clarifications with regard to our earlier order dated 18th September, 2014. These clarifications shall be read into the said order as if they were always part thereof:-

- 1. The order dated 18th September, 2014 shall also apply to cases where colleges or institutions were seeking increase in intake capacity and in the current year have been denied permission to admit students after first or second or third or fourth renewal/inspection. In our view such institutions where Renewal/Inspection with respect to increase in capacity were conducted in the present academic year are also entitled to the benefit under the order dated 18th September, 2014.
- 2. We also clarify that fees chargeable from the students admitted pursuant to our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall be at the same rates as applicable to the students in Government medical colleges in respective States and such fees shall be at the same levels as that of the Government medical colleges till the students so admitted pass out from the private medical colleges or institutions.
- 3. Our order shall also apply to all similarly situated institutions irrespective of the fact whether any petitions were or are pending in this Court or in any of the High Courts or even if they had not approached any court at all. This order shall also apply even in cases where there were orders of stay in favour of the Medical Council of India restraining the colleges from admitting students for the current academic session.
- 4. The order shall not apply to colleges or institutions which have been disqualified by the Medical Council of India and/or the Central Government and have been prohibited from making any admissions for the current academic year 2014-15.
- 5. In cases where two separate lists are prepared and sent by the State agencies one relating to State quota and the other relating to management quota in private institutions, we clarify that for the current academic year there shall be only one list and that shall be the "State quota" alone. There shall not be any management quota list to be sent to the private colleges or institutions taking the benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014. The Management quota shall also be filled through the State list and the fees chargeable for the management quota shall also be charged at the same levels and rates as applicable to State quota list.
- 6. We further clarify that private institutions taking benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall have to take students only from the State agencies and at fees chargeable for students in Government medical colleges as stated above, regardless of their status or claim as Minority Institutions or Deemed Universities."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to invoke/forfeit the Bank Guarantees submitted by the Institute and directed the Institute to submit fresh bank guarantee within 2 weeks.

The Executive Committee of the Council also noted that the college has not taken action regarding discharge of students and decided to send a reminder to the college for immediate necessary action. The Committee further decided that a copy of the said letter may be marked to Vice Chancellor of affiliating University Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh, Director, Medical Education, Secretary, Medical Education and to State Medical Council also.

8. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital and Research Centre, Jaring, Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital and Research Centre, Jaring, Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (11th & 12th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 100 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as detailed in report.
- 3. Dean was not available.
- 4. Incharge Medical Superintendent lacks adequate experience required for the post.
- 5. OPD attendance was only 15 on day of assessment. There was no admission in Casualty on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 7. Bed occupancy was ZERO.
- 8. There was no Normal delivery or Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 9. Radiological & laboratory Investigation workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 10. All the records were computer generated. On verification, there were no case sheets.
- 11. OPD: Teaching areas are not available. No facilities are available in examination rooms & OPDs.
- 12. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available.
- 13. Wards: Nursing station, Treatment room, Duty room, Pantry, Demonstration room are not available in any ward. All the wards were non-functional and no patients were admitted in any ward
- 14. MRD is not available.
- 15. Casualty: There was no doctor in Casualty. Separate Casualty for Obstetrics is not available. Disaster Trolley, Crash Cart, Ventilator are not available. There was no patient and past records were not available.
- 16. Central Clinical Laboratory: Staff is inadequate.
- 17. O.T.: Only 2 O.T.s are available against requirement of 4 each. Central Oxygen & Suction are not available. Monitoring & Resuscitation equipment are inadequate. Preoperative and Postoperative room are not available.
- 18. ICUs: There are beds but without any facility. There was no patient in ICCU or any ICU on day of assessment.
- 19. Labour Room: It is not available.
- 20. Radiodiagnosis department: There was no doctor or technical staff on day of assessment. Sonography was also not functional. There are no past records.
- 21. Blood bank is not functional.
- 22. CSSD is not available.
- 23. Residents' Hostel: Accommodation is available for 40 Residents only against requirement of 82 as per Regulations.
- 24. Nurses' Hostel: It is not available.
- Residential Quarters: Only 10 quarters each are available for faculty and non-teaching staff against requirement of 23 for faculty & 36 for nonteaching staff.
- 26. Paraclinical departments of Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine, Community Medicine are yet to be established and non-functional.

- 27. Anatomy department: Museum is not adequate. Microscopes are inadequate. There are only 2 cadavers. Lockers are only 50.
- 28. Intercom is not available.
- 29. College Council room is a part of Principal's room.
- 30. MEU is not available.
- 31. No CME programmes have been conducted by the institute during the year.
- 32. No meeting of College Council has been held during the year.
- 33. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee does not exist.
- 34. Lecture Theaters: There is no facility for E class. There is no lecture theater in the hospital.
- 35. Central Library: Chairs are not provided in Students' seating room. There are only 6 Indian journals available against requirement of 14 Indian & 6 foreign journals as per Regulations. It is not air-conditioned. There are no signages. Facilities for Xeroxing & downloading are not available.
- 36. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: There are no attached toilets.
- 37. Central Photography Section is not available.
- 38. Central laundry is not available,
- 39. Kitchen facility is not available.
- 40. Teaching programme, roster and attendance rolls were not available for verification.
- 41. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (100 seats) of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital and Research Centre, Jaring, Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that the Institute has admitted students for 2014-2015 pursuant to order of Hon'ble Supreme Court after filing undertaking. However, the Council has not received the copy of the undertaking from the college authorities. The Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain a copy of the Undertaking from the college authorities as per the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court.

In view of the deficiencies listed above, it is amply evident that the institute has failed to rectify previous deficiencies which are still persisting.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the order of Hon'ble Apex Court dt. 18/09/2014 & 25/092014, the operative part of which reads as under:

"The relevant portion of the order dated 18.09.2014 passed in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014 by the Hon'ble Supreme Court is reproduced hereunder:-

" Heard the learned senior counsel appearing for both the sides.

Looking at the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case and, especially, when several seats for medical admission are likely to remain vacant for the academic year 2014-15, we are of the view that these matters require urgent consideration and we are

giving these interim directions under the provisions of Article 142 of the Constitution of India

There is one more reason for passing this interim order. We are conscious of the fact that number of physicians in our country is much less than what is required and because of non-renewal of recognition of several medical colleges, our citizens would be deprived of a good number of physicians and therefore, we are constrained to pass this order, whereby at least there would be some increase in the number of physicians after five years. We are running against time because the last date for giving admissions to MBBS Course for the academic year 2014-15 is 30th September, 2014.

We also desire to reconsider the directions given by this Court in the judgment of Priya Gupta v. State of Chhattisgarh [(2012) 7 SCC 433], but at this juncture, as we do not have sufficient time to decide all these petitions finally, we are passing this interim order and the matter with regard to reconsideration of the aforestated judgment would be considered while finally disposing of this group of petitions.

It has been submitted on behalf of the learned senior counsel appearing for all the petitioners/ respondents, who are managing medical colleges, that the defects which had been recorded at the time of the last inspection by the representatives of the Medical Council of India have been duly rectified and at present, the defects pointed out in the reports do not exist. The said fact can be ascertained only by having a fresh Compliance Verification/Inspection. However, the stand taken by the Central Government and the Medical Council of India is to the effect that no such inspection can be undertaken in the present academic session because of paucity of time and it would violate the time schedule laid down by this Court in the case of Priya Gupta (supra).

The learned senior counsel appearing for the Medical Council of India has also submitted that the petitioners do not have any legal right for getting renewal of the recognition, especially in view of the fact that the Verification/Inspection Reports are not available for the period in question. The learned senior counsel has relied upon some of the Judgments to substantiate his case and according to him, it would not be just and proper to permit the said medical colleges to take fresh batch of students.

Looking at the peculiar facts of the case and the circumstances stated hereinabove, we direct the petitioners to file undertakings by President/Chairman and Secretary of the petitioners' institutions running medical colleges within 10 days from today, to the effect that there is no defect in the medical colleges run by them and they would also state that their deposit with the MCI, which is around Rs.10 Crores, be forfeited by way of penalty if the statement made in the undertaking is found to be incorrect at the time of the next inspection. A draft undertaking has been given to this Court. A copy of the undertaking, which might be filed by the institutions, shall be served upon the office of the Medical Council of India as well as to the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Govt. of India, New Delhi.

We also record the fact that in the recent past, the Medical Council of India has renewed recognition of Government Medical Colleges on the basis of undertakings and therefore, we see no reason not to permit the private colleges to admit students on the basis of undertakings given by their office bearer as a special case.

Notwithstanding any direction given in the case of Priya Gupta (supra), if undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by the institutions managing medical colleges for the academic year 2014-15, admissions shall be given to the students from the merit list prepared by the States and they shall be charged fees prescribed by the Government Medical Colleges of their respective States. The State Authorities, i.e., the Directorate of Medical Education & Research, of the respective States shall send students, in order of their merit, to the medical colleges run by the petitioners, which are situated within their States, within one week from the date of receipt of a copy of this order and the said students shall be admitted to the MBBS Course in accordance with the rules and regulations of the MCI and also regulations dated 16.04.2010 framed by the Medical Council of India, provided undertakings as mentioned above are filed on behalf of the concerned institutions.

It is also clarified that there would be no further counseling in respect of the students who are to be given admission, even if it might result into some heartburning among other students, but in the peculiar facts of the case, we give this direction.

In no case, the admission shall be given after 30thSeptember, 2014. This order shall also apply to all the institutions which had filed their petitions earlier for renewal of their recognition for the academic year2014-15, but their petitions were rejected or withdrawn for whatever reason, provided undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by President/Chairman and the Secretary of those institutions. All those petitions shall be deemed to have been revived and this order shall be deemed to have been passed in

those cases also. This order shall only be in respect of renewal of recognition and not for creation of additional seats or for new colleges.

We also record that the Union of India has supported the petitioners in the interest of students. We also direct the Union of India to give wide publicity to this order in print as well as electronic media in the interest of the concerned students.

It is directed that the list of students getting admission I pursuance of this order shall be placed on record of this Court by 1st October, 2014 by the concerned institutions and a copy thereof shall also be sent to the MCI.

These matters shall be treated as part-heard and shall be notified for further hearing in the month of December, 2014."

The Hon'ble Supreme Court thereafter vide its order dated 25.09.2014 issued certain clarification in respect to the order dated 18.09.2014 in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014, which are reproduced hereunder:-

"After hearing the learned counsel for the parties we deem it appropriate to issue following clarifications with regard to our earlier order dated 18th September, 2014. These clarifications shall be read into the said order as if they were always part thereof:-

- 1. The order dated 18th September, 2014 shall also apply to cases where colleges or institutions were seeking increase in intake capacity and in the current year have been denied permission to admit students after first or second or third or fourth renewal/inspection. In our view such institutions where Renewal/Inspection with respect to increase in capacity were conducted in the present academic year are also entitled to the benefit under the order dated 18th September, 2014.
- 2. We also clarify that fees chargeable from the students admitted pursuant to our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall be at the same rates as applicable to the students in Government medical colleges in respective States and such fees shall be at the same levels as that of the Government medical colleges till the students so admitted pass out from the private medical colleges or institutions.
- 3. Our order shall also apply to all similarly situated institutions irrespective of the fact whether any petitions were or are pending in this Court or in any of the High Courts or even if they had not approached any court at all. This order shall also apply even in cases where there were orders of stay in favour of the Medical Council of India restraining the colleges from admitting students for the current academic session.
- 4. The order shall not apply to colleges or institutions which have been disqualified by the Medical Council of India and/or the Central Government and have been prohibited from making any admissions for the current academic year 2014-15.
- 5. In cases where two separate lists are prepared and sent by the State agencies one relating to State quota and the other relating to management quota in private institutions, we clarify that for the current academic year there shall be only one list and that shall be the "State quota" alone. There shall not be any management quota list to be sent to the private colleges or institutions taking the benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014. The Management quota shall also be filled through the State list and the fees chargeable for the management quota shall also be charged at the same levels and rates as applicable to State quota list.
- 6. We further clarify that private institutions taking benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall have to take students only from the State agencies and at fees chargeable for students in Government medical colleges as stated above, regardless of their status or claim as Minority Institutions or Deemed Universities."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to invoke/forfeit the Bank Guarantees submitted by the Institute and directed the Institute to submit fresh bank guarantee within 2 weeks.

In view of the ongoing enquiry conducted by the C.B.I., Bhubaneshwar, the Executive Committee of the Council deemed it appropriate that the copy of the inspection report be sent to C.B.I., Bhubaneshwar for their information and record.

9. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Thane, Maharashtra by Saraswati Education Society, Mumbai, Maharashtra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Thane, Maharashtra by Saraswati Education Society, Mumbai, Maharashtra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

"In response to MCI's letter dated 28/01/2015 and 29/01/2015, the Council Office has received a letter dated 06/02/2015(received on 11/02/2015) from the Secretary, Saraswati Education Society, Thane stating therein as under:-

"With reference to above mentioned subject and your above mentioned letter, we are hereby withdrawing the application for establishment of new medical college at Vikramgad, Thane for the academic year 2015-2016.

Kindly accept our application and guide us for further any documentation required by your good office. "

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of new medical college at Thane, Maharashtra by Saraswati Education Society, Mumbai, Maharashtra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of scheme as there is no provision in the Act or regulations to keep it pending. It was further decided that Shri Gaurav Sharma, Council Advocate be apprised of the matter with a request to place it before Hon'ble Supreme Court.

10. Re-admission in MBBS course after availing long leave.

Read: the matter with regard to re-admission in MBBS course after availing long leave.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the matter with regard to re-admission of Ms. George Nisha TK George, Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute, Thrissur after long leave was placed before the Executive Committee of this Council at its meeting held on 1/10/2014 and the Committee decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 7/6/2014 of the Registrar, University of Calicut with regard to re-admission of Ms. George Nisha TK George, Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute, Thrissur and decided to allow Ms. George Nisha TK in the MBBS course since she was admitted to final MBBS course during 2013 after availing long leave on medical grounds.

Further, the Executive Committee decided that a policy needs to be formulated regarding joining/re-admission of candidates to MBBS course and to obtain legal opinion on what should be the duration of the leave allowed."

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the opinion of Law Officer, the operative part of which reads as under:

"Clause 12 (1) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 provides as under:-

"ATTENDANCE: 75% attendance in a subject for appearing in the examination is compulsory inclusive of attendance in non-lecture teaching i.e. seminars, group discussions, tutorials, demonstrations, practicals, hospital (Tertiary Secondary, Primary) posting and bed side clinics etc."

As such the concept of leave of any kind whatsoever was not envisaged in the MBBS course. Further, the Regulations do not provide for any time-limit in which the MBBS course is required to be completed. Hence, for an MBBS student, who owing to an exigency/exceptional circumstances has left the course in between, can be permitted to resume his studies from the point from where he had left the course. The course can be completed by him after meeting the attendance requirement. In this regard, no duration for the gap period is required to be provided for, as the Regulations do not prescribe the time duration in which the MBBS course of four and a half years with an additional internship of one year is required to be completed."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to allow the application of these three (3) candidates and permit them to resume their studies.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided that the office be directed to frame Regulations in this regard.

11. <u>Increase in MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur, Maharashtra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase in MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur, Maharashtra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Institute vide its letter dt. 19/01/2015 has stated as under:

"... If the adjustment of fee is not possible, we are ready to submit a new DD Rs.2 lacs toward assessment fee."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 16.12.2014 since no fee has been received along with the application for the academic year 2015-16.

12. <u>Increase in MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at at People's College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase in MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at at People's College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the format of Essentiality Certificate prescribed for application for increase to 200 seats vide amendment to Opening of New or Higher Course of Study or Training (Including Postgraduate Course of Study or Training) and Increase of Admission Capacity in any Course of Study or Training Regulations, 2000 dated 16/04/2010 contains the certificate to be issued by State Government as under:

"It is certified that:-

- (a) It is desirable to increase the annual intake in MBBS course to 200/250 seats in public interest.
- (b) Increasing the annual intake in MBBS course to 200/250 seats by ------ (the name of Institution) is feasible.
- (c) The institute has ----- number of teaching beds with the standing of ----- years.
- (d) The average OPD strength per day is ------

(e) The average bed occupancy is -----%

(f) The affiliated teaching hospital is unitary in character.

(g) The number of teaching beds, average OPD strength and average bed occupancy available at ------ (name of Institute) is not less than the criteria prescribed under the "Opening of a New or Higher Course of Study or Training (including Postgraduate course of Study or Training) and increase of Admission Capacity in any course of Study or Training (including a Postgraduate course of Study or Training) Regulation, 2000" as notified in the Gazette of India vide Notification dated 9th December, 2009. It is further certified that in case the applicant fails to create infrastructure for the course as per MCI norms and fresh admissions are stopped by the Central Government, the State Government shall take over the responsibility of the students already admitted in the above course at this college with the permission of the Central Government."

Perusal of Essentiality Certificate issued by the State Government dt. 20/01/2015 revealed that the information at clauses (d), (e), (f) and (g) mentioned above is not incorporated in the Essentiality Certificate dt. 20/01/2015 issued by the State Government and to that extent it is defective.

The Executive Committee of the Council also noted that for increase in admission capacity to 200/250 MBBS Admissions Annually the Opening of a New or High Course of Study or Training (including Postgraduate Course of Study or Training) and Increase of Admission Capacity in any Course of Study or Training (including Postgraduate Course of Study or Training) 2000 prescribes that the number of teaching beds not less than 900 with standing of not less than 10 years.

The Executive Committee noted the following decision of the erstwhile Board of Governors in Super-session of the Council and the judicial decisions in respect of these cases.

A. Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore had applied for increase in intake from 150 to 250 from the academic year 2012-13. Their application was inter alia disapproved by the Board of Governors on 03.08.12 on the ground that the College was granted letter of permission from 100 seats on 08.08.2002 for starting of MBBS course. Accordingly, the erstwhile Board of Governors had observed that the College would complete 10 years of standing only after 08.08.2012 and the teaching beds would come into being only after teaching starts in a Medical College. They had observed that the teaching in a Medical College would not have commenced prior to the grant of letter of permission. Therefore, that Medical College did not fulfil the condition qualifying the applicant for making an application for increase in admission capacity from 150 to 250 without completing 10 years of standing in terms of teaching beds. Aggrieved by this Order, the College had preferred WP No. 27726/2012. This Writ Petition came with the Writ Appeal No. 3957/2012 filed by the Council against the Order dated 12.07.2012 in WP No. 18514/2012. The Learned Division Bench of the Hon'ble High Court had on 11.09.2012 allowed the Petition of the College and had directed the MCI to forthwith grant permission to the Petitioner- Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore to increase its intake of students for MBBS course upto 250 even for the current academic year 2012-13. This decision of the Hon'ble High Court was challenged by the Council before the Hon'ble Supreme Court by way of CA No. 7755-7756/2012. On 04.01.2013 the Hon'ble Supreme Court had held that "In the facts and circumstances of the present case, we are of the opinion that the High Court ought not to have directed for increase of seats upto 250 for the academic year 2012-13." The Hon'ble Supreme Court had set aside the impugned judgment and order passed by the High Court and the appeal of the MCI was allowed.

B. S.B.K.S. Medical Institute and Research Centre, Vadodara, Gujarat The SBKS Medical Institute and Research Centre, Vadodara, Gujarat had applied for increase in intake from 150 to 250 for the academic year 2012-13. The erstwhile Board of Governors vide their decision conveyed vide Council letter dated 27.06.12 had disapproved the scheme submitted by the College as it "did not qualify the criteria of submission of application, i.e. the existence of teaching hospital for 10 years as the first Letter of Permission for standing of medical college was issued on 30/09/2008." The College had challenged this decision before the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi by way of WP (C) No. 3940/2012. The Hon'ble High Court had upheld the decision of the Board of Governors, and it would be useful to extract paragraph 56 of the said judgment herein below:-

"The second submission made by counsel for the petitioner that it is not necessary that 10 years are to be counted from the date of LOI, is without any force. The letter of permission was granted to the petitioner, college on 30.9.2003 by the Central Government. The interpretation sought to be given by the counsel for the petitioner that it is not necessary that the hospital should have been attached to a medical college for 10 years is not an essential criteria, is also without any force, as teaching bed would come into existence only after teaching commences in any medical college. In the absence of any document to certify the state of the hospital which was being run by the petitioner in the year 1999 and 2000 which was admittedly a dental hospital and a physiotherapy course cannot be a benchmark as the MCI, would be in no position to certify the condition / infrastructure of the hospital, and thus, the only interpretation which can be given is that the hospital should have been a teaching hospital and not from the date any hospital was established. Merely because the petitioner was running a dental college and a physiotherapy course, it cannot be treated as a teaching hospital for the purposes of the increase in number of seats. On the contrary there is force in the submission made by Mr. Kumar, counsel for the respondent that every hospital treated as a teaching hospital for the purposes of the increase in number of seats. On the contrary there is force in the submission made by Mr. Kumar, counsel for the respondent that every hospital cannot be treated as a teaching hospital until it fulfils the statutory pre-conditions. At the time of establishment of a proposed medical college, the word teaching hospital has not been used and the Regulation contemplates a mere hospital in existence with the college, which is capable of being developed into a teaching institution. I am of the view that a hospital cannot be considered a teaching hospital from a time prior to when teaching and training of MBBS students had not started in the hospital."

In view of the aforesaid, the Executive Committee is of the considered view that the People's College of Medical Sciences was granted letter of permission on 13.07.2005. Therefore, as on 31.08.2014, i.e., the last date of making application to the Central Government for the increase in intake capacity the College did not fulfill the qualifying criteria of 10 years of standing and the teaching beds would come into being only after teaching starts in a Medical College.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme for increase in MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at People's College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the Academic Year 2015-16.

13. <u>Increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 in Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar, from the academic year 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 in Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar, from the academic year 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused opinion of Law Officer in the matter, operative part of which reads as under:

"The file of the Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences for increase of seats from 150 to 250 has been referred for my opinion in the context of letter dated 05.02.15 received from the Central Government. The Central Government has in its letter referred to the Order dated 20.08.14 of the Hon'ble High Court of Hyderabad and requested the Council to clarify the factual inaccuracies pointed out by the Institute.

- 1. The Order under reference is of the Hon'ble High Court of Hyderabad in WPMP No. 277075 of 2014 in WP No. 22090 of 2014 Prathima Educational Society vs. MCI & Ors. By order dated 20.08.14, the Hon'ble Court had disposed of the said Petition alongwith five other such Petitions. The Hon'ble Court had directed that:
 - "17. In view of the direction of the Supreme Court in PRIYA GUPTA, the claim of the petitioners to permit them to admit students for the academic year 2014-15 as desired by them by directing the Government of India to grant them permissions required for the present academic year and to permit them to participate in the counseling for admission cannot be granted, since the last date to grant such permissions expired on 15.07.14.
 - 18. However, the process of evaluation of the suitability of the petitioners for running MBBS course or enhancing the intake capacity can be continued. This would at-least militates against similar scenario developing for the next academic year. Thus, having prima facie found that the actions of the Medical Council of India and Government of India are contrary to the mandate of Medical Council of India Act and the public interest, the orders of Government of India dated 15.07.2014 rejecting the request of respective petitioners is suspended and the Government of India is directed to reconsider the claim of the petitioners to continue to administer the course of study leading to awarding degrees in MBBS/ to increase the intake capacity in the course of study leading to awarding MBBS degree strictly in accordance with Medical Council of India Act and after duly considering the compliance reports/objections on the reports of Medical Council of India submitted by the petitioners, take a decision as warranted by law and in larger public interest, as expeditiously as possible, preferably within a period of six weeks from the date of receipt of copy of this order. However, it is made clear that even if the Government of India takes decision in favour of the petitioners, petitioner' colleges are not entitled to admit students for the academic year 2014-2015."
- 2. It is also pertinent to mention that subsequently by Orders dated 18.09.14 and 25.09.14 the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Hind Charitable Trust and connected matters any relief to Colleges that were in the establishment phase or for first time increase was denied.
- 3. The effect of the aforesaid Order of the Hon'ble High Court of Hyderabad in which directions were made to the Central Government is that the application made by the College for increase in seats from 150 to 250 or the academic year 2014-15 stands revived for consideration for 2015-16. It is pertinent to note that in certain other cases, the application by orders of the Hon'ble Court for the past academic year has been directed to be considered for the subsequent academic year and the Council has considered/processed such applications. Hence, as in compliance with the directions of the Hon'ble High Court the Central Government has forwarded the application/representation of

the College, the Council is in my opinion required to further process the matter for academic year 2015-16."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council directed the office to write to the Institute to remit processing fees for consideration of the application for Academic Year 2015-2016 within period of 7 days and to process the application for further necessary action upon receipt of the same.

14. <u>Anugrah Narayan Magadh Medical College, Gaya – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Anugrah Narayan Magadh Medical College, Gaya – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (2nd & 3rd February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 58 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Bed occupancy is 52 % on day of assessment.
- 3. Radiological & laboratory investigation workload is inadequate on day of assessment.
- 4. OPD: Registration counters are not computerized. Only 2 examination rooms are available in major departments against requirement of 4 rooms in each department. Capacity of teaching area is inadequate. Injection room for males/females are not available. Facilities in Paediatric & O.G. OPD are inadequate.
- 5. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available.
- 6. Teaching Beds: No beds are available for Psychiatry, Skin & VD, ENT.
- 7. Wards: Ancillary facilities like Doctors' duty room, Pantry are not available in several wards. Demonstration room is not available in any ward except O.G. wards. They are congested, crowded, stinking & filthy. Nursing stations are not proper. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m.
- 8. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not used for indexing of diseases.
- 9. Casualty: Disaster Trolley, Ventilator, defibrillator are not available.
- 10. O.T.: Syringe pump & Infusion pump are not available.
- 11. ICUs: ICUs are not maintained properly. Beds are there but not organized. Only 1 patient was there in NICU on day of assessment.
- 12. Labour Room: Septic labour room & Eclampsia room are not available.
- 13. Only 1 functional mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations.
- 14. Only 2 functional static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations.
- 15. CSSD: It is not properly maintained. There is no one in charge. No one was available to provide data.
- 16. Area of Principal's office, College office & Council hall are smaller than required.
- 17. MEU: No workshop in Medical Education technology has been conducted by the institute during the year.
- 18. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available. There are no inbuilt audiovisual aids.
- 19. Central Library: Available area is only 776 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. as per Regulations. Total seating capacity is 100 against requirement of 100 each in Students' reading room (outside) & Students' reading room (inside).
- 20. Students' Hostels: They are poorly maintained, dirty and do not have Visitors' room, A.C. study room with computer facilities & Internet.
- 21. Residential quarters for teaching faculty are inadequate.

- 22. Central Clinical Laboratory: Separate sections into various departments are not available.
- 23. Intercom is not available.
- 24. Anatomy department: Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Students' Histopathology laboratory is shared with Physiology department. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 25. Physiology department: Amphibian laboratory is not available. Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Students' laboratory is shared with Anatomy department. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 26. Biochemistry department: Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 27. Pathology department: Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 28. Microbiology department: Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 29. Pharmacology department: Faculty offices are inadequate.
- 30. Forensic Medicine department: Autopsy room is very poorly maintained. Capacity of Demonstration room is smaller than required. Overall space is grossly inadequate.
- 31. RHTC: It is not under total control of Dean. Residential accommodation is under renovation.
- 32. UHC: It is not under total control of Dean.
- 33. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Anugrah Narayan Magadh Medical College, Gaya under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna for the academic year 2015-16.

15. <u>Late Shri Bhaliram Kashyap Memorial, NDMC Medical College, Jagdalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Late Shri Bhaliram Kashyap Memorial, NDMC Medical College, Jagdalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (3rd & 4th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 26.72 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 54.28 % as detailed in report.
- 3. There were only 3 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment. Daily average is 6.
- 4. Radiological & laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 5. Casualty: Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 6. Only 2 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations.
- 7. There is no Central Oxygen or Suction in the present hospital.
- 8. Anatomy department: Only 93 specimens are available.
- 9. RHTC: It is under control of DHS, Chhatisgarh and not under Dean which is not as per Regulations. Residential accommodation is not in working condition. Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 10. UHC: It is under control of DHS, Chhatisgarh and not under Dean which is not as per Regulations. Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 11. ICCU has only 4 beds against requirement of 5.
- 12. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not used for indexing.

- 13. Website is not available.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Late Shri Bhaliram Kashyap Memorial, NDMC Medical College, Jagdalpur under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur, Chhattisgarh for the academic year 2015-16.

16. <u>U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (3rd & 4th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of residents is 12.85 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah under Chattrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur for the academic year 2015-16.

17. <u>Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (30th & 31st January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.90 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 44.76 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD: Equipped teaching area is not available in most of the OPDs. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dressing room/Minor procedure room is not available.
- 4. Speech therapy is not available.
- 5. Wards: Demonstration rooms are available in departments and not in all wards.
- 6. There are only 8 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 7. Casualty: Pulse Oxymeter, Disaster Trolley, Crash Cart, Defibrillator, Ventilator are not available.
- 8. Labour room: Separate septic labour room is not available.
- 9. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations. Only 2 functional static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. CT is outsourced. AERB approval is not available. Log book is not maintained.

- Only 1 USG is functional against requirement of 2 as per Regulations. PNDT approval is not available.
- 10. CSSD: Receiving & Distribution points are not separate. ETO sterilizer is not available. Staff is inadequate.
- 11. Lecture Theaters: E class facility is available in only 1 lecture theater. There are broken seats in one lecture theater.
- 12. Central Library: Available area is 755 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. Capacity of students' reading room (outside) is only 20 against requirement of 100 as per Regulations.
- 13. MRD: It is not available as such. After discharge, records of patients are kept in the concerned departments and not in one central place. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing. Statistician is not available.
- 14. Nursing staff: 224 Nurses are available against requirement of 233.
- 15. Anatomy department: Only 1 Demonstration room of capacity 40 is available against requirement of 2 rooms of 50-60 each. Histopathology laboratory is smaller than required.
- 16. Physiology department: Capacity of the Demonstration room is only 30 against requirement of 50-60. Audiovisual aids are not available. Amphibian laboratory is not available.
- 17. Biochemistry department: Capacity of the Demonstration room is only 30 against requirement of 50-60. Audiovisual aids are not available. Equipment in laboratory is inadequate.
- 18. Pathology department: Research laboratory is not well equipped. No research is going on. Clinical pathology laboratory is in hospital.
- 19. Microbiology department: Capacity of the Demonstration room is only 30 against requirement of 50-60. Audiovisual aids are not available. Media preparation room is not available. Service laboratory rooms in the college are non-functional. Museum is not available.
- 20. Pharmacology department: Capacity of the Demonstration room is only 40 against requirement of 50-60. Audiovisual aids are not available. Specimens & Models are not available. Departmental library has mostly old books.
- 21. Forensic medicine department: Capacity of the Demonstration room is only 20 against requirement of 50-60. Audiovisual aids are not available. Departmental library has mostly old books.
- 22. RHTC is not under control of Dean. Temperature chart for cold chain equipment is not maintained.
- 23. UHC is not under control of Dean.
- 24. Website: Information is incomplete.
- 25. Central photography Section is not available.
- 26. Intercom is not available.
- 28. Students' Hostel: A.C., Computer & Internet, TV are not available.
- 29. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 60-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University, Madhya Pradesh for the academic year 2015-16.

18. <u>Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (4th & 5th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 23.60 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: Injection room is common for males/females. Dressing room is shared in Minor O.T. Separate plaster cutting room is not available. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dark room is not available.
- 3. Wards: Pantry is not available in many wards. Space between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Wards are poorly maintained except Paediatrics & O.G. wards.
- 4. C.T. scan workload is NIL.
- 5. Casualty: Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 6. Only 4 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations.
- 7. CT scan is not available.
- 8. CSSD: It is grossly inadequate. ETO Sterilizer is not available. Staff is inadequate.
- 9. MRD: Statistician is not available.
- 10. Examination hall cum Auditorium: Available area is 510 sq.m. against requirement of 1,200 sq.m.
- 11. Lecture Theaters: Lecture Theater of capacity 350 is not available. Facility for E class is not available. Audiovisual aids are not mounted.
- 12. Central Library: Available area is 200 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. as per Regulations. Capacity of Students' reading Room (Outside) & Students' reading Room (Inside) is 60 & 20 respectively against requirement of 150 each. Capacity of staff reading room is only 10 against requirement of 30.
- 13. Boys' common room does not have attached toilets.
- 14. Students' Hostel: Toilet facilities are inadequate. Hygiene is poor. Electricity wires are all open and dangling. There is no security.
- 15. Interns' Hostel: Separate Interns' hostel is not available.
- 16. Residents' Hostel: Accommodation is available for 51 against requirement of 115 as per Regulations.
- 17. Residential Quarters: 25 quarters are available against requirement of 30 as per Regulations.
- 18. Anatomy department: MRI/CT films are not available in museum. Storage space for dead bodies is inadequate.
- 19. Biochemistry department: Laboratory seats are less than required.
- 20. Microbiology department: 1 Demonstration Room is available against requirement of 2. Microscopes are less than required. Laboratory seats are less by 15.
- 21. Pharmacology department: 1 Demonstration Room is available against requirement of 2. Museum is grossly deficient in content.
- 22. Forensic Medicine department: No Demonstration room is available. Lighting is inadequate in Mortuary. There is only 1 room. Doctors' room, Inquest room Visitors' room are not available. There is no running water supply. Viewing gallery is inadequate.
- 23. Community Medicine department: Capacity of Demonstration is less than required.
- 24. RHTC: Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 25. Website: Information is incomplete.
- 26. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Gajra Raja Medical College, Gwalior under Jiwaji University, Gwalior for the academic year 2015-16.

19. <u>Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (4th & 5th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 31.64 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 31.8 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. ICUs: SICU is not available.
- 4. Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations.
- 5. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations.
- 6. CT is non-functional.
- 7. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 8. Central Library: Available area is 465 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. as per Regulations. Capacity of Students' Reading Room (Outside) & Students' Reading Room (Inside) is 75 & 50 respectively against requirement of 100 each. Capacity of staff reading room is only 10 against requirement of 20. Librarian is not available.
- 9. OPD: Same room is utilized for Plaster fixing & Plaster cutting. In Ophthalmology, one room is used as dark room / refraction room alternatively.
- 10. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not used for indexing of diseases.
- 11. Anatomy department: Space for museum is inadequate with poor lighting. There are no catalogues. Mortuary cooling chambers cabinet & Band saw are not functional.
- 12. Microbiology department: Seats in practical laboratory is less.
- 13. Pharmacology department: Section of "History of Medicine" is not available in museum. There are no catalogues.
- 14. Forensic Medicine department: Museum is without catalogues, slides & photographs. Cold storage facility is not available.
- 15. Community Medicine department: Catalogues are not available in the museum.
- 16. RHTC & UHC are under control of Civil Surgeon & not under Dean which is not as per Regulations.
- 17. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meeting has been held during the year.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna for the academic year 2015-16.

20. <u>BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (3rd & 4th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 22.2 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations. Only 4 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. AERB approval is not available. Only 2 USG are available against requirement of 3 as per regulations.
- 3. CT Scan is outsourced.
- 4. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture theater is not of gallery type.
- 5. Central Library: Capacity of Students' reading room (inside) is only 50 against requirement of 100 as per Regulations. Staff reading room has capacity of 100. Internet nodes are only 15. Librarian is not available.
- 6. Wards: Pantry is not available in any ward.
- 7. MRD: It is partly computerized. Statistician is not available.
- 8. Anatomy department: Audiovisual aids are not working.
- 9. RHTC: Control is with Public Health department and not with Dean which is not as per Regulations. Residential accommodation is in very poor condition. Mess is not available.
- 10. UHC: Control is with Public Health department and not with Dean which is not as per Regulations.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur under Deen Dayal Upadhaya Gorakhpur University, Gorakhpur for the academic year 2015-16.

21. Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University's Medical College, Sangli – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University's Medical College, Sangli – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8th & 9th December, 2014) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 11.53 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Bed occupancy was 60 % on day of assessment.
- 3. Radiological Investigations: Workload of special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 4. Daily average Histopathological workload in last 3 months is only 4 / day which has suddenly increased to 20 on day of assessment.
- 5. Cytopathology: manual register is not maintained.
- Manual register kept in common collection center showed entries of only 22 blood samples on day of assessment. 1. Examination hall cum Auditorium: It is in 3 parts Examination Hall of 324 sq.m., Auditorium I of 699 sq.m. & Auditorium II of 186 sq.m.
- 7. OPD: There is no laboratory in Skin & VD OPD.
- 8. Wards: Nursing station is situated outside the wards. There is no side laboratory in several wards.
- 9. There were only 9 major operations in the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 10. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University's Medical College, Sangli under Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University, Pune for the academic year 2015-16 and further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which reads as under:-

8(3)(1).....

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> <u>and/or running postgraduate courses</u>

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <80%, such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses."

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2015-16) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

22. <u>Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer– Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer–Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (20th & 21st January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of residents is 18.25 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: Registration counters are not computerized.
- 3. Anatomy department: Only 90 specimens are available in the museum.
- 4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Ajmer under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur for the academic year 2015-16.

23. Approval of the minutes of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 15th & 16th January, 2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 15th & 16th January, 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 15th & 16th January, 2015 except item nos. 5 & 11. It was decided by the Committee to refer back the item with following observations:-

Item No.5

Attention of Ethics Committee is drawn to the provisions of IMC Act under which there is no provision for expiry of registration. It is further advised that it is a well settled principle in law that when there is a conflict between law passed by Parliament and State Legislature, the former shall prevail. The Ethics Committee should obtain legal opinion on this issue of expiry of registration and then should proceed further.

Item No. 11.

From the facts narrated in the decision, it is not clear whether this was the first baby or subsequent baby and what was the blood group of the husband. It is also not mentioned why exchange transfusion was not done. The case is remanded to Ethics Committee to decide afresh in light of these observations.

24. <u>Consideration of various proposals/recommendations/suggestions</u> submitted by the Members of the Council

Read: the matter with regard to various proposals /recommendations/suggestions submitted by the Members of the Council.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council at its ensuing meeting.

25. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of P.K Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of P.K Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (05th & 06th January, 2015) and assessment report (11th & 12th February, 2015) alongwith the representation/memorandum dated 11/02/2015 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 50.43 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 88.23 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 24.33 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Casualty attendance was only 1 patient in Casualty ward during 24 hour period on day of assessment.
- 5. Data provided by the institution shows bed occupancy to be average 200 on 9th& 10th February 2015 (i.e. 1-2 days before assessment) and on 11th& 12th February 2015 (i.e. days of assessment) are wrong and inflated as bed occupancy was only 24.33 % on first day of assessment.
- 6. There was only 1 Major & 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 7. There was no delivery Normal or Caesarean on day of assessment.

- 8. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in NICU/PICU and 2 patients each in ICCU & SICU on day of assessment.
- 9. Nursing staff: Only 116 Nurses are available against requirement of 175 as per Regulations.
- 10. Number of patients shown in OPD by the institute are grossly inflated. On physical verification of different OPDs, there were scanty patients and more than 50 % faculty/Residents were not available in OPD.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch (150 seats) of P.K Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

26. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (05th & 06th January, 2015) and assessment report (10th & 11th February, 2015) alongwith alongwith letter/representation dated 11/02/2015 received from the Principal, Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 53.77 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 91.46 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 44 % on day of assessment.
- 4. OPD attendance: Data given by the hospital is inflated. It is shown as 791 on 10/02/2015 (i.e. day of assessment); however on verification from OPD registers, it was observed to be 362 on 09/02/2015 and 128 till 1:00 p.m. on 10/02/2015.
- 5. There were only total 4 Major operations & NIL Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Normal delivery & only 1 Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 7. Data of Radiological & Biochemistry workloads are not matching with actual workload.
- 8. ICUs: There is no ABG Analyzer in any of the ICUs. There was NIL patient in PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
- 9. CSSD: No information regarding utilization of sterilized material was given in spite of repeated requests.
- 10. Pathology department: laboratories are nonfunctional.

- 11. O.T. & Central Clinical laboratories have no entries for many days. Registers have empty space in between. Institute tried to fabricate date from 02/02/2015 to 09/02/2015.
- 12. Clinical case sheets have no/inadequate notes.
- 13. Verification of Attendance Register reveals that faculty & residents have not signed for many days.
- 14. Wards: There is no Nursing station in separate wings in several wards. Examination cum treatment room is not functional/ill equipped in several wards. Pantry is not available in any ward. Doctors duty room is not available in several wards. Store room is not available or if available, contains junk chairs, etc. and is nonfunctional.
- 15. There is no Lecture Theater in the hospital.
- 16. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: Measurements are not provided by the institute; hence it cannot be verified whether adequate or not.
- 17. Central Photography section is not available.
- 18. Students' Hostels: Visitors' room is not furnished. A.C. study room with computer & Internet and Recreation room are not available.
- 19. Residents' Hostel: Visitors' room is not furnished. A.C. study room with computer & Internet and Recreation room are not available.
- 20. Measurements of the Hospital offices, OPD waiting area have not been provided by the institute.
- 21. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are not available.
- 22. Recreational facilities are inadequate. Gymnasium & Indoor Games are not available.
- 23. Anatomy department: Cold storage facilities are available only for 8 bodies against requirement of 15.
- 24. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch (150 seats) of Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

27. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Great Eastern Medical School & Hospital, Ragolu, Srikakulam, A.P. for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Great Eastern Medical School & Hospital, Ragolu, Srikakulam, A.P. for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (11th & 12th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 8.8 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 18 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed Occupancy was 60 % against requirement of 75 % as per Regulations on day of assessment. There is some discrepancy noted between the data of previous monthly average & that found actually on the day of assessment.
- 4. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation for the whole hospital on day of assessment. No patients were seen in Postoperative ward on day of assessment.
- 5. There was only 1 Normal delivery & NIL Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 6. Radiological & Laboratory Investigation workload is inadequate.
- 7. There was NIL patient in MICU & NICU/PICU and only 1 patient each in ICCU & SICU which is grossly inadequate.
- 8. Radiodiagnosis department: Details of AERB approval are not provided.
- 9. Lecture Theaters: One lecture theater is not fully constructed or furnished. Lecture theaterin the hospital is not of gallery type. There is no facility for E class.
- 10. Central Photography Section: No equipment is available. Photographer is not available.
- 11. Students' Hostels: Visitors' room, A.C. study room with computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 12. Interns' Hostels: They are under construction.
- 13. Residents' Hostel: Accommodation is available for only 60 against requirement of 85 as per Regulations.
- 14. Nurses' Hostel: It is not available.
- 15. Residential Quarters: No quarters are available for non-teaching staff as they are under construction.
- 16. Teaching Beds: Orthopaedics male ward is under construction; resultantly 30 beds in male Orthopaedics ward are not available.
- 17. Central Kitchen is under construction. Dietician is not available.
- 18. Anatomy department: Only 100 specimens are available. There are no MRI/CT films in the museum.
- 19. Physiology department: Audiovisual aids are not available in Demonstration Room.
- 20. Pathology department: Only 3 catalogues are available in the museum.
- 21. Microbiology department: Service laboratories are not fully functional.
- 22. Pharmacology department: Museum facilities are inadequate.
- 23. Community Medicine department: Audiovisual aids are not available in Demonstration Room.
- 24. RHTC: It is under dual control of Govt. of Andhra Pradesh & institute which is not as per Regulations. Messing facilities are not available. There is no record of students being posted at RHTC. Specialists' visits are not organized. No records of activities under National Health Programmes are available.
- 25. UHC: It is in a rented building conjoined with a private practitioner clinic and medical stores. There are no records of posting of students. Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 26. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Great Eastern Medical School & Hospital, Ragolu, Srikakulam, A.P. for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 1 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to take legal opinion with regard to apply of clause 8(3)(1)(b) of Establishment of Medical

College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which reads as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(b) <u>Colleges in the stage upto III renewal (i.e. Admission of fourth batch)</u> <u>till recognition of the institute for award of MBBS degree</u>.

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 20% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

28. Report of the Sub Committee regarding Fake Faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2014-15 where name of doctors appeared in more than one medical college.

Read: the matter with regard to report of the Sub Committee regarding Fake Faculty declaration forms for the academic year 2014-15 where name of doctors appeared in more than one medical college.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the report of the subcommittee and observed as under:

- (1) In several instances, D.F. from only 1 institute has been presented before the sub-committee. D.F. from the 2nd institute is stated to be not available. The office is directed to trace all such D.F. and submit the report incorporating such D.F., also stating the reasons for non-availability of D.F. of 2nd institute, and the circumstances of the disappearance of these D.F. to the sub-committee. This exercise should be completed within 4 weeks. The sub-committee should meet again and prepare a report and submit to the Executive Committee.
- (2) In several instances, the fact of his being present at assessment of the 1st institute has been clearly mentioned by the concerned faculty in his/her D.F. and yet was accepted as faculty by the assessors. This is clearly an error on part of assessors and the office is directed to issue a circular not to accept such faculty to all the coordinators, also requesting them to be more vigilant and brief properly their fellow assessors.
- (3) In respect of the following teachers, the matter be placed before Ethics Committee for further necessary action as it calls for further enquiry:

# in the Report	Name of Faculty
3	Dr. D.K. Sinha
6	Dr. A.K. Bajpai
7	Dr. BrijeshPurwar
10	Dr. Dharam Singh
13	Dr. M.S. Omar
14	Dr. M.W. Khan
15	Dr. M.J. Roderiguez
16	Dr. D.R. Padmanabha
17	Dr. S. Govind Rao
18	Dr. Chandan Kishore
19	Dr. Yuvraj Singh
24	Dr. S.C. Gupta
30	Dr. S.S. Tiwari
32	Dr. Rupendra Singh
33	Dr. Amit Punwar
34	Dr. A.K. Pankaj
35	Dr. C.N. Rao
37	Dr. Vinay Sharma

# in the Report	Name of Faculty
41	Dr. R.P. Agarwal
42	Dr. A.S. Jagtap
43	Dr. S.R. Joshi
44	Dr. M.K. Singh
45	Dr. V. Sudershan
47	Dr. M. Nandeesh
51	Dr. S.R. Bharadwaj
53	Dr. P. Doddamani
55	Dr. T.K. Anitha
57	Dr. M. Rama Rao
58	Dr. M. Shahid

29. Report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

Read: the matter with regard to report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

The Executive Committee of the Council accepted the report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

30. Ratio of "Must Know", "Desirable to Know" and "Nice to Know" in the "Undergraduate Curriculum".

Read: the matter with regard to ratio of "Must Know", "Desirable to Know" and "Nice to Know" in the "Undergraduate Curriculum".

The Executive Committee of the Council taken note that it at its meeting held on 20th November, 2014 approved the following recommendations of the Academic Committee:-

"The Academic Committee taking note of the appropriate recommendations made in the report of the task force on medical education constituted by the Govt. of India (2005) recommended that the ratio of "must know": "may know": "desirable to know" would be 6:3:1 on a 10 point scale and 60:30:10 on a 100 point scale."

Further, the Executive Committee of the Council ratified the decision taken by the Chairman, Academic Committee replacing the following as under:-

"Must Know", "Desirable to Know" and "Nice to Know" under the ratio of 6:3:1 at 10 point scale and 60:30:10 under 100 point scale"

31. National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

(1) The Dean of the institute vide letter dt. 12.02.2015 informed the team of assessors as under:

"We have requested to Govt. of India and MCI vide letter No. NIMSUNI/Reg/2014-15/823 dt. 27.10.2014 for conducting inspection

together for increase of seats and renewal of recognition of 100 seats. The same was recommended by Govt. of India vide their letter No. U.12012/914/2014-ME(P.II), dated November 20,2014 addressed to the Secretary, MCI. We have not received till date reply of the above request from MCI inspite of our several requests between October, 2014 to January 2015 and latest we have also sent a letter on January 19,2015 requesting MCi to conduct the inspection as per enclosed schedule in continuation of our above mentioned requests.

In view of above, sending the team of assessors consisting of Dr. P.V. Satyanarayana, Dr. Asha N. Shah and Dr. Pradeep Garg to conduct the assessment for increase of seats from 100 to 150 alone, on 12th and 13th Feb. 2015 will amount to not acceding to our repeated request made as above.

Hence, we request not to conduct the inspection on 12th and 13th Feb.2015 and follow the directives of the Govt. of India.

Note: Dr. N.S. Kothari, Principal & Controller is on casual leave today with the permission to leave headequarter."

(2) Dr. Polu Venkata Satyanarayana, Warangal (Co-ordinator), Dr. Asha N. Shah, Ahmedabad and Dr. Pradeep Garg, Rohtak, assessors vide letter dated 12.02.2015 have stated as under:-

"The assessors team consisting of the undersigned, Dr. Asha N Shah and Dr. Pradeep Garg reached the above mentioned institute at 9.45 a.m. on 12.2.15 and handed over the schedule of inspection to the Principal, NIMS. After accepting the inspection schedule of MCI, the college authorities including the Chairman did not co-operate in getting the inspection done and tried deliberately to delay the proceedings and even pressurized the team to accede to their request. When the team requested them not to interfere in the assessment process then they have a letter requesting not to conduct the inspection as schedule by MCI, the copy of which is enclosed. The team was forced to return back without conducting the assessment."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to Central Govt. not to renew permission for admission of 5th batch against increased intake from 100 to 150 for the Academic Year 2015-16 in respect of National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur.

32. <u>Dharbhanga Medical College, Darbhanga – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Dharbhanga Medical College, Darbhanga – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (19th & 20th January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 16.92 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 15.24 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD: Registration counters are not adequate. They are partially computerized and not interlinked. Waiting area is small. There are total 13 examination rooms instead of 4 rooms for each department. Enquiry desk is not available. Injection room for males/females is not available. Facilities are inadequate inPaediatrics& O.G. OPD.
- 4. Speech Therapy is not available.
- 5. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is not 1.5 m as required under Regulations. Nursing station, Treatment room, Doctors' duty room, Utility

- room are inadequate and unsatisfactory in most of the wards. Demonstration Rooms are not available in many wards.
- 6. There was no C.T. scan performed on day of assessment.
- 7. Central Clinical laboratory: There is no Central clinical laboratory as such. Investigations are done in individual departmental laboratories.
- 8. MRD: It is not computerized. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
- 9. O.T.s: each O.T. has more than 1 table which is not as per norms.
- 10. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations. Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. IITV/Flouroscopy is not available. CT is under PPP; however nature & mode of PPP are not provided; hence it cannot be ascertained whether it is available for training of students or not.
- 11. CSSD: It is not available. There are small centers.
- 12. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available in 6 lecture theaters of college & hospital. Audiovisual aids are not available in lecture theaters of the hospital and of capacity 250 in the college.
- 13. Central Library: Details of area, available seating capacity, Internet nodes, books & journal are not provided.
- 14. Central Photography Unit: No staff is available.
- 15. Students' Hostels: Sanitation, Water supply & Electric supply are not proper. Electric wiring is in bad shape.
- 16. Intercom: it is not available.
- 17. Biomedical waste disposal is not proper.
- 18. Anatomy department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less. Cooling chambers are not available.
- 19. Physiology department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 20. Biochemistry department: Audiovisual aids are not available in the demonstration Room.
- 21. Pathology department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 22. Microbiology department: Students' practical laboratory is not available. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 23. Pharmacology department: There is no separate room for museum.
- 24. Community Medicine department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less
- 25. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not utilized. Specialists' visits are not organized. Cold chain equipment is not available. Only survey is done; no other family welfare activity is carried out. There is no labour room.
- 26. UHC: Staff is inadequate.
- 27. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Dharbhanga Medical College, Darbhanga under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna for the academic year 2015-16.

33. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council assessors report (13th & 14th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 18.44 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are not separate.
- 3. Wards: Male & female patients are admitted in the same ward in the departments of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry, ENT & Ophthalmology. Nursing station & ward side laboratories were empty. Store rooms are not available in any ward.
- 4. Number of Major operations is only 7 & Minor operations only 13 on day of assessment which is inadequate. Daily average is 8 & 14 respectively which is inadequate.
- 5. Number of CT scans is only 3 on day of assessment which is inadequate. Daily average is 9 which is inadequate.
- 6. MRD: It is partly computerized.
- 7. Casualty: Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 8. O.T.: Equipment like Defibrillator, Infusion Pumps are grossly inadequate.
- 9. Only 4 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations. AERB approval is not available for some machines.
- 10. Only 4 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. AERB approval is not available for some machines.
- 11. CT scan: AERB approval is not available.
- 12. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available.
- 13. Central Library: Reading room (Outside) & Reading room (inside) are not separate. Capacity is 180 against requirement of 100 + 100 as per Regulations. There is no room for Residents. Capacity of staff reading room is only 12 which is inadequate. Librarian could not show a large number of books entered in the register. Number of journals available for 2013 & prior period are only 83 against requirement of 100 as per Regulations; no journals of 2014 are available.
- 14. Interns' Hostel is not yet functional.
- 15. Residents' Hostel: It is poorly furnished. Nearly all the rooms are vacant. Toilet facilities are inadequate.
- 16. Dietician is not available.
- 17. Anatomy department: MRI/CT films are not available in the museum.
- 18. Pathology department: Only 80 specimens are available.
- 19. Microbiology department: Catalogues are not available in the museum.
- 20. Pharmacology department: Museum facilities are inadequate. Catalogues are not available.
- 21. Examination: In General Surgery, practical examination for long cases was conducted away from bedside at a table which is not as per norms. Candidates were not assessed for bedside clinical signs on the patients. On second day, both external examiners were late.
- 22. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 1 month for further consideration of the matter.

34. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Thiruvarur Govt. Medical College, Thiruvarur for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Thiruvarur Govt. Medical

College, Thiruvarur for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter for the next meeting.

35. <u>Approval of the minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held</u> on 9th February 2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 9th February 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter for the next meeting.

36. <u>e-Governance with paperless administration through judicious technological interventions to create a "Digital India".</u>

Read: the matter with regard to e-Governance with paperless administration through judicious technological interventions to create a "Digital India".

The Executive Committee of the Council accepted the report of the Sub-Committee with regard to e-Governance with paperless administration through judicious technological interventions to create a "Digital India".

37. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Govt. Villupuram Medical College, Villupuram, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Govt. Villupuram Medical College, Villupuram, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (16th & 17th February, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Govt. Villupuram Medical College, Villupuram, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree for 100 seats granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

- 8 (3) ...
- (2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.
- (3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.
- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

38. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (18th & 19th February, 2015) alongwith a complaint dated 24/09/2014 received from Sh. K.M. Krishnan, Secretary, Society for Common Cause, Chennai against the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Approval of plans for construction by appropriate authority is not yet available.
- 2. Bed occupancy is 72.10 % on day of assessment.
- 3. Wards: No ward as per MCI norms is available for Psychiatry.
- 4. Teaching Beds: There is deficiency of 15 beds of Psychiatry department as only 685 beds are available against requirement of 700.
- 5. MRD: Medical records Officer is not available.
- 6. ICUs: Post-operative patients are kept in SICU.
- 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Sri Muthukumaran Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 1 month for further consideration of the matter.

39. Establishment of new medical college at Gajraula, Distt. Amroha, Uttar Pradesh by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut (Trust Name: Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Gajraula, Distt. Amroha, Uttar Pradesh by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut (Trust Name: Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

The assessment report(13th& 14th October, 2014) with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for grant of LOP(150) seats for establishment of new medical college at Gajraula, Distt. Amroha, Uttar Pradesh by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut (Trust Name: Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 on the file for the academic year 2014-2015 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 24.09.2014 in SLP © No. 25833/2014 was considered by the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 20.11.2014 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (13th & 14th Oct., 2014) carried out by the Council Assessors in compliance of the Order dated 24.09.2014 in SLP (c) No. 25833/2014 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court and noted the following:

- 1. (a) Deficiency of teaching faculty is 20 % as detailed in the report. (b) Dr. Sharad Gupta, presented as Professor, Paediatrics did not produce original certificates on 13/10/2014 i.e. first day of assessment. On the next day, he produced original experience certificate which appeared fake. Dean of the institute Dr. R.K. Gupta was present during verification. On suspicion of its genuineness, Dr. Sharad Gupta was confronted after which he had confessed that he is a M.D. Paediatrics practicing in Agra and all his teaching experience certificates are fake. He told that Mr. Vivek Tyagi Agent in Meerut (Mobile No. 8171568767) was involved in his appointment. The matter was reported to Chairman of the institute Shri Sudhir Giri for further action. One of the relative of Dr. Sharad Gupta along with two other persons entered the room in the evening hours on 14/10/2014 where assessors were preparing the report. They started abusing us and threatened them & their families.
- (c) The following faculty are not working in the hospital but appeared only for MCI assessment as confessed by them on their D.F.:
- (i) Dr. A. Anuragi, Asst. Prof. of Medicine;
- (ii) Dr. N. Goyal, Asst. Prof. of Medicine &
- (iii) Dr. P. Chaudhary, Asst. Prof. of Medicine.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 11.11 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Clinical material is inadequate with deficiency of:
 - (a) Indoor bed occupancy: Most of the patients did not require admission and cases are of poor quality for teaching purpose.
 - (b) Radiological investigations: Records are not maintained.
 - (c) Residents are not involved in patient care as most of them are not staying in the campus and coming from nearby town.
 - (d) Faculty are also not involved in IPD patient care as can be verified by case papers.
- 4. Data of clinical material provided by the institute is inflated. Fake OPD patients and investigations are written in the registers. In IPD most of the patients did not require admission. Case papers did not have patients' notes. Faculty and SR& JR were unaware of the details of the patients. They were not involved in patient care.
- 5. Most of the patients in ICUs did not require admission. There was no patient in PICU / NICU on day of assessment.
- 6. AERB approval is not available for X-ray equipment.
- 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2014-15 and further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which reads as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also....."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to return the new application dated 27.08.2014 of Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) received through the Central Government vide letter dt. 23.09.2014 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016."

The above decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide this office letter dated 28.11.2014.

In response to above, the Council Office has received a letter dated 03/02/2015(received on 11/02/2015) from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi, which reads as under:-

"I am directed to refer to your letter No.MC-34(41)(E-44)/2014-Med./142833 dated 28.11.2014, on the subject mentioned above and to say that the matter has been examined in the Ministry and found that as per direction dated 24.09.2014 of Hon'ble Supreme Court, the MCI is required to conduct inspection of the college. However, any recognition to be granted to the petitioner Institute shall be only for the year 2015-16.

It has been further observed from the said recommendation of the Council that although the inspection of the institute has been conducted for the year 2015-16, the Council has recommended for disapproval of the scheme for the year 2014-15 which is not in compliance of Hon'ble Supreme Court direction.

Further, as regard to fresh application dated 27.08.2014 of the University for the year 2015-16, it has been also observed that the referred clause of the Regulations i.e. 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation 1999(amended in 2010) not applicable in the case of petitioner's proposal for Establishment of new medical college for the academic year 2015-2016, since no LOP has so far been issued on the recommendation of the Council as per section 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

It is also observed that in the two similar cases the Council vide its letter No.MCI-34(41)(E-47)/2014-Med./151223, dated 21/01/2015 and MCI-34(41)(E-61)/2014-Med./151225, dated 21/01/2015 has recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue LOP for establishment of new medical college at respective places and also request to applicant to submit the detailed pointwise compliance.

The Council is therefore, requested to examine the matter in light of above and send its specific recommendation in compliance of direction of Hon'ble Supreme Court, so that a suitable order may be passed by the Ministry."

The said letter of the Central Govt. was considered by the competent authority and as per direction, the matter with regard to establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was placed before Sh. Gaurav Sharma, Standing Counsel of the MCI to take legal opinion from the Senior Advocate.

In response to the above, Sh. Gaurav Sharma, Standing Counsel of the MCI has submitted his written opinion dated 18.02.2015, which reads as under:

"The querist has sought my opinion on the Govt. of India letter dated 03.02.2015 requesting the querist to examine the application of Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula (hereinafter referred as 'medical college') for the establishment of new medical college from the academic year 2015-16.

The Govt. of India vide the letter dated 03.02.2015 had requested the querist that Regulation 8(3)(1)(a) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, will not be applicable in the case of new medical college.

I have gone through the file of the querist along with the application of the medical college and the recommendation dated 28.11.2014 to the Central Govt.. Before giving any specific opinion in the matter, it would be appropriate to consider the following facts:-

- 1. In the case of the applicant medical college, in pursuance to the order passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP (c) No.25833/2014, titled MCI Vs. Shri Venkateshwara University, the assessors of the MCI carried out the assessment of the applicant medical college on 13/14.10.2014.
- 2. The assessment report dated 13/14.10.2014 was considered by the Executive Committee of the querist in its meeting held on 20.11.2014, wherein the following deficiencies were found:-

.....

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (13th & 14th Oct., 2014) carried out by the Council Assessors in compliance of the Order dated 24.09.2014 in SLP (c) No. 25833/2014 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court and noted the following:-

(a) Deficiency of teaching faculty is 20 % as detailed in the report.

(b) Dr. Sharad Gupta, presented as Professor, Paediatrics did not produce original certificates on 13/10/2014 – i.e. first day of assessment. On the next day, he produced original experience certificate which appeared fake. Dean of the institute Dr. R.K. Gupta was present during verification. On suspicion of its

genuineness, Dr. Sharad Gupta was confronted after which he had confessed that he is a M.D. Paediatrics practicing in Agra and all his teaching experience certificates are fake. He told that Mr. Vivek Tyagi – Agent in Meerut (Mobile No.

8171568767) – was involved in his appointment. The matter was reported to

Chairman of theinstitute Shri Sudhir Giri for further action. One of the relative of

Dr. Sharad Guptaalong with two other persons entered the room in the evening

hours on 14/10/2014 where assessors were preparing the report. They started abusing us and threatened them & their families.

- (c) The following faculty are not working in the hospital but appeared only for MCI assessment as confessed by them on their D.F.:
 - (i) Dr. A. Anuragi, Asst. Prof. of Medicine;
 - (ii) Dr. N. Goyal, Asst. Prof. of Medicine &
 - (iii) Dr. P. Chaudhary, Asst. Prof. of Medicine.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 11.11 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Clinical material is inadequate with deficiency of:
 (a)Indoor bed occupancy: Most of the patients did not require admission and cases are of poor quality for teaching purpose.
 - (b) Radiological investigations: Records are not maintained.

- (c) Residents are not involved in patient care as most of them are not staying in the campus and coming from nearby town.
- (d) Faculty are also not involved in IPD patient care as can be verified by case papers.
- 4. Data of clinical material provided by the institute is inflated. Fake OPD patients and investigations are written in the registers. In IPD most of the patients did not require admission. Case papers did not have patients' notes. Faculty and SR& JR were unaware of the details of the patients. They were not involved in patient care.
- 5. Most of the patients in ICUs did not require admission. There was no patient in PICU / NICU on day of assessment.
 - 6. AERB approval is not available for X-ray equipment.
 - 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2014-15 and further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which reads as under:-

"8(3)(1)..... (d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to return the new application dated 27.08.2014 of Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) received through the Central Government vide letter dt. 23.09.2014 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

....."

3. After due consideration, the Executive Committee observed that the medical college has mislead the querist by showing fake faculty as well as submitting false declaration forms of the faculty. The Executive Committee decided to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation 1999 (as amended in 2010) and to recommend to the Central Govt. to not to grant permission for establishment of new medical college from the academic year 2015-16. Accordingly the querist vide letter dated 28.11.2014 forwarded its recommendations to the Central Govt.

- 4. The Govt. of India after examining the recommendation of the Council dated 28.11.2014, vide their letter dated 03.02.2015, has requested the Council to re-examine the matter on the ground that Regulation 8(3)(1)(a) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 will not be applicable on new medical colleges.
- 5. In the case of the medical college, the Govt. of India has wrongly mentioned Regulation 8(3)(1)(a) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 as the same was neither invoked nor recommended by the querist against the medical college. In the present case the querist has invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 as the applicant medical college has indulged in hiring / showing fake faculty and had submitted false declaration forms of the faculty.
- 6. The issue which is left to be considered is as to whether Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 will be applicable in the case of establishment of new medical college.
- 7. Recently the querist, in similar facts and circumstances, in the case of F.I Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow had sought an opinion from the Ld. Additional Solicitor General of India, who has opined that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 will also be applicable in the case of establishment of new medical colleges. The relevant portion of the opinion rendered by the Ld. Additional Solicitor General of India dated 17.02.2015 is reproduced as under:-

"

1. That my opinion has been sought on the following query:
"Whether Regulation 8(3) (1)(d) of the Establishment of
Medical College Regulations, 1999 will be applicable to
the colleges seeking grant of permission to establish new
medical colleges?"

This has been addressed to me in the background of the inspection conducted on 9/10th December, 2014 of the F.I. Memorial and Welfare Society, Lucknow who wants to establish/set up a new Medical College.

- 2. On perusal of Regulation 8(3) (1) (d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, it is clear that if an institute is found to have
 - i) employed a teacher with fake/forged documents; and
 - ii) have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher. then such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of M.B.B.S degree /processing the application for postgraduate courses for two years.
 - 3. The aforesaid expression specifically refers to renewal of permission/ recognition. The purpose of this clause is to debar an institute who indulges in employment of teachers with fake or forged documents and submits declaration form of such teachers. In my opinion the expression covers both stages i.e. the stage of permission and even at the stage of recognition. Permission would necessarily include the initial permission subsequent renewal. Thus accordingly to me is an institute indulges in the aforesaid act at the very threshold there is no reason why the rigour of the clause should not be attracted and such an institute should be barred for two years.
 - 4. That, therefore, in my opinion the query has to be answered by stating that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) will be applicable even at

the stage of first permission i.e. permission to establish the new medical college.

In view of the above factual matrix and the opinion of the Ld. Additional Solicitor General of India dated 17.02.2015, Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999 will be applicable in the case of the applicant medical college. "

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision to return the new application dated 27.08.2014 of Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) received through the Central Government vide letter dt. 23.09.2014 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of a new medical college at Gajraula Distt., Amroha, U.P. by Shri Venkateshwara University, Meerut, (Trust-Shri Bankey Bihari Educational & Welfare Trust) under Shri Venkateshwara University, Gajraula, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

40. Establishment of new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

The assessment with regard to establishment of new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in pursuance of the order dt. 13.08.2014 of Hon'ble High Court of Allahabad, Lucknow Bench in W.P. No. 7504/2014 and Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dt. 03.09.2014 in SLP © No. 23084/2014 was carried out by the Council Assessors on 9th & 10th December, 2014. The assessment report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 16/12/2014 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (9th & 10th December, 2014) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of teaching faculty 66.67% as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of resident doctors is 57.78% as detailed in the report.
- 3. Deficiency of the infrastructure of college & Hospital: UG Hostel-Mess-space is available but without any cooking equipment. Study Room- space is available but without AC, computer & internet. Recreation room- space is available with treadmill and static (for exercise) only in Boy's hostel no Music system or indoor game.
- 4. Central Photography Unit: There is no staff and no equipment.
- 5. Deficiency of clinical material: Bed occupancy on the day of assessment is only 13.33%. Institutional statistics of average bed occupancy does not correlate with data collected by assessors on first day of assessment.
- 6. OPD attendance was 282 on day of assessment against requirement of 600 as per Regulations.
- 7. Operation Theatres No major or minor operations were performed on 09/12/2014. There was no normal delivery or Cesarean section conducted on 9th Dec.2014. O.T. was practically closed and nonfunctional. Dust present inside the OTs suggested that OTs were not functioning since many days and the registers were fabricated.

- 8. Wards: In most of the wards, fake patients were admitted on 9th Dec.2014. The case papers were without proper clinical notes. Nursing stations, examination and treatment rooms, pantries, store rooms, duty doctor rooms and demo rooms-space is available but without sufficient furniture, equipment, drug trays. Bins for sterile cotton gauze were empty. Store room-and Doctors' duty room were only empty spaces Demonstration rooms were without chairs and teaching aids. Central oxygen and suction was not working.
- 9. SICU is not available.
- 10. CSSD: Receiving and distribution points are not separate. ETO sterilizer is not available.
- 11. Website: Information regarding faculty & non-teaching staff is not provided.
- 12. Anatomy department: Number of cadavers, Cold storage facilities and Disarticulated Bone sets are inadequate as detailed in report.
- 13. Physiology department: In Clinical Physiology laboratory, only 4 tables are available against requirement of 10.
- 14. As per the statement of Dr. A.A. Faruqui, Assoc. Prof. of Pharmacology and Dr. Shivratan Joshi, Asstt. Prof. of Surgery who were absent during attendance (till 11 am), someone signed on their behalf and they verified that those were not their signatures.
- 15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknowunder Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2014-2015 and further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) & (d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

*"*8*(*3*)*(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch):

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is < 60% such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year.

(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

It was further decided to place the matter before Ethics Committee for its consideration and also to return the new application dated 29.08.2014 of F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknowreceived through the Central Govt. vide letter dated 17.09.2014 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of a new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknowunder Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh."

The above decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide this office letter dated 22/12/2014.

In response to above, the Council Office has received a letter dated 28/01/2015 from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

" I am directed to refer to your letter No.MC-34(41)(e-51)/2014-Med./146401, dated 22.11.2014, on the subject mentioned above and to say that the matter has been examined in the Ministry and found that as per direction dated 03.09.2014 of Hon'ble Supreme Court, the MCI is required to conduct inspection of the college. However, any recognition to be granted to the petitioner Institute shall be only for the year 2015-16.

It has been further observed from the said recommendation of the Council that although the inspection of the institute has been conducted for the year 2015-16, the Council has recommended for disapproval of the scheme for the year 2014-15 which is not in compliance of Hon'ble Supreme Court direction.

Further, as regard to fresh application dated 29.08.2014 of the Society for the year 2015-16, it has been also observed that the referred clause of the Regulations i.e. 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation 1999(amended in 2010) not applicable in the case of petitioner's proposal for Establishment of new medical college for the academic year 2015-2016, since no LOP has so far been issued on the recommendation of the Council as per section 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

It is also observed that in the two similar cases the Council vide its letter No.MCI-34(41)(E-47)/2014-Med./151223, dated 21/01/2015 and MCI-34(41)(E-61)/2014-Med./151225, dated 21/01/2015 has recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue LOP for establishment of new medical college at respective places and also request to applicant to submit the detailed pointwise compliance.

The Council is therefore, requested to examine the matter in light of above and send its specific recommendation in compliance of direction of Hon'ble Supreme Court, so that a suitable order may be passed by the Ministry."

In view of above, the matter with regard to consideration of letter dated 28/01/2015 received from the Central Govt. for establishment of new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was considered by the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 31/01/2015 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 28/01/2015 received from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi and decided to obtain legal opinion of Senior Advocate for further consideration.

Accordingly, the file with regard to establishment of new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was placed before Sh. Gaurav Sharma, Standing Counsel of the MCI to take the legal opinion from the Senior Advocate.

In response to the above, Sh. Gaurav Sharma, Standing Counsel of the MCI has returned the file of the U.G. Section along with the written opinion dated 17.02.2015 of Sh. Paramjit Singh Patwalia, Ld. Additional Solicitor General of India, which reads as under:-

- "1. I have gone through the note sent to me for opinion and have also discussed the issue with Mr. Gaurav Sharma, Advocate,
- 2. That my opinion has been sought on the following query:

"Whether Regulation 8(3)1(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 199 will be applicable to the colleges seeking grant of permission to establish new medical colleges?

This has been addressed to me in the background of the inspection conducted on 9/10th December, 2014 of the F.I. Memorial and Welfare Society, Lucknow who wants to establish/set up a new Medical College.

- 3. On perusal of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, it is clear that if an institute is found to have
- i) employed a teacher with fake/forged documents, and
- ii) have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher.

then such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of M.B.B.S degree/processing the application for postgraduate courses for two years.

- 4. The aforesaid expression specifically refers to renewal of permission/recognition. The purpose of this clause is to debar an institute who indulges in employment of teachers with fake or forged documents and submits declaration form of such teachers. In my opinion the expression covers both stages i.e. the stage of permission and even at the stage of recognition. Permission would necessarily include the initial permission as also subsequent renewal. Thus accordingly to me if an institute indulges in the aforesaid act at the very threshold there is no reason why the rigour of the clause should not be attracted and such an institute should be barred for two years.
- 5. That, therefore, in my opinion the query has to be answered by stating that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) will be applicable even at the stage of first permission i.e. permission to establish the new medical college."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision to place the matter before Ethics Committee for its consideration and also to return the new application dated 29.08.2014 of F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow received through the Central Govt. vide letter dated 17.09.2014 to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of a new medical college at Bajehra, Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by F.I. Memorial & Welfare Society, Lucknow under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh u/s 10 of the Indian Medical Council Act,1956 for the Academic Year 2015-16.

41. Establishment of New Medical College at Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management (GITAM), Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of New Medical College at Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management (GITAM), Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 22/01/2015(received on 03/02/2015) from Dr. D.K. Paliwal, Officer on Special Duty(OSD), Government of India , Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of Higher Education, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi which reads as under:-

"I am directed to refer to the Medical Council of India's letter No. MCI-34(E-3)/2014-Med/149661-63 dated 15th January 2015 received from Shri Savitha, Section Officer on the subject noted above and to say that Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management (GITAM), Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh has been accorded the status of Deemed to be University vide Government of India Notification No.9-37/2006-U3 dated 13.08.2007 as Deemed to be University under Section 3 of the UGC Act.

2. The institutions declared as Deemed to be University do not have the powers to affiliate an institute/college with it. They are to functions as per the provisions under UGC (Institutions declared to be Deemed University) Regulations -2010 and amendments therein 2014. A copy of these Regulations is enclosed for ready reference. As per the records, this Department has not received any proposal for establishment of a Medical College at Vishakhapatnam by GITAM. Any institution which is to be brought under the ambit of an institution declared as Deemed to be University or setting up of an campus center of an institution declared as Deemed to be University, requires the approval of Ministry of Human Resource Development, Govt. of India."

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the opinion of the Standing Counsel for MCI, the operative part of which reads as under:

".... In view of the above factual matrix, I am of the view that as per Govt. of India MHRD letter dated 22.01.2015, GITAM even though has been accorded the status of Deemed to be University but does not have power to affiliate an institute or college since for the same they require an approval of MHRD, Govt. of India and that MHRD, Govt. of India has already informed that as per their records no such proposal has been received from GITAM for the establishment of a medical college.

Thus the consent of affiliation issued by GITAM as a deemed to be University is not valid since it has not been permitted by the MHRD, Govt. of India to affiliate any medical college. Therefore, the application of Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management, Andhra Pradesh for the establishment of new medical college from academic year 2015-16, in view of the Govt. of India MHRD letter dated 22.01.2015, cannot be processed further and the querist accordingly send its recommendation to the Central Govt. for establishment of new medical college from academic year 2015-2016..."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of New Medical College at Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management (GITAM), Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16 to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme as there is no provision in the Act or regulations to keep it pending.

42. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Tagore Medical College & Hospital, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Tagore Medical College & Hospital, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (18th & 19th February, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Tagore Medical College & Hospital, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree for 150 seats granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

- 8 (3) ...
- (2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.
- (3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.
- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause
- (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

43. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (23rd & 24th February 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 30 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. In view of the orders of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dt. 18/09/2014 & 25/09/2014, the college authorities have admitted the students into MBBS course for the academic year 2014-2015 as per information provided by the Monitoring Cell of the Council. However, as per available records, the UG Section has not received any copy of the undertaking which was required as per orders of the Hon'ble Supreme Court.
- 3. Female Resident doctors are residing in Nurses' Hostel. Mess facilities are not available. Hostel registers are not maintained. Common rooms & Visitors' room are not available.
- 4. Speech Therapy is not available.

- 5. Number of Major operations is only 10 for the whole hospital.
- 6. MRD: It is not computerized. Medical Records Officer is not available.
- 7. Casualty: Separate Casualty for Obstetrics is not available. Casualty beds were vacant on day of assessment.
- 8. ICUs: There was no patient in MICU & SICU & only 1 patient each in PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
- Pathology department: Biomedical Waste disposal measures are inadequate.
- 10. Forensic Medicine department: Cold storage facility is shared with Anatomy department.
- 11. RHTC: Cold chain is not maintained. No delivery has been conducted in past 1 year.
- 12. UHC: Cold storage is not available.
- 13. Kitchen facilities in the hospital are inadequate. Dietician is not available.
- 14. Website: Toll free number to report ragging is not provided.
- 15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that the Institute has admitted students for 2014-2015 pursuant to order of Hon'ble Supreme Court after filing undertaking. However, the Council has not received the copy of the undertaking from the college authorities. The Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain a copy of the Undertaking from the college authorities as per the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court.

In view of the deficiencies listed above, it is amply evident that the institute has failed to rectify previous deficiencies which are still persisting.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the order of Hon'ble Apex Court dt. 18/09/2014 & 25/092014, the operative part of which reads as under:

"The relevant portion of the order dated 18.09.2014 passed in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014 by the Hon'ble Supreme Court is reproduced hereunder:-

" Heard the learned senior counsel appearing for both the sides.

Looking at the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case and, especially, when several seats for medical admission are likely to remain vacant for the academic year 2014-15, we are of the view that these matters require urgent consideration and we are giving these interim directions under the provisions of Article 142 of the Constitution of India.

There is one more reason for passing this interim order. We are conscious of the fact that number of physicians in our country is much less than what is required and because of non-renewal of recognition of several medical colleges, our citizens would be deprived of a good number of physicians and therefore, we are constrained to pass this order, whereby at least there would be some increase in the number of physicians after

five years. We are running against time because the last date for giving admissions to MBBS Course for the academic year 2014-15 is 30th September, 2014.

We also desire to reconsider the directions given by this Court in the judgment of Priya Gupta v. State of Chhattisgarh [(2012) 7 SCC 433], but at this juncture, as we do not have sufficient time to decide all these petitions finally, we are passing this interim order and the matter with regard to reconsideration of the aforestated judgment would be considered while finally disposing of this group of petitions.

It has been submitted on behalf of the learned senior counsel appearing for all the petitioners/ respondents, who are managing medical colleges, that the defects which had been recorded at the time of the last inspection by the representatives of the Medical Council of India have been duly rectified and at present, the defects pointed out in the reports do not exist. The said fact can be ascertained only by having a fresh Compliance Verification/Inspection. However, the stand taken by the Central Government and the Medical Council of India is to the effect that no such inspection can be undertaken in the present academic session because of paucity of time and it would violate the time schedule laid down by this Court in the case of Priya Gupta (supra).

The learned senior counsel appearing for the Medical Council of India has also submitted that the petitioners do not have any legal right for getting renewal of the recognition, especially in view of the fact that the Verification/Inspection Reports are not available for the period in question. The learned senior counsel has relied upon some of the Judgments to substantiate his case and according to him, it would not be just and proper to permit the said medical colleges to take fresh batch of students.

Looking at the peculiar facts of the case and the circumstances stated hereinabove, we direct the petitioners to file undertakings by President/Chairman and Secretary of the petitioners' institutions running medical colleges within 10 days from today, to the effect that there is no defect in the medical colleges run by them and they would also state that their deposit with the MCI, which is around Rs.10 Crores, be forfeited by way of penalty if the statement made in the undertaking is found to be incorrect at the time of the next inspection. A draft undertaking has been given to this Court. A copy of the undertaking, which might be filed by the institutions, shall be served upon the office of the Medical Council of India as well as to the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Govt. of India, New Delhi.

We also record the fact that in the recent past, the Medical Council of India has renewed recognition of Government Medical Colleges on the basis of undertakings and therefore, we see no reason not to permit the private colleges to admit students on the basis of undertakings given by their office bearer as a special case.

Notwithstanding any direction given in the case of Priya Gupta (supra), if undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by the institutions managing medical colleges for the academic year 2014-15, admissions shall be given to the students from the merit list prepared by the States and they shall be charged fees prescribed by the Government Medical Colleges of their respective States. The State Authorities, i.e., the Directorate of Medical Education & Research, of the respective States shall send students, in order of their merit, to the medical colleges run by the petitioners, which are situated within their States, within one week from the date of receipt of a copy of this order and the said students shall be admitted to the MBBS Course in accordance with the rules and regulations of the MCI and also regulations dated 16.04.2010 framed by the Medical Council of India, provided undertakings as mentioned above are filed on behalf of the concerned institutions.

It is also clarified that there would be no further counseling in respect of the students who are to be given admission, even if it might result into some heartburning among other students, but in the peculiar facts of the case, we give this direction.

In no case, the admission shall be given after 30thSeptember, 2014. This order shall also apply to all the institutions which had filed their petitions earlier for renewal of their recognition for the academic year2014-15, but their petitions were rejected or withdrawn for whatever reason, provided undertakings as stated hereinabove are filed by President/Chairman and the Secretary of those institutions. All those petitions shall be deemed to have been revived and this order shall be deemed to have been passed in those cases also. This order shall only be in respect of renewal of recognition and not for creation of additional seats or for new colleges.

We also record that the Union of India has supported the petitioners in the interest of students. We also direct the Union of India to give wide publicity to this order in print as well as electronic media in the interest of the concerned students.

It is directed that the list of students getting admission I pursuance of this order shall be placed on record of this Court by 1st October, 2014 by the concerned institutions and a copy thereof shall also be sent to the MCI.

These matters shall be treated as part-heard and shall be notified for further hearing in the month of December, 2014."

The Hon'ble Supreme Court thereafter vide its order dated 25.09.2014 issued certain clarification in respect to the order dated 18.09.2014 in W.P. (C) No. 469/2014, which are reproduced hereunder:-

"After hearing the learned counsel for the parties we deem it appropriate to issue following clarifications with regard to our earlier order dated 18th September, 2014. These clarifications shall be read into the said order as if they were always part thereof:-

- 1. The order dated 18th September, 2014 shall also apply to cases where colleges or institutions were seeking increase in intake capacity and in the current year have been denied permission to admit students after first or second or third or fourth renewal/inspection. In our view such institutions where Renewal/Inspection with respect to increase in capacity were conducted in the present academic year are also entitled to the benefit under the order dated 18th September, 2014.
- 2. We also clarify that fees chargeable from the students admitted pursuant to our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall be at the same rates as applicable to the students in Government medical colleges in respective States and such fees shall be at the same levels as that of the Government medical colleges till the students so admitted pass out from the private medical colleges or institutions.
- 3. Our order shall also apply to all similarly situated institutions irrespective of the fact whether any petitions were or are pending in this Court or in any of the High Courts or even if they had not approached any court at all. This order shall also apply even in cases where there were orders of stay in favour of the Medical Council of India restraining the colleges from admitting students for the current academic session.
- 4. The order shall not apply to colleges or institutions which have been disqualified by the Medical Council of India and/or the Central Government and have been prohibited from making any admissions for the current academic year 2014-15.
- 5. In cases where two separate lists are prepared and sent by the State agencies one relating to State quota and the other relating to management quota in private institutions, we clarify that for the current academic year there shall be only one list and that shall be the "State quota" alone. There shall not be any management quota list to be sent to the private colleges or institutions taking the benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014. The Management quota shall also be filled through the State list and the fees chargeable for the management quota shall also be charged at the same levels and rates as applicable to State quota list.
- 6. We further clarify that private institutions taking benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall have to take students only from the State agencies and at fees chargeable for students in Government medical colleges as stated above, regardless of their status or claim as Minority Institutions or Deemed Universities."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to invoke/forfeit the Bank Guarantees submitted by the Institute and directed the Institute to submit fresh bank guarantee within 2 weeks.

44. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Shri Sathya Sai Medical College & Research Institute, Kancheepuram under Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth, Pondicherry (Deemed Univ.)

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Shri

Sathya Sai Medical College & Research Institute, Kancheepuram under Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth, Pondicherry (Deemed Univ.).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification report (Feb.,2015) along with report (Sept.,2014) of Pre-PG Assessment and decided to withdraw the show cause notice issued vide letter dt. 21.10.2014.

45. Hiring of Manpower through Agency.

Read: the matter with regard to hiring of Manpower through Agency.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the decision of the President, MCI to award the contract to L-1 firm i.e. M/s. Bedi & Bedi Associates, New Delhi.

46. <u>Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th January, 2015.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th January, 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th January, 2015 other than the following items:

Item 9(a) 5 (a) Eligibility for guides for D.M./M.Ch. Student: Not approved.

Item 9(a) 5 (d) Approved with the modification that the designation will be "Tutor" and not "Demonstrator".

Item 9(b) 9. The word "conquered" should be replaced with more appropriate word "concurred."

Item 9(c) 3. Not approved.

Item 12 (c) Not approved.

47. <u>Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar - Renewal of Permission for admission of 2^{nd} Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (24th & 25th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Teaching beds: Proportionate increase in teaching beds for increased intake from 100 to 150 in General Medicine, Paediatrics, General Surgery, Orthopaedics& O.G. is not provided.
- 2. Wards: General Medicine, Tb & Chest, Paediatrics wards do not have pantry. Demonstration room in General Medicine has capacity of 15 against requirement of 25. Doctors' duty room is not available in General Surgery ward. Treatment room is not available in Orthopaedics ward. ENT & Ophthalmology wards do not have treatment room, Doctors' duty room, pantry, store room & demonstration room.

- 3. Shortage of Residents is 5.6 % as detailed in the report.
- 4. MEU: Workshops conducted by the institute are not as per MCI guidelines.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar under Siksha 'O' Anusandhan University, Bhubaneswar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

48. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100 to 150 at Rama Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Kanpur, UP for the academic session 2015-16 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 01.08.2014 in CA No. 7117/2014 – Rama Medical College Hospital Vs. UOI & Amr.

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100 to 150 at Rama Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Kanpur, UP for the academic session 2015-16 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 01.08.2014 in CA No. 7117/2014 – Rama Medical College Hospital Vs. UOI & Amr.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the Committee at its meeting held on 20.11.2014 applied clauses 8(3)(1)(a) & (c) and issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee also perused letter dated 16.02.2015 from the Principal & Dean, Rama Medical College, Kanpur stating therein as under:-

"Kindly refer to Ministry letter No. 12012/1057/2015 –ME(P-II) dated 3td February,, 2015threby giving opportunity of for submissions of compliance and personal hearing on the subject cited above. Accordingly in that refer, the undersign appear before the hearing committee on 12th February, 2015 on the schedule date and had also submitted compliance vide letter No. RMCHRC/Estt./Pri.0./2015/173 dated 12.02.2015.

With above reference we are withdrawing our claim and application for enhancement of MBBS seats from 100 to 105 seats for the academic session 2015-16."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to take legal opinion in the matter for further consideration.

49. <u>Dr. Shankarrao Chavan Govt. Medical College, Nanded – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Dr. Shankarrao Chavan Govt. Medical College, Nanded – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (6th & 7th January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Lecture Theaters: They are not of Gallery type. Facility for E class is not available in any lecture theater.
- 2. Central Library: Seating capacity is only 162 against requirement of 200.
- 3. MRD: It is not computerized. ICD X classification of diseases is not used for indexing.
- 4. Casualty: Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 5. O.T. Equipment like Respiratory gas Monitor, Pulse Oxymeter are not available.
- 6. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 4 as per Regulations. AERB approval is available for only 1 machine.
- 7. IITV & Flouroscopy are not available.
- 8. Anatomy department: Dissection tables are inadequate. Faculty space is inadequate. In Museum, in MRI CT section, only plates are available.
- 9. Physiology department: Size of Haematology laboratory is inadequate.
- 10. Microbiology department: Service laboratories are inadequate.
- 11. Forensic Medicine department: In museum, firearms & weapons are dumped in 1 cupboard instead of displaying them. Departmental library is small having only 1 small table with seating capacity of only 4.
- 12. RHTC: it is under control of DGHS which is not as per Regulations.
- 13. UHC: It is under joint control of Dean & Nanded Municipal Corporation which is not as per Regulations.
- 14. In the existing campus, there is no Girls' common room.
- 15. Audiologist is not available.
- 16. In some wards, space between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. required as per norms.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 in respect of Dr. Shankarrao Chavan Govt. Medical College, Nanded under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

50. Shri Vasantrao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to Shri Vasantrao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (8th & 9th January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 14.97 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 15 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Teaching Beds: Only 96 beds are available in General Surgery against requirement of 120 and 6 beds are available in Psychiatry against requirement of 10 for recognition of 100 intake. Though this is II renewal for increase from 100 to 150, the beds in General Medicine, Paediatrics, Skin & VD, General Surgery, Orthopaedics have not been increased proportionately from those required for college with 100 intake.
- 4. OPD attendance was only 685 against requirement of 1,000.
- 5. Bed occupancy is only 49.91 % on day of assessment.
- 6. There were only 3 Major Surgical operations on day of assessment which is inadequate.

- 7. There are no special investigations like Ba, IVP performed on day of assessment.
- 8. Workload of Histopathology is NIL and of Cytopathology is only 3 on day of assessment.
- 9. Casualty: Special casualty for Obstetrics is not available. Disaster Trolley & Ventilator are not available.
- 10. O.T.: Preoperative beds are not available.
- 11. ICUs: 4 beds are available in SICU against requirement of 5. RICU is not available. PICU is not available. Only 3 Radiant Warmers are available; rest of beds in NICU are simple cots.
- 12. Labour Room: Eclampsia room is not labeled. It is not at all equipped to handle Eclampsia patients.
- 13. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 3 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6 as per Regulations. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations.
- 14. CSSD is not available.
- 15. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meeting has taken place during the year.
- 16. Lecture Theater: No lecture theater has capacity of 180 required as per Regulations. Hospital lecture theater is not available. Facility for E class is not available.
- 17. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Area available is 1485 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Capacity of Students' reading Room (Outside) & Students' reading Room (Inside) is 100 each against requirement of 150 each as required. Only 47 journals are available le against requirement of 100 as per Regulations. Only 8 Internet Nodes are available which is inadequate.
- 18. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are not available.
- 19. Interns' Hostel: Accommodation available is only 24 against 150 required.
- 20. Residential Quarters: Only 15 quarters are available for faculty against requirement of 30 as per Regulations.
- 21. Medical Superintendent is not available.
- 22. OPD: Injection rooms for males & females are not available. Dressing room is common for males & females. Minor O.T. is not available. Separate Plaster cutting room is not available. Dark room is not available in Ophthalmology OPD.
- 23. Speech therapy is not available.
- 24. Wards: Demonstration Rooms are available in only 2 wards.
- 25. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not used for indexing of diseases. Medical Records Officer is not available. Statistician is common with Community Medicine department.
- 26. Anatomy department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less. Laboratory facilities are inadequate. Only 60 Lockers are available against requirement of 150. Microscopes are less. Only 10 Dissection tables are available against requirement of 20.
- 27. Physiology department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 28. Biochemistry department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 29. Microbiology department: There is only 1 Demonstration Room against requirement of 2. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 30. Pharmacology department: There is only 1 Demonstration Room against requirement of 2. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 31. Forensic Medicine department: Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 32. Community Medicine department: There is only 1 Demonstration Room against requirement of 2. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms is less.
- 33. RHTC: Distance is more than 30 km. from college which is not as per norms. Mess is not available.
- 34. UHC: It is in old Women's hospital. Usually there are only 2-3 patients. On day of assessment, there was none.
- 35. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Shri Vasantrao Naik Govt. Medical College, Yavatmal under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

51. NSCB Medical College, Jabalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to NSCB Medical College, Jabalpur – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter for the next meeting.

52. Admission of 1st year MBBS students at Hamdard Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Delhi for the Academic Year 2012-13.

Read: the matter with regard to admission of 1st year MBBS students at Hamdard Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Delhi for the Academic Year 2012-13.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that although discharge notice was issued for 2 students, viz. Ms. Zara Khan & Ms. Sama Rizvi, letter of Principal to only one candidate – Ms. Zara Khan is included in the item. It was further observed that even this letter is in nature of clarification of Principal to the father and discharge notice per se.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council directed the office to ascertain from the Institute whether these two candidates have been issued discharge notices or not and if yes, it may be asked to submit copies of discharge notices along with present status.

53. Non-receipt of the list of I year MBBS students for the academic year 2013-14 from Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzzafarpur, Bihar.

Read: the matter with regard to non-receipt of the list of I year MBBS students for the academic year 2013-14 from Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzzafarpur, Bihar.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided that the Deans of the Medical Colleges be called in-person with the appropriate lists within two weeks failing which appropriate necessary action, including issuing discharge notices to all admitted students will be taken.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided that a copy of this letter be also sent to Secretary (ME), Bihar; Director of Medical Education, Bihar; Vice Chancellor of affiliating University and nominee of Government of Bihar to MCI requesting them to take appropriate action in the matter.

54. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh earlier under Barkatullah University and now under Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh earlier under Barkatullah University and now under Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (23rd & 24th February 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 19.81 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of residents is 49 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 48 % on day of assessment.
- 4. There were only 5 Major (which included 4 Cataract operations) & 4 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 5. There was no normal delivery & 1 Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 6. There was no patient in ICCU, SICU, PICU/NICU & only 1 patient in MICU on day of assessment.
- 7. With regard to clinical material, the following discrepancies were observed:
 - (a) In Casualty OPD, two fake patients of corneal abrasion were shown. On enquiry, both of them said that their left eye was given eye pads just one hour before. On examination, both of them had no such problem.
 - (b) In Paediatrics ward, most of the patients had no significant illness to be treated as IPD patients. 5 patients from the same family were found in Paediatrics ward. Few other patients were also from the common family.
 - (c) In Obstetrics ward, 2 patients were aged more than 50 years i.e. beyond reproductive age.
 - (d) In Tb & Chest ward, almost all the patients shown were not having any chest complaint at all. Rather, they had other vague complaints like body ache, etc. not requiring admission.
 - (e) Overall, IPD patients were not having significant illness to be treated as IPD patients.
 - (f) Most of IPD patients were not investigated at all. Most of the them were not given any medicine.
 - (g) More than 70 % patients were admitted on only 1 day i.e. 22/02/2015.
- 8. With regard to faculty & Residents, the following discrepancies are observed:
 - (a) Most of the Residents are not actually staying in campus accommodation.
 - (b) One Junior Resident in O.G. confessed that he is actually staying in teaching staff quarters but only on paper he was allotted a room in the hostel.
 - (c) A few teachers are engaged only periodically as per their teaching schedule.
 - (d) Most of the faculty are not actually staying in the quarters allotted to them.
 - (e) Significant number of faculty & Residents were unaware of other faculty & Residents of their own departments.

57

- 9. Dr. Navneet Mishra, Asst. Prof. of General Surgery had attached wrong experience certificate.
- 10. The following faculty were observed not to have done any work in the department:
 - (a) Dr. Sameer Zutshi, Asst. Professor, Anaesthesia;
 - (b) Dr. Subrat Adhikary, Asst. Professor of General Medicine;
 - (c) Dr. Priya Singh, Asst. Prof. of General Surgery;
 - (d) Dr. Avinash Kaundinya, Professor of Ophthalmology.
- 11. In case of as many as 12 faculty, address does not match with Dean's quarters allocation certificate.
- 12. In case of 14 Residents as detailed in the report, there is no signature of HOD on D.F.
- 13. Dr. Milan Pumbhadiya, Junior Resident had D.F. filled on 09/01/2015 while he was appointed on 20/01/2015.
- 14. In case of Dr. Jayesh Dholakiya, Junior Resident in General Medicine, date of joining is contradictory.
- 15. Name of faculty was not mentioned in weekly teaching programmes.
- 16. In Residents' hostel, ground floor is used as Autopsy block.
- 17. Teaching staff quarters are not actually staff quarters but like big sized rooms hostel. They are located on 2nd& 3rd floor above the library and reading room, which means that library is on ground floor, reading room is on I floor of teaching quarters hostel.
- 18. MRD: It is partly manual & partly computerized.
- 19. Nursing staff: 155 Nurses are available against requirement of 175 as per Regulations.
- 20. Paramedical staff: Only 65 are available against requirement of 100 as per Regulations.
- 21. Anatomy department: Embryology models are inadequate.
- 22. Access of RKDF Hospital is through very narrow road passing through slum area which is a major problem for ambulance to reach.
- 23. No separate Nursing hostel is available. I floor of Girls' hostel is utilized as Nursing hostel.
- 24. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh earlier under Barkatullah University and now under Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clauses 8(3)(1)(a) & 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

(d) <u>Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged documents</u>:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the institute for renewal of permission for two academic years i.e. that academic year(i.e. 2015-16) and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017).

The Executive Committee further decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee.

Dr. V.N. Jindal re-joined the meeting.

55. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Speciality Hospital, Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Speciality Hospital, Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (05th & 06th January 2015) & assessment report (23rd & 24th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 75.47 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 84.15 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance is 465 on day of assessment against requirement of 600 as per Regulations.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 39 % on day of assessment.
- 5. There was NIL Major operation on day of assessment.
- 6. There was only 1 normal delivery & NIL Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 7. ICUs: There was no patient in ICCU &SICU & only 1 patient in PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
- 8. Anatomy department: Mortuary cabinets are not available.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch (150 seats) of Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Speciality Hospital, Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

56. Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

Read: the matter with regard to assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2nd batch (150 seats) of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessor report (06th & 07th January 2015) & assessment report (23rd & 24th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 59.81 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 93.82 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was only 23.66 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Teaching beds: No beds were available for departments of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry, Ophthalmology. In General Surgery, 30 beds were occupied by trainee Nursing students. Resultantly, there is deficiency of 56 teaching beds.
- 5. There were only 6 Major Surgical operations on day of assessment.
- 6. Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload is inadequate.
- 7. There was only 1 patient in PICU & 2 patients in NICU on day of assessment.
- 8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch (150 seats) of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(a) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

(a) Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

57. Approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meetings held on 05/05/2014, 13/06/2014 and 24/11/2014.

Read: the matter with regard to Approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meetings held on 05/05/2014, 13/06/2014 and 24/11/2014.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meetings held on 05/05/2014, 13/06/2014 and 24/11/2014 with the following observations:-

Meeting dt. 05/05/2014:

Sub-committee is requested to affix responsibility for not extending suspension within the period of 90 days and submit to Executive Committee.

Meeting dt. 13/06/2014:

Item 3. Approved; however as Dr. Devendra Kumar is on suspension, another officer may assigned this task by the sub-committee.

58. <u>Approval of the Minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 10/01/2014, 14/02/2014, 07/05/2014 and 30/09/2014.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the Minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 10/01/2014, 14/02/2014, 07/05/2014 and 30/09/2014.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 10/01/2014, 14/02/2014, 07/05/2014 and 30/09/2014 with the following observations:

Meeting dt. 14/02/2014:

Item 3: E storage: Tenders through public advertisements be invited rather than inviting more proposals so as to avoid any procedural lapse. Item 3 (iii) Renting out Auditorium: Instead of having a fixed amount, the rate should only be shown as "as decided by the sub-committee from time to time." This will take care of rise in costs due to inflation.

Meeting dt. 07/05/2014:

Item 2. E storage: Tenders through public advertisements be invited rather than inviting more proposals so as to avoid any procedural lapse.

Meeting dt. 30/09/2014:

Item 1. 4. The previous experience shows that even when six fully furnished flats were operational in the residential complex, no request was received from any officer except the then Secretary Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad and he was the only occupant of 1 flat out of 6 flats upto August 2010. Hence it would be prudent to ascertain willingness of staff to stay in quarters be obtained before proceeding further in the matter as there is no use constructing staff quarters and to keep them vacant.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the above minutes to the General Body of the Council.

59. <u>Extension of contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).</u>

Read: the matter with regard to extension of contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell) for a further period of six months.

60. Extension of services of Dr. Srikanta Barik, Consultant.

Read: the matter with regard to extension of services of Dr. Srikanta Barik, Consultant.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the services of Dr. Srikanta Barik, Consultant for a further period of six months.

61. <u>Proposal for Amendment of Establishment of Medical College</u> <u>Regulations, 1999 – Land Documents.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to proposal for amendment of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 – Land Documents.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proposal for amendment of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 – Land Documents with some modifications. The corrected format is reproduced as under:-

FORM - 5

Suggested Format of the Certificate of District Collector/District Magistrate/Deputy Commissioner of the District or the Competent Authority so designated by the State Government in which the Applicant seeks to establish the New Medical College This is to certify that land measuring (acre) situated at [village/Tehsil/District]..... is registered in the name of Government of Society/ _Trust/_ _Company by way of ownership/Government lease. The land is a single contiguous piece of land. The applicant . seeks to establish a new Medical College by the name of on the aforesaid piece of land of which details are as under:-Land Area in S No Registered Registration Survey No. Registered in the name of with the Sub-No./Date and {Khasra No.} Acres Registrar Document Office of No. There is no dispute pertaining to the said land and the land is free from all encumbrances. The building plan for the building constructed on the aforesaid is duly approved authority which is competent to approve the said by_ building plan in _ area. has obtained all relevant statutory clearances/permission for the usage of aforesaid piece of land for establishing a new Medical College from the concerned authorities. has obtained all relevant statutory clearances/permission for the construction of building on the aforesaid land in which the proposed Medical College and Teaching Hospital is located.

Conditions for Relaxation of Land

1. In case relaxation for land for Urban agglomerations/cities having population of 25 (twenty five) lakhs for establishing the Medical College in single contiguous piece of land of not less than 10 acres is being sought then the same may be stated by adding a line that "The land of the applicant is situated in ____ urban agglomeration/city which is having population of above 25 lakhs as per Census of India 2011 wherein a minimum of 10 acres of land is required for establishing a new Medical College." This relaxation is in accordance with Amendment notified in the

Signed and Seal of District Magistrate/District Collector/Deputy Commissioner/Competent

Authority Designated for such purpose by the State Government.

- Official Gazette No. 211 dated 01.10.12 of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999".
- 2. In case, relaxation for having campus in two pieces of land for hilly areas, notified tribal areas, North Eastern States, Union Territories of Andaman and Nicobar Islands, Daman and Diu, Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Lakshadweep is sought then details may be provided in two tables, and below the table line may be added that "The land of the applicant is situated in ______ { hilly areas, notified tribal areas, North Eastern States. UT of Andaman and Nicobar Islands, Daman and Diu, Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Lakshadweep- strike off whichever is not applicable} and the distance between two pieces of land is ____ kilometers with well connected road." This relaxation is in accordance with Amendment notified in the Official Gazette No. 211 dated 01.10.12 of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999".
- 3. In case, relaxation for having campus in two pieces of land in the states of Bihar, Chattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal the relaxation for twin campus is being sought by State Government/any other persons then details may be provided in two tables, and below the table line may be added that "The land of the applicant is situated in ______ {Bihar, Chattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal strike off whichever is not applicable} and the distance between two pieces of land is ____ kilometers with well connected road." This relaxation is in accordance with Amendment notified in the Official Gazette No. 141 dated 04.06.12 of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and is for a period of five years from the date of the said notification in these States.
- 4. In case, relaxation for having campus in two pieces of land for Medical Colleges is being sought in State/Union Territories other than Bihar, Chattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal by the State/UT Government for the purpose of utilization of District Hospitals by respective Government then details may be provided in two tables, and below the table line may be added that "The Government of State/UT of ______ is desirous of utilizing the District Hospital for the establishment of new Medical College and the distance between two pieces of land is ____ kilometers with well connected road." This relaxation is in accordance with Amendment notified in the Official Gazette No. 213 of 1.10.12 of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and is for a period of five years from the date of the said notification in these States."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

62. Recognition/approval of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Hospital,
Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2)
of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Hospital, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27.02.2015) along with the joint assessment report of CBI and MCI (29th 30th May, 2013) and assessment report (11th & 12th February, 2013) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Hospital, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats granted by Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

- 8 (3) ...
- (2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.
- (3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.
- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

(A.K. HARIT)
Deputy Secretary (Admn.)

New Delhi, dated the 2nd March, 2015

<u>APPROVE</u>D

(DR. JAYSHREE MEHTA)
President