

Medical Council of India
New Delhi

Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Governors dt. 10.12.2012

Reference Medical Council of India meeting notice dated 07.12.2012, the meeting of the Board of Governors was held on 10.12.2012 at 10.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector-8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110077 under the Chairmanship of Dr.(Prof.) K.K. Talwar, Chairperson, Board of Governors. The following members of the Board of Governors attended the meeting:-

1	Dr. (Prof.) K.S. Sharma	Member, Board of Governors
2.	Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam	Member, Board of Governors
3	Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta	Member, Board of Governors
4	Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas	Member, Board of Governors

Prof. Sanjay Shrivastava - Member Secretary, BOG meeting

Apology for absence were received from Dr. Rajiv Chintaman Yeravdekar & Dr. Purshottam Lal, Members, Board of Governors.

The agenda for the meeting was as under:-

1. **Confirmation of the minutes of the meetings of the Board of Governors held on 19th November, 2012, 27th November, 2012 & 4th December, 2012 under the Chairmanship of Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar, Chairperson, Board of Governors.**

The minutes of the meetings of the Board of Governors held on 19th November, 2012, 27th November, 2012 & 4th December, 2012 under the chairmanship of Dr.(Prof.) K.K. Talwar, Chairperson, Board of Governors were read and confirmed. The confirmed minutes of the meeting were signed by the members of Board of Governors present.

2. Pending work relating to permission for starting new medical colleges/increase in admission capacity of existing medical colleges/renewal of permission - Undergraduate, Postgraduate super-speciality & broad speciality - strategy to complete the work within stipulated time period.

The Board of Governors perused the details of the pending work presented by undergraduate and postgraduate sections and decided as under:-

- (A) The Board of Governors meeting will be held for two days every week, on Monday & Tuesday from next week onwards.
- (B) Postgraduate Assessment Screening Committee meeting may be called immediately for 2 to 3 days in continuation to expedite the pending reports received from Assessors in respect of postgraduate assessment for academic year 2013-14. The Sub-Committee members of postgraduate broad and super-speciality of the Board of Governors were requested to expedite the pending cases so that decision may be taken on pending cases.
- (C) The Sub-Committee of Board of Governors looking into the aspects of postgraduate qualifications of foreign countries namely Nepal & Mauritius was requested to expedite the matter early in view of the provision of Act and Regulations.
- (D) Compliance verification assessment may be done at Dr. S.N. Medical College, Jodhpur for MS(Ophthalmology) course, Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal for MD(Anaesthesia), MS(Orthopaedics) & MD(Community Medicine). The assessors

may evaluate the facilities available with reference to number of seats being run/proposed to be increased.

3. **Discussion on the draft amendment in the conduct of medical ethics received from Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of India.**

The Board of Governors had constituted a Committee to look into the existing medical ethics regulations under the Chairmanship of Dr. (Prof.) N.K. Ganguli, Distinguished Biotechnology Research Professor, National Institute of Immunology, New Delhi. The final draft received from the Committee may be put up to the Board of Governors for perusal. After perusal of the final draft of proposed amendment in existing medical ethics regulations, the proposed amendment in conduct of medical ethics received from Secretary, Ministry of Chemicals & Fertilizers, Department of Pharmaceuticals through Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of India will be looked into.

4. **Consideration for grant of provisional/permanent registration to the candidates of who have obtained their medical degree from University of Seychelles, American Institute of Medicine, Seychelles.**

The Board of Governors considered their earlier decision dated 9.01.2012 and the record available on the file and decided that provisional /permanent registration may be granted to 18/24 candidates who have passed their MBBS from University of Seychelles American Institute of Medicine. The candidates as per list of names in letter of Seychelles Qualifications Authority dated 23.03.2012 and University of Seychelles American Institute of Medicine letter dated 27.08.2012, subject to fulfillment of all requirements as prescribed for grant of provisional/permanent registration for foreign graduates, may be issued certificate.

The Board of Governors further decided to obtain list of all candidates who were admitted in University of Seychelles American Institute of Medicine before 16.04.2010 from university of Seychelles and Seychelles Qualifications Authority for future reference so that only those students who were admitted before 16.04.2010 are considered for grant of provisional/permanent registration in case of twining programme.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 27.10.2012.

Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam, Member, Board of Governors recused himself from agenda item No.16 & 18. The Board of Governors approved the minutes of the Ethics Committee dated 27.10.2012 with the following observations for compliance:

(a) Agenda Item No. 7 of the Ethics Committee minutes : the Board of Governors desired that the Ethics Section may check the status of case from CBI authorities, Addl. DG & MS Safdarjang Hospital, Delhi and Deputy Secretary Medical Education on receipt of the information the case may be put up to the Board of Governors for further consideration.

(b) Agenda Item No. 13 of the Ethics Committee minutes : the Ethics Section may obtain clarification from Dr. Anabelle Rajasekaran, Professor of Pharmacology at Melmaruvathur Adhiparashakti Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, TN whose name has figured in statement of Dr. Sarath Chandra Shah.

(c) Agenda Item No.16 : comments of Equivalence Committee constituted by the Board of Governors may be taken regarding the

qualification of Dr. Sunil Choudhary. On receipt of comments from the Equivalence Committee, the case may be put up to the Board of Governors.

6. **Admission of 1st year MBBS students for the Academic year 2012-13- Excess admission from the sanctioned intake – Regarding.**

The Board of Governors noted the action taken by the undergraduate Section so far against 10 medical colleges wherein the excess admissions over and above sanctioned intake capacity/in case of private college in management quota have been noticed. The Board of Governors decided that in case no information is received from the college within the time limit given to the college, the Council may go ahead with the issue of discharge notice in case where admission has been made over and above the sanctioned intake capacity and may write to respective State Govt. in case of excess admission in management quota in case private medical college to reduce the number of seats in management quota in next year.

7. **Including the word “Government” in the name of Swami Ramanand Teerth Rural Medical College, Ambajogai.**

The Board of Governors considered the agenda and approved the proposal to include the word “Government” in the name of Swami Ramanand Teerth Rural Medical College, Ambajogai.

8. **Complaint received from Sh. Prashant Bhushan, Advocate, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi - against Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh - in continuation to show cause letter dated 22.11.2012 issued pursuant to BOG decision dated 09.11.2012.**

The Board of Governors noted that the agenda item was already discussed and decision was taken on the file. Sh. Prashant Bhushan, Advocate, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi may be apprised of the action taken by the Council and his RTI application may be replied accordingly. The Board of Governors also desired that the case may be followed up by the Undergraduate Section and reply received from Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad may be put up to BOGs their consideration with reference to further course of action in the matter.

9. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Awadesh Pratap Singh University, Rewa in respect of students being trained at Shyam Shah Medical College, Rewa.**

The Board of Governors perused the agenda and decided that assessment report dated 15th & 16th October, 2012 may be placed before the Undergraduate Assessment Screening Committee and the Board of Governors decision dated 31.08.2012 may be complied with.

10. **Increase in MBBS Seat from 100 To 250 at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chrompet, Chennai.**

The Board of Governors considered the agenda note and documents available in file and decided that the applicant Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chrompet, Chennai does not fulfill the qualifying criteria as prescribed in "Opening of a New or Higher Course of Study or Training(including Post Graduate course of Study or Training) and increase of Admission Capacity in any course of Study or

Training(including a Post Graduate course of Study or Training) Regulations, 2000" (amendment)", in respect of the duration of teaching beds which is less than 10 years on the last date of submission of application i.e. 30th September, 2012. The applicant has also not enclosed Essentiality Certificate. In view of the foregoing the Board of Governors decided to reject the application as the applicant does not fulfill the eligibility criteria.

11. Status Position on Action Taken on the Show Cause Notice issued to Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad (U.P.)

The Board of Governors considered the agenda note and the date of events and decided as under:-

(a) The Board of Governors may be informed whether the reply has been sent to Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad U.P. in response to their letter dated 28.03.2012 or not.

(b) The Board of Governors may be apprised of the response of Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of India in case of show cause notice issued to Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar U.P.

12. Starting/increase of seats at Academy of Medical Sciences, Kannur, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 - reg.

The Board of Governors noted the contents of agenda note and perused the correspondence available in the file and decided that in view of the letter dated 09.10.2012 received from Secretary, Govt. of Kerala,

Corporation Department. Bank Guarantee submitted by the Academy of Medical Sciences, Kannur, Kerala is acceptable.

13. Presentation of cases not fulfilling the qualifying criteria for processing Postgraduate (Broad Speciality) applications - for decision by the Board of Governors.
14. UG recognition cases - wherein observations of UG Assessment Screening Committee and Sub-Committee of BOGs are available.
15. PG Degree/Diploma recognition cases, wherein observations of PG Assessment Screening Committee and Sub-Committee of BOGs are available for decision by BOGs.

Agenda Item Nos. 13 to 15 were deferred.

16. Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5th batch of Index Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Indore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the Academic year 2011-12 - matter for perusal of BOGs on file.

The Board of Governors perused the agenda note and documents available in file and decided that the status of cases registered by the CBI against this college may be checked from the concerned authority.

17. R.C. 24(A)/2010 of CBI ACB, Chennai - initiation of Regular Departmental Action for Major Penalty against 8 Doctors nominated by MCI for inspection and Such action as deemed fit against 70 Teaching Faculties as detailed in the Self Contained Note - file is submitted for perusal of BOGs.

The Board of Governors perused the agenda note and after detailed discussion decided :-

(1) Show cause notice may be issued to Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry by sending copy of the chargesheet/note received from the CBI, Chennai to furnish the comments as to why not action may be initiated against Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry for recommending de-recognition of MBBS degree and discontinuation of admission of this college.

(2) The Ethics Committee constituted by the Board of Governors be requested to expedite the case relating to violation of medical ethics by 70 teaching faculty members.

18. Case RC, MA1 2011 A 008 - against Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry and other - file is submitted for perusal of BOGs.

The Board of Governors perused the agenda and documents available in the file and decided to issue Show Cause Notice to the medical college by sending copy of CBI, Chennai letter dated 07/11/2012 and Ethics Committee may be requested to take appropriate action against the doctors for violation of medical ethics as pointed out by the CBI. The Board of Governors also noted that the documents as requested by the CBI, Chennai have already been sent to the CBI.

19. **Status note of action taken on self-contained notes/observations received from CBI/CVC/CVO in respect of 4 medical colleges – matter is submitted for perusal of BOGs.**

The Board of Governors noted the status of action taken on self-contained notes/observations received from CBI/CVC/CVO in respect of various medical colleges/institutions.

20. **Compliance submitted by LTM Medical College, Sion, Mumbai with reference to BOGs decision communicated vide Council letter dated 21.06.2012 – matter is placed before the BOGS for decision regarding further course of action.**

The Board of Governors considered the deficiencies which were noted earlier in respect of LTM Medical College, Sion, Mumbai and the compliance submitted by the college authorities. The Board of Governors decided that the compliance verification may be carried out.

21. **Regarding change of affiliation of National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur from Rajasthan University of Health Sciences to NIMS University, Rajasthan.**

The Board of Governors considered the agenda note and documents available on record and decided that the status of NIMS University, Rajasthan may be checked from the Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD Ministry) and University Grants Commission (UGC). On receipt of the information from Ministry of HRD and UGC, the matter may be put up for the Board of Governors for further consideration.

22. Any other matter with the permission of Chair.

1. The Board of Governors discussed the status of proposed amendment to Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 and MSR and decided that the Chairman of the Committee constituted to look into the aspect of the amendments under the Chairmanship of Dr.(Prof.) A.K. Agarwal, Addl.DG & Dean, MAMC may be requested to make presentation on proposed amendment during the next meeting of the Board of Governors which is to be held on 14th December, 2012 in the forenoon session.
2. The Board of Governors decided that the meeting of the Board of Governors will be held on every Monday & Tuesday from the next week.
3. The issue of maintenance of the Medical Council of India building and Guest House Building of the Council was discussed and it was decided to check from National Board of Examinations the agency which maintains their building.
4. The matter relating to verification of the Declaration Form received during Undergraduate & Postgraduate assessment process was discussed. The Board of Governors noted that earlier the Declaration Forms were analyzed by the Permanent Inspectors of the Council. At present Council does not have any officer working as Permanent Inspector. The Board of Governors also noted that there is shortage of staff especially technical, who could do verification of Declaration Forms. In view of this the Board of Governors decided that two Consultants may be appointed for duration of 6 months for verification

and checking of Declaration Form entries. Consultants should be retired Professor of Govt. Medical College not associated with any private medical college/hospital. The Board of Governors approved the appointment of two such Consultants with a consolidated salary of Rs.60,000/-. A Special Cell may be constituted for verification of entries in Declaration Forms, with Two Consultants. Three data entry operators may also appoint through M/s. NICSI/Ed.CIL(GOI PUC) for a duration of 6 months.

5. It was decided to hold the next meeting of the Board of Governors on 14.12.2012.

The file noting on one file was seen and observations recorded on the files by the Board of Governors.

Meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.



(Prof. Sanjay Shrivastava)
Secretary

(Dr.(Prof.) K.S. Sharma)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam)
Member

(Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar)
Chairperson